KAREN FANN SENATE PRESIDENT FIFTY-FIFTH LEGISLATURE 1700 WEST WASHINGTON, SENATE PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007-2844 PHONE: (602) 926-5874 TOLL FREE: 1-800-352-8404 kfann@azleg.gov DISTRICT 1



COMMITTEES: Rules, Chairman

Arizona State Senate

May 12, 2021

Maricopa Board of Supervisors c/o Chairman Jack Sellers 301 West Jefferson Street, #10 Phoenix, Arizona 85003

Dear Chairman Sellers:

I am writing to seek your assistance and cooperation in the resolution of three (3) serious issues that have arisen in the course of the Senate's ongoing audit of the returns of the November 3, 2020 general election in Maricopa County.

I. <u>Ongoing Non-Compliance with the Legislative Subpoenas</u>

The first issue concerns Maricopa County's apparent intent to renege on its previous commitment to comply fully with the legislative subpoenas issued on January 13, 2021, which, as you know, Judge Thomason found were valid and enforceable.

To date, attorneys for Maricopa County have refused to produce virtual images of routers used in connection with the general election, relying on a conclusory and unsupported assertion that providing the routers would somehow "endanger the lives of law enforcement officers, their operations, or the protected health information and personal data of Maricopa County's citizens." If true, the fact that Maricopa County stores on its routers substantial quantities of citizens' and employees' highly sensitive personal information is an alarming indictment of the County's lax data security practices, rather than of the legislative subpoenas. Similarly, the County's assertion that producing the internet routers for inspection would cost up to \$6,000,000 seems at odds with Deputy County Attorney Joseph La Rue's prior representation to Audit Liaison Ken Bennett that the routers already had been disconnected from the County's network and were prepared for imminent delivery to the Senate.

Nevertheless, in an effort to resolve the dispute regarding production of the routers, we propose that agents of CyFIR, an experienced digital forensics firm and subcontractor of Cyber Ninjas, review virtual images of the relevant routers in Maricopa County facilities and in the presence of representatives of the Maricopa County Sheriff's Office. Such an arrangement would permit Maricopa County to retain custody and monitor the review of router data, while ensuring that the Senate may access the information it requires—and to which it is constitutionally entitled—to successfully complete its audit. The Senate has no interest in viewing or taking possession of any information that is unrelated to the administration of the 2020 general election.

Separately, Maricopa County has refused to provide the passwords necessary to access vote tabulation devices. Its attorneys' insistence that the County does not have custody or control of this information is belied by the County's conduct of its own audits, which, if they were as comprehensive as they purported to be, almost certainly would have entailed use of the passwords to examine the tabulation devices, and it strains credulity to posit that the County has no contractual right to obtain (*i.e.*, control of) password information from Dominion.

II. <u>Chain of Custody and Ballot Organization Anomalies</u>

As the audit has progressed, the Senate's contractors have become aware of apparent omissions, inconsistencies, and anomalies relating to Maricopa County's handling, organization, and storage of ballots. We hope you can assist us in understanding these issues, including specifically the following:

- 1. The County has not provided any chain-of-custody documentation for the ballots. Does such documentation exist, and if so, will it be produced?
- 2. The bags in which the ballots were stored are not sealed, although the audit team has found at the bottom of many boxes cut seals of the type that would have sealed a ballot bag. Why were these seals placed at the bottom of the boxes?
- 3. Batches within a box are frequently separated by only a divider without any indication of the corresponding batch numbers. In some cases, the batch dividers are missing altogether. This lack of organization has significantly complicated and delayed the audit team's ballot processing efforts. What are the County's procedures for sorting, organizing, and packaging ballot batches?
- 4. Most of the ballot boxes were sealed merely with regular tape and not secured by any kind of tamper-evident seal. Is that the County's customary practice for storing ballots?
- 5. The audit team has encountered a significant number of instances in which there is a disparity between the actual number of ballots contained in a batch and the total denoted on the pink report slip accompanying the batch. In most of these instances, the total on the pink report slip is greater than the number of ballots in the batch, although there are a few instances in which the total is lower. What are the reasons for these discrepancies? For your reference, please see several illustrative (*i.e.*, not comprehensive) examples in the table below:

| Pallet | Ballot Type | Batch | Pink Slip Total | Actual Total | Discrepancy |
|--------|-------------|-------|-----------------|--------------|-------------|
| 5 | EV | 2104 | 200 | 198 | -2 |
| 5 | EV | 9276 | 200 | 165 | -35 |
| 15 | EV | 9278 | 200 | 187 | -13 |
| 15 | EV | 1643 | 200 | 218 | 18 |
| 7 | EV | 6359 | 197 | 187 | -10 |

For your convenience, images of the corresponding pink report slips are attached in **Exhibit A**.

