### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA Charlottesville Division

NICOLE P. ERAMO	)
Plaintiff	) Case No. 3:15-mc-00011-GEC
<b>v.</b>	)
	) Underlying litigation:
ROLLING STONE LLC,	) Eramo v. Rolling Stone, LLC, et al.,
SABRINA RUBIN ERDERLY, and	) Case No. 3:15-cv-00023-GEC, in the
WENNER MEDIA LLC,	) United States District Court for the
	) Western District of Virginia
Defendants.	)

# NICOLE ERAMO'S RESPONSE TO NON-PARTY RESPONDENT'S SUPPLEMENTAL RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO COMPEL <u>PRODUCTION</u>

Pursuant to the Court's direction that the parties to this action may submit additional briefing regarding Movant Nicole Eramo's November 13, 2015 Motion to Compel Nonparty Respondent "Jackie" to Comply with Rule 45 Subpoena [Dkt. 1] ("Motion"), Movant Nicole Eramo hereby files the following response to Nonparty Respondent "Jackie's" December 31, 2015 Supplemental Response in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Compel Production [Dkt. 27] ("Jackie Supp. Resp.").

#### INTRODUCTION

Despite all of Movant Nicole Eramo's efforts to be reasonable and accommodating to "Jackie" — including repeatedly attempting to meet and confer regarding the scope of the subpoena, agreeing to identify Jackie by a pseudonym in briefing before the Court (though her identity is already public), and agreeing to withdraw from her Motion most categories of documents sought in the subpoena to Jackie — Jackie and her counsel have refused to budge an

inch from their astonishing position: That Jackie, a grown woman who voluntarily made herself the primary subject of, and chief source for, an inflammatory national magazine article that ruined the lives of many innocent people and has been roundly proven to be demonstrably false, is somehow completely immune from *any discovery* in litigation arising out of that article. This is, simply put, an untenable position that finds no support whatsoever in law or logic.

Jackie's latest Supplemental Response makes clear that the real issue here is not a concern with protecting Jackie from having to produce any documents related to an alleged sexual assault. Jackie freely discussed her supposed sexual assault in great detail with *Rolling Stone* magazine, with a UVA alumni magazine and, later, the *Washington Post*, knowing full well that her accounts would be published. She told a dramatically different version of her sexual assault — complete with a named perpetrator who does not in fact exist — to friends and acquaintances at the University of Virginia. And she related still another version to the University and the Charlottesville Police Department — at least until the police attempted to investigate her claims, at which time she withdrew any cooperation. In light of these undisputed facts, it is clear that Jackie's reluctance to participate in discovery is not based on concerns of privacy or about being exposed as an alleged victim of sexual assault. Instead, it is about being exposed as a liar, and there is no blanket immunity from discovery simply because Jackie fears that her own momentous and injurious falsehoods will be revealed.

Dean Eramo's narrowed Motion to Compel is directed solely at highly relevant documents going to the heart of the disputed issues in the defamation case. Namely, were *Rolling Stone's* and Erdely's claims about Jackie's assault, and Dean Eramo's supposed indifference and inaction in response to Jackie's assault, true or false? Did Jackie herself tell others that the article was accurate or false? Do the documents reflecting Jackie's

communications with Dean Eramo and *Rolling Stone* prove or disprove *Rolling Stone's* claims? Did *Rolling Stone* simply invent the claims that Dean Eramo abused Jackie, discouraged her from reporting her supposed sexual assault, called UVA "the rape school," and sought to suppress Jackie's sexual assault to protect the University's reputation — or did Jackie actually tell *Rolling Stone* those things? If Jackie did tell *Rolling Stone* those things, was it negligent and/or reckless for *Rolling Stone* to rely on Jackie as its primary source for these defamatory claims about Dean Eramo considering Jackie's obvious lack of credibility? Did *Rolling Stone* ignore blatant red flags and gaping holes in Jackie's story indicating that she was not telling the truth? And did *Rolling Stone* purposefully avoid uncovering discrepancies in Jackie's account about her supposed gang rape and her subsequent interactions with Dean Eramo?

