Jo Hamilton, Chair Bo Riccobono, First Vice Chair Sheelah Feinberg, Second Vice Chair Bob Gormley, District Manager



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

FULL BOARD MINUTES

DATE: October 21, 2010

TIME: 6:00 P.M.

PLACE: P.S. 130, 143 Baxter Street, Auditorium

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: Steve Ashkinazy, Keen Berger, Tobi Bergman, Carter Booth, Anita Brandt, Sigrid Burton, Heather Ann Campbell, Denise Collins, Terri Cude, Maria Passanante Derr, Doris Diether, Ian Dutton, Elizabeth Gilmore, Alison Greenberg, Sasha Greene, David Gruber, Jo Hamilton, Chair, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB#2, Man.), Brad Hoylman, Mary Johnson, Arthur Kriemelman, Evan Lederman, Jason Mansfield, Jane McCarthy, Alexander Meadows, Florent Morellet, Judy Paul, David Reck, Robert Riccobono, Erin Roeder, Robin Rothstein, Rocio Sanz, Wendy Schlazer, Shirley Secunda Chenault Spence, Richard Stewart, Carol Yankay, Antony Wong,

BOARD MEMBERS EXCUSED: Lisa Cannistracci, Sheelah Feinberg, Anne Hearn, Susan Kent, Raymond Lee, Lois Rakoff, Maury Schott, Arthur Z. Schwartz, James Solomon, Sean Sweeney, Elaine Young

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT: Edward Ma

BOARD STAFF PRESENT: Bob Gormley, District Manager, and Florence Arenas, Community Coordinator

GUESTS: Katie Smith, Congressman Jerrold Nadler's office; Crystal Gold-Pond, Senator Tom Duane's office; Mary Cooley, Sen. Daniel Squadron's office; Lisa Parson, Assembly Member Deborah Glick's office; Sandy Myers, Lin Zeng, Man. Borough President Scott Stringer's office; John Ricker, NYC Comptroller's office; Edgar Yu, Manhattan District Attorney Cyrus Vance's office; Noah Isaacs, Council Speaker Christine Quinn's office; Matt Viggiano, Jasmin Torres, Council Member Rosie Mendez's office; Gabriela Resto, Danya Sherma, Kate Lindquist, Fay E. Roblson, Judith Callet, Luis Ramirez, Douglas Esposin, Catherine Perebinsoff, Ed Sullivan, Ben Jerris, Dave Poster, Jane Chuang, Davide Gentile, David Wallace, Barbara Ruether, Cahterine Schaefer, Jane Kovczynsla, Lou Stremger. Eric Li, Robert Meller, Alex Baskin, Leonid Baskin, Erin Keller, Ben Wolfert, Ivanna Ganushclak, Pamela L. LaBonne, Ellen I. Synan, Natalie McDonald, Silvia Sanza, Steve Charen, Alex Smorczewski, John Flood, Leslie Lord, Yetta Kurland, Frank Vriale, Philip Smithback, Elizabeth Adam, Elaine Hudson, Angela Jones, Chris Gaylord, Timothy Luncford, Evette Stark Katz, Thomas Cahill, Alan Bounville, Susan Kone, Rene Schooenbeck, Jayne Hertko

MEETING SUMMARY

Meeting Date –October 21, 2010 Board Members Present – 38 Board Members Excused–11 Board Members Absent - 9 **Therefore be it resolved,** CB#2, Man. thereby endorses the Task Force findings and recommendations; and

Be it further resolved, CB#2, Man. requests that NYU provide us with a point-by-point response to the Task Force recommendations and questions.

Vote: Unanimous, with 38 Board members in favor.

STANDING COMMITTEE REPORTS

LANDMARKS AND PUBLIC AESTHETICS

1. Dept. of Sanitation Spring Street Salt Shed - presentation of design

This was the most controversial item on our calendar, with Community Board #1 and over a dozen speakers opposing the item.

Whereas, the DSNY presented a proposed design for a planned salt shed to be located at 297 West Street between Canal Street and Spring Street; and

Whereas, the proposed salt shed is a 64' tall structure with a driveway between the building and Holland Tunnel Ventilation Building and with the entry to the structure at the Canal Street end of the driveway; and,

Whereas,, the proposed design seeks to express "different aspects of crystalline forms – the faceted nature of all crystals and the extended forms found in many crystals," by way of a reinforced concrete building with multiple angled planes; and,

Whereas, some speakers said this very contemporary design is out of keeping with the area with its immediate proximity to such landmark structures as the Holland Tunnel Ventilation Building and the historic Ear Inn building; and

Whereas, the final design calls for 10,000 gallons of Calcium Chloride to be stored in outdoor tanks that were reported in the FEIS as being located underground; and

Whereas, the intensity of opposition to the scale of the proposed larger project makes it difficult for the community to focus on the design concept and details of the building; and

Whereas, the proposed building is on the site of an existing DSNY garage serving District 1 and is part of a larger project that includes a garage on the other side of Spring Street serving Districts 1, 2, and 5; and