III. <u>Deleted Databases</u>

We have recently discovered that the entire "Database" directory from the D drive of the machine "EMSPrimary" has been deleted. This removes election related details that appear to have been covered by the subpoena. In addition, the main database for the Election Management System (EMS) Software, "Results Tally and Reporting," is not located anywhere on the EMSPrimary machine, even though all of the EMS Clients reference that machine as the location of the database. This suggests that the main database for all election related data for the November 2020 General Election has been removed. Can you please advise as to why these folders were deleted, and whether there are any backups that may contain the deleted folders?

The image below shows the location of the files known to be deleted. In addition, the main database for "Results Tally and Reporting" is not present.

| eopen Drive Files | Recover Recov | er Marked Find | 🔊 🧞 🤣 🥘 💽 📰 | |
|-------------------|-----------------|----------------|--|---|
| | | | ence Images/AZAud-E-089-3_EMS PRIMARY/AZAud-E-089-3_EMS.001 | |
| Recognia | - | | Name R Size, Bytes Created Modified Accessed | |
| V Root | | | | |
| | RECYCLE.BIN | | | |
| | atabases | | 20200317 PPE-2019-12-18-12-08-39.mdf 0 4,294,967,296 3/25/2020 4/12/2021 3/25/2020 | |
| > 🗌 📙 N | IAS | | 20200804PrimaryTemplate-2020-05-14-09-41-16.r 4,294,967,296 5/14/2020 4/12/2021 5/14/2020 | |
| | ystem Volume li | nformation | AdjudicableBallotStore_2018_Maricopa_General_2 8,388,608 2/3/2020 1 4/12/2021 2/3/2020 1 | |
| | emp | | AdjudicableBallotStore_2018_Maricopa_General_200 8,388,608 2/3/2020 1 4/12/2021 2/3/2020 1 | |
| > 🗌 🗙 Extra | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20191105_Madison_Electiv 8,388,608 11/1/2019 4/12/2021 11/1/2019 | |
| > 🗌 🔤 Meta | afiles | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20191105_Madison_Electi+ 75,497,472 11/1/2019 4/12/2021 11/1/2019 | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20191105_Madison_Electiv 75,497,472 11/4/2019 4/12/2021 11/4/2019 | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20191105_Madison_Electi+ 75,497,472 11/4/2019 4/12/2021 11/4/2019 | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20200317_PPE_2020-03-10 75,497,472 3/10/2020 4/12/2021 3/10/2020 | |