Nothing in Jackie's Supplemental Filing — which consists primarily of straw man arguments and ad hominem attacks on Dean Eramo and her counsel — meaningfully addresses the fact that Jackie is a central witness in this case, that she put herself in that position of her own volition, and that her documents and testimony are of great importance to the parties' claims and defenses. Although mindful of the sheer amount of briefing already before the Court, Movant submits this response to Jackie's Supplemental Response to address certain inaccurate and misleading claims made in Jackie's Supplemental Filing regarding (1) the defamatory statements *Rolling Stone* made about Dean Eramo; (2) the relevance of the documents sought from Jackie; and (3) the lack of any substantiation whatsoever that Jackie was the victim of a sexual assault on September 28, 2012.

### ARGUMENT

### I. Rolling Stone and Erdely's Incredibly Harmful Claims About Jackie and Dean Eramo.

Jackie devotes much of her Supplemental Response to the irrelevant and misleading exercise of attempting to downplay the accusations about Dean Eramo that Defendants *Rolling Stone* and Sabrina Rubin Erdely made in the article "A Rape on Campus" and in subsequent media appearances. (*See* Jackie Supp. Resp. at 3-5, 11-14.) Jackie also continues to argue that the documents Dean Eramo seeks from Jackie are not relevant to the claims and factual allegations in the defamation Complaint. Although Dean Eramo discussed the article and its defamatory claims in her original Memorandum, it bears repeating just how hurtful and damaging Jackie's fabrications and *Rolling Stone's* defamatory claims were to Dean Eramo and countless others in the University of Virginia community.

The Article "A Rape on Campus," published in November 2014, claims that Jackie was the victim of a violent, three-hour gang-rape at the Phi Kappa Psi fraternity at the University of Virginia on September 28, 2012. (May 12, 2015 Complaint [Dkt. 2-2] ¶¶ 3-5, 45-71.) The gang rape was supposedly spearheaded by an upperclassman that Jackie met while working as a lifeguard at the University pool. (*Id.* ¶ 47.) The article claims that Jackie reported the details of this gang rape and its location to Dean Eramo, and that Dean Eramo did nothing to act on this information. (*Id.* ¶¶ 54-71.) The article claims at various points that Dean Eramo abused Jackie, that Dean Eramo discouraged Jackie from sharing her story, that Dean Eramo told Jackie that UVA suppresses rape statistics because nobody would want to send their daughter to "the rape school," that Dean Eramo took no action in response to Jackie's claim of sexual assault, and that Dean Eramo intentionally coddled Jackie into not reporting her sexual assault. (*Id.* ¶¶ 54-71, 208-212.) Some of these statements in the article, such as the claim that Dean Eramo called

UVA "the rape school" and "discouraged" Jackie from reporting her assault, purport to be direct quotes or paraphrasing of statements Jackie made to *Rolling Stone*.<sup>1</sup>

In related media appearances designed to capitalize on the publicity surrounding the article, Defendant Erdely also claimed that Dean Eramo "brushed off" Jackie, that Dean Eramo "did nothing" in response to Jackie's supposed sexual assault, that Dean Eramo sought to "suppress" Jackie's story, that Dean Eramo did not report Jackie's claimed assault to the police, and that Dean Eramo "discouraged" Jackie from reporting her sexual assault. (*Id.* ¶¶ 238-267.) Finally, in a written press release, *Rolling Stone* claimed that Dean Eramo met Jackie's allegations with "indifference" and "chose not to act on [Jackie's] allegations in any way." (*Id.* ¶¶ 268-270.)<sup>2</sup>

The article created a media firestorm, and *Rolling Stone's* decision to cast Dean Eramo as a villain who intentionally suppressed Jackie's rape allegations to protect UVA's reputation caused Dean Eramo to become the target of public scorn, ridicule, and downright threatening attacks on her character. Dean Eramo received emails from outraged members of the public that read the article calling her, among other invectives, a "rape apologist," a "vile worthless creature," a "disgusting, worthless piece of trash," a "piece of shit," a "disgusting individual," an "unspeakably horrible" person who is "complicit" in "the culture of rape at UVA," and a "fat hypocrite" who should "burn in hell." (*Id.* ¶ 203.)