Whereas, the larger project was approved by DSNY and the City Council over strong community opposition based on its unfair overburdening of an area that already suffers from negative impacts of high car, bus, and truck traffic on Route 9A (West Street) and entering the Holland Tunnel; and

Whereas, the project remains a cause of concern, dismay, and resentment in the neighborhood with more than a dozen people appearing at a hearing on October 12, 2010, to express opposition to the salt shed; and

Whereas, concerns have been raised about safe removal of asbestos during demolition and needed precautions related to construction in the flood plain; and

Whereas, concerns were expressed about containment of salt dust both at the driveway and the load-in door near residential buildings on Spring Street as well as about proposed above ground storage of calcium chloride; and

Whereas, many people think that changes in the design, such as covering the apron, moving the tanks underground (as reported in the FEIS), moving the salt load-in door to Canal Street, and long-term graffiti planning are essential to the success of this structure; and

Whereas, the west end of Spring Street is a neighborhood of increasing commercial and residential vitality; and

Whereas, the SoHo and Hudson Square neighborhoods have poor access to Hudson River Park because there are no West Street crossings or park entrances between the south side of Canal Street in Tribeca and the north side of West Houston Street in the West Village; and

Whereas, improving connections to the waterfront is an important citywide priority; and

Whereas, the lack of a West Street crossing at Spring Street also discourages pedestrians from using the two Spring Street blocks east of West Street; and

Whereas, The Hudson Square Business Improvement District has identified a Spring Street connection to the Hudson River Park as an important objective; and

Whereas, the DSNY project at Spring Street will further detriment the connection of these neighborhoods to the waterfront and will create a pedestrian dead zone unless the project includes street amenities to encourage pedestrian use, and

Whereas, by seeking to create an iconic building for an unglamorous use, DSNY and the Design Commission acknowledge the importance of the site, but while we appreciate the efforts made to design a building of interest and note, architecture alone cannot overcome the isolation and lack of vitality of the location that will only be made worse by the outsized DSNY facilities on both sides of the street.

Therefore be it resolved that CB#2, Man. while still opposing the project as a whole, urges DSNY and the Design Commission to work with the City and State Departments of Transportation and the Hudson River Park Trust to include in this project pedestrian amenities to recreate the urban vitality of this area; and

Be it further resolved we ask that the DSNY and the City to acknowledge the significant sacrifice this neighborhood will make because of this salt shed and a three district garage, and to mitigate the conditions by adding a new crosswalk on West Street at Spring Street and work with the community to improve the streetscape on Spring between Sixth Avenue and West Streets, and

Be it further resolved that DSNY should ask their design consultants to address concerns about the containment of salt dust, and also the above-ground siting of unsightly Calcium Chloride storage tank; and

Be it further resolved that there should be further steps taken to protect the immediate neighbors from the negative impact of salt dust, such as relocating the load-in door to Canal Street, reducing the size of the door, and covering the driveway and gates; and

Be it further resolved that the concrete finishes/surfaces should be such that it won't be damaged by repeated graffiti removal; and

Be it further resolved that CB#2, Man. urges that DSNY review and amend the Department of Building applications with regard to concerns about asbestos removal and construction in the flood plain; and

Be it finally resolved that unless these concerns are addressed, the current design effort is not useful and CB#2, Man. cannot support the proposed design.

Vote: Unanimous, with 38 Board members in favor.

2. 153 Prince Street – SoHo Cast Iron Historic District Extension. A Greek Revival style dwelling with alterations, originally build c. 1844-45. Application is to alter the façade and areaway and install storefront infill and signage.

Whereas this building is located in the newest Historic District Extension; and

Whereas the building is currently painted with zebra stripes on the lower two floors, on a block with a number of oddly painted and altered buildings; and

Whereas the proposal is to widen and enlarge the door and windows on the basement level and enlarge the first floor windows, and remove the current lighting and roll down gates on the basement level; and

Whereas it is also proposed to raise the level of the front yard 14" and change the current steps to 3 steps in the yard and 2 steps inside the store; and

Whereas the proposal also includes changing the color of the first two floors from the zebra stripes to purple with a new sign with letters on pins attached to the façade of the building between the first floor and basement; and

Whereas the current fence would be reduced in size to match the new stair size, and all the fencing would be painted black; and

Whereas, although some of the changes proposed improved the look of the building, too much of the original fabric of the building would be removed.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED CB#2, Man. recommends that this application for 153 Prince Street be denied.

Vote: Unanimous, with 38 Board members in favor.

3. 337-339 West Broadway aka 54-58 Grand St. – SoHo Cast Iron Historic District. A store building designed by Peter V. Outcault and built in 1885-1886. Application to create a new masonry opening.

WHEREAS this is a two story retail building on a corner which formerly had a second means of egress through the adjoining building, but that egress has now been blocked; and

WHEREAS a second means of egress is required, so the proposal is to remove plywood over a single side street door and enlarge the area to include two doors for the required fire exits; and