| | | | MajudicableBallotStore_20200317_PPE_2020-03-1(@ 209,715,200 3/10/2020 4/12/2021 3/10/2020 | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20201103_General_2020-1 0 10/20/2020 4/12/2021 10/20/2020 | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20201103_General_2020-1 0 10/20/2020 4/12/2021 10/20/2020 | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20201103_General_2021-0. 8,388,608 2/3/2021 1: 4/12/2021 2/3/2021 1: | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallot5tore_20201103_General_2021-0.0 8.388.608_2/3/2021 1: 4/12/2021 2/3/2021 1: | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20201103_General_Post_L 8,388,608 11/17/2020 4/12/2021 11/17/2020 | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20201103_General_Post_L. 8,388,608 11/17/2020 4/12/2021 11/17/2020 | |
| | | | AdjudicableBallotStore_20201103_General_Post_L 8,388,608 12/10/2020 4/12/2021 12/10/2020 | |
| | | | MRC Template Bilingual-2019-12-09-14-57-12.ldf 0 1,073,741,824 12/9/2019 4/12/2021 12/9/2019 | |
| | | | | |
| | | | ∑ MRC Template Monolingual New-2020-06-12-14- 10/73/14/824 6/12/2020 4/12/2021 6/12/2020 | |
| | | | MRC Template Monolingual New-2020-06-12-14-0 4,294,967,296 6/12/2020 4/12/2021 6/12/2020 | |
| | | | MRC Template Monolingual 2019-12-09-14-57-4:0 1,073,741,824 12/9/2019 4/12/2021 10/12/2020 | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | RepublicanGenericIan2020-2020-01-02-14-19-52. ■ 1,073,741,824 1/2/2020 2: 4/12/2021 1/2/2020 2: | |
| | | | Image: StatulationStore_2018_Maricopa_General_2020-02 8,388,608 2/3/2020 1 4/12/2021 2/3/2020 1 | |
| | | | □ X TabulationStore_2018_Maricopa_General_2020-02 8,388,608 2/3/2020 1 4/12/2021 2/3/2020 1 | |
| orted by: Real | Extensions | Creation Time | Modification Time Access Time | BE Details IIII Small Icons BB Medum Icons Large Ic |
| a | | | | |
| Type | Date | Time | Text | |
| | /9/2021 | 11:37:28 AM | E/AZAudit/Evidence Images/AZAud-E-089-3_EMS PRIMARY/AZAud-E-089-3_EMS.001: Partition at 2048 extends beyond disk bounds | |
| | /9/2021 | 11:38:07 AM | E/AZAudit/Evidence Images/AZAud-E-450-1_EMS PRIMARY/AZAud-E-450-1_EMS.001: Partition at 2048 extends beyond disk bounds | |
| | /9/2021 | 11:38:22 AM | E:/AZAudit/Evidence Images/AZAud-E-450-1_EMS PRIMARY/AZAud-E-450-1_EMS.001: Partition at 2048 extends beyond disk bounds | |
| | /9/2021 | 12:06:57 PM | Search for lost partitions on drive E:/AZAudit/Evidence Images/AZAud-E-089-3_EMS PRIMARY/AZAud-E-089-3_EMS.001 has been completed in 23m 33s | |
| | /10/2021 | 12:52:41 PM | [Fileld: 131074] Closing attribute: parsed allocated size (33554432) differ from stored one (67108864) | |
| | /10/2021 | 12:53:24 PM | File enumeration was completed in 44 sec | |
| | /10/2021 | 12:53:30 PM | [Fileld: 3542548495] Closing attribute: parsed allocated size (4194304) differ from stored one (8388608) | |
| | /10/2021 | 12:53:41 PM | [Fileld: 3542548495] Closing attribute: parsed allocated size (4194304) differ from stored one (8388608) | |

* * *

I am hopeful that we can constructively resolve these issues and questions without recourse to additional subpoenas or other compulsory process. To that end, I invite you and any other officers or employees of Maricopa County (to include officials in the Elections Department) who possess knowledge or information concerning the matters set forth above to a meeting at the Arizona State Capitol on **Tuesday, May 18, 2021 at 1:00 p.m.** in Hearing Room 109. Chairman Petersen, former Secretary Bennett and I will attend the meeting, which will be live-streamed to the public.

Please let me know at your earliest convenience whether you accept my invitation and, if so, which Maricopa County personnel will attend.

Thank you for your cooperation on these important issues of public concern.

Respectfully,

Lenator Karen Farm

Karen Fann, President Arizona State Senate

Exhibit A

| EARLY VOTI | Y <u>38 //</u> Election Type: NG □ PRIMARY | <u>р-</u> 6 | r's Date ルール lection Di ー 3 ー の |) /n. ate | ardwor Fall Ele | | 1 | CDAM M CDAM M Tray # ZIO4 | | # NIB |
|----------------|--|-------------|--|--------------|-----------------------|------------|-----------------|------------------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| REPO | | | Write N | lame for Si | oecial or Ju | risdiction | -1 | | | <u>ک</u> |
| | SEQ: | 1 | -50 | 51-10 | 00 | 101 | 50 | 151-20 | | oineo |
| COUN | Column: | | Α | E | 3 | (| 2 | D | | -D) |
| 1 | Total # of AFFIDAVITS | 3 | 50 | 50 | | 5 | Ø | 50 | 20 | 0 |
| 2 | Total REJECTED | | D | Q | | Õ | | 0 | C | > |
| ω Ballots | Total to DUPLICATION | 6 | 0 | 0 |) | 0 | 1 - M 11 - M | 0 | 0 | |
| 4 | Total to TABULATION | 5 | 0 | یک | 2 | 5 | 2 | 50 | 2 | \approx |
| Why woul | ld I duplicate a ballot? | • | DU | PLICA | | | DUPLI | Total # of bo CATED on lin | e 3 above) | 1.1. |
| E. Dama | ged Ballot: | | Column | PREC | PER AI | FIDAV | COLOR | | Reason | n Belov F |
| not v stain | or cut, sticky, timing man isible, spill that results in overlapping timing mark | а | | | | | | | | |
| tape, | | | | | | | | | | <u>.</u> |
| Alter | r ous Ballot: nate Format (e.g., Braille | , Lg. | | | | | <u></u> | | | |
| Color |), Precinct and/or Ballot r <u>DOES NOT</u> match affida | | | | | | | | | |
| does | mation. If party on affida not match party on ball | | | | | | | | | |
| <u>ask f</u> | or assistant. | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | ni ninina ni nini | | |
| Why wo | uld I reject something? | | | | | | (Enter | Total # of ba | llots from | "H" to |
| | t <i>iple Ballots:</i> : for assistance if affidavi | t | | 1000 | ECTEC | 711113 | | REJECTED on | line 2 abo | |
| | tains multiple ballots. | | C | olumn | | ID | NUMB | ER | | H |
| | fficient: idavit contained no ballo lot is not from current el | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | and the second second | State State | Section in | | | Sector Sector Sector | فيستعمد ومشرالين | |

.

| | Board # | Today's | Date | Boardw | 1. 24 . 24 | Boardworker # | 2 |
|---|---|----------|-----------|-----------------------|-------------|---|-----------------------------|
| EARLY VOTING REPOR | | 11-0 | tion Date | Sec. 1 | ection # | Tray# | BIN # |
| CONTRACTOR | SEQ: Column: | 1-5 A | 00 | 1400 B | /01-12 C | 20 15/200 D | Combined Totals (A-D) |
| 1 | Total # of AFFIDAVITS | 5 | DE | 50 | 5C | 50 | 200 |
| 2 | Total REJECTED | e | } | $\overline{\partial}$ | 0 | -0- | Q |
| Ballots | Total to DUPLICATION | C | | Ð | 0 | . 0 | 9 |
| 4 | Total to TABULATION | 57 |) 2 | 50 | SC | 50 | |
| Vhy would I d | luplicate a ballot? | | DUPLI | CATION | | nter Total # of ball IPLICATED on line | |
| not visibl | ut, sticky, timing mar e, spill that results in rlapping timing mark | ks | lumn Pl | PER A RECINCT/D | FFIDAVITEN | | Reason Below E F |
| Print), Pro Color <u>DO</u> Informati | Format (e.g., Braille, ecinct and/or Ballot ES NOT match affida on. If party on affida match party on ballo | vit | | | | | |
| a state the state | reject something? | Ē | | | (Ent | er Total # of ballot | s from "H" to |
| | <u>issistance</u> if affidavit multiple ballots. | | Colum | JECTED | | e REJECTED on lin | |
| Affidavit | contained no ballot not from current elec | | | | | 10 | |

| (2)月2 | RLY TING PORT PORT PRIMARY A GENERAL SPECIAL JURISOLCTIC | <u> /e</u> = [[] | y's Date 202 ilection 30 | o BR. Date | Norker #1 | Boardworker # THCithsm Trav # | 2'24 03 03 |
|---|--|-------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| | SEQ. Column | | <u>-ජා</u> A | S1-100 B | 10/150 C | o /s/Jac D | Combined Totals (A-D) |
| 1 | Total # of AFFIDAVITS | 5 | 0 | SO | 50 | 50 | 200 |
| 2 | Total REJECTED | 6 | Ş - | 6 | B | 0 | Ø |
| 3 | Total to DUPLICATION | 5 | 9 | ð | Ø | Ø | 0 |
| 4 | Total to TABULATION | 5 | 0 | 517 | 50 | 811 | |
| E. Dam Tori not stai tapo F. Erron Alte | uld I duplicate a ballot? naged Ballot: n or cut, sticky, timing mar visible, spill that results in n overlapping timing mark e, etc. eeous Ballot: rinate Format (e.g., Braille, t), Precinct and/or Ballot | ks – a – s, – | Column | PLICATION PER A PRECINCT/D | DUPL | | abbve |
| info doe: <u>ask l</u> | pr <u>DOES NOT</u> match affidav rmation. If party on affidav s not match party on ballor for assistant. | rit – | | | | | |
| G. Mult | uld'I reject something? tiple Ballots: . for assistance if affidavit | | | REJECTED | (Enter 1 be R | Fotal # of ballots EJECTED on line | from "H" to 2 above) |
| con H. Insuf Affi | tains multiple ballots. | ir tion. | Colu | | | | Reason Below G H |
| | Place on Ballots in Tray | | | clip to Tray Re | | Rubber band wi | |

| EARL | Y 47 10- | day's Date 19-20 Election I | S.Step | rker#1 B hen f | oardworker# <u>R-TSW/</u> Trav# | 16 | | |
|--|--|-----------------------------------|--------------------|-------------------|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------|--|--|
| VOTI REPC | / | 11-3- | 20 3 | 27 | 1643 | BIN # | | |
| S SHE WE | SEQ: Column: | 1-50 A | 51-100 B | 101-150 C | 157-20 D | Combined Totals (A-D) | | |
| 1 | Total # of AFFIDAVITS | 50 | 50 | 50 | 50 | 200 | | |
| 2 | Total REJECTED | Ð | Ð | Ð | Ð | <i>∂</i> - | | |
| Ballots | Total to DUPLICATION | θ | Ð | ð | Ð | Ð | | |
| 4 | Total to TABULATION | 50 | 50 | 50 | 50 | 200 | | |
| Torn not v stain tape, F. Errone Alter Print Color infor does | nged Ballot: or cut, sticky, timing marks isible, spiil that results in a overlapping timing marks, etc. nous Ballot: nate Format (e.g., Braille, Lg), Precinct and/or Ballot <u>DOES NOT</u> match affidavit mation. If party on affidavit not match party on ballot, or assistant. | | PRECINCT/DI | FIDAVIT ENVE | | Reason Below F | | |
| G. Mult <u>Ask</u> | Ild I reject something? iple Ballots: for assistance if affidavit tains multiple ballots. | | REJECTED | | Fotal # of ballo REJECTED on lin | | | |
| | ficient: davit contained no ballot or ot is not from current electic | in. | | | | | | |
| | Place on Ballots in Tray | | perclip to Tray Re | | - Rubber band | | | |

| VOTING REPORT | Wate | Name for Special or . | wisdiction | | BIN# |
|---|---------------|--|------------------|---|-----------------------------|
| SEQ: Column: | 1- 🎡 | 51-10U B | 101-197) C | <u>151-200</u> D | Combined Totals (A-D) |
| 1 Total # of AFFIDAVITS | 50 | 50 | 50 | 50 | 200 |
| 2 Total REJECTED | -6- | ÷ | - 0- | Ð | to - |
| 3 S Total to DUPLICATION | Ð | ter en | - 0 - | 12 | (v) |
| 4 Total to TABULATION | 50 | 49 | 50 | 48 | sing fr |
| tape, etc. F. Erroneous Ballot: Alternate Format (e.g., Braille, Lg Print), Precinct and/or Ballot Color DOES NOT match affidavit information. (F party on affidavit does not match party on ballot, ask for assistant. Why would I reject something? | | | Puk | | |
| G. Multiple Ballots: Ask for assistance if affidavit contains multiple ballots. H. Insufficient: Affidavit contained no ballot or ballot is not from current electic | | REJECTED | | otal # of ballots EJECTED on line 3 | |
| White – Place on Ballots in Tray | Yellow - Pape | rrclip to Tray Re | port Pink – | Rubber band w | ith Affidavits |