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For example, the article defames Dean Eramo by featuring a fabricated quote ("Because nobody wants to send their daughter to the rape school") falsely attributed to her by Jackie, the sole source for the quote. To hammer the point home, *Rolling Stone* states that Dean Eramo delivered this quote to Jackie "wryly."

Jackie's Supplemental Response argues that only the Complaint counts based on statements in the article itself are germane to the question of the relevance of Jackie's documents. But Jackie completely ignores that Dean Eramo's Complaint also bring claims based on statements *Rolling Stone* and Erdely made after the article was published in media appearances. Jackie's communications with *Rolling Stone* and Erdely will also demonstrate why these post-publication media statements were not only false, but also that *Rolling Stone* and Erdely acted with actual malice in making them. *Compare* Jackie Supplemental Response at 3-4, with Plaintiff's Complaint at 64-74 (Counts Three-Six).

Once responsible journalists and law enforcement pressure tested *Rolling Stone's* story and Jackie's claims, the entire article was proven to be a lie. It emerged that, prior to the supposed assault, Jackie had told three friends that she had an upcoming date on the evening of September 28, 2012 with a student named "Haven Monahan," who Jackie claimed was a handsome junior in her chemistry class — not a fellow lifeguard as *Rolling Stone* claimed. (*Id.* ¶ 93.) She even encouraged her friends to exchange text messages with a phone number that she claimed belonged to Haven Monahan. (*Id.*) When they did, "Haven" would repeatedly gush about how "smart" and "hot" Jackie was. (*Id.*) On the night of September 28, 2012, Jackie told her friends that after her date with Haven, he forced her to perform oral sex on a group of men — a horrible allegation to be sure, but one that is markedly different from the detailed, violent, and sustained gang rape portrayed in the *Rolling Stone* article. (*Id.* ¶ 89.)

After the article was published, the Charlottesville Police Department released a report debunking *Rolling Stone* and Jackie's claims. (Mar. 23, 2015 Charlottesville Police Department's Investigation into an Alleged Sexual Assault as Depicted in Rolling Stone Magazine Article dated November 19, 2014 [Dkt. 11-1] ("CPD Report").) The report noted that Jackie's claims about the date and location of the assault were provably false. (*Id.*) It found that Jackie had apparently fabricated a later incident in which she claimed she was physically assaulted and injured by fraternity members for speaking out about her sexual assault. (*Id.* at 1-2.) It determined that those who saw Jackie immediately following the purported assault did not observe any of the horrific injuries graphically detailed by *Rolling Stone*. (*Id.* at 4.) It further noted that there never was any UVA student by the name of "Haven Monahan," and that Jackie's description of the attack's supposed ringleader, including his name, appearance, fraternity and place of employment, did not match any real individual that the police could locate. (*Id.* at 5.) It

found that the picture Jackie showed friends of "Haven Monahan" at the time actually depicted an individual who did not even know Jackie. (*Id.*) Convincing evidence would later emerge suggesting that Jackie originally fabricated both "Haven Monahan" and the claimed assault in a bid to win the affections and sympathy of another man she was romantically interested in, but who did not share her feelings.<sup>3</sup>

Rolling Stone's claims about Dean Eramo's actions were revealed to be completely false as well. Both the Charlottesville Police and the Columbia Graduate School of Journalism review found that, upon being called to task at UVA for poor grades, Jackie revived the sexual assault tale and relayed a truncated version to Dean Eramo — though Jackie refused to provide any information about where it occurred or who was responsible. (CPD Report at 1.) Far from doing nothing or seeking to suppress Jackie's allegations, Dean Eramo in fact immediately tried to assist Jackie in holding her supposed attackers accountable, repeatedly contacted Jackie thereafter, and actively sought to encourage Jackie to make a formal report of her assault to the University and to the police. Contrary to the claims in the article, Dean Eramo in fact arranged meetings with Jackie and police detectives on multiple occasions, but Jackie balked at cooperating when she realized that the police would want to investigate the factual bases of her claims. (Id. at 1-2.) The false claims had a devastating effect on Dean Eramo's hard-earned reputation as a fierce advocate for victims of domestic and sexual abuse, and also smeared other innocent members of the University of Virginia community.

### II. Truth, Falsity, and Source Credibility Are Key Issues in the Defamation Action.

In continuing to argue that Jackie's documents and communications have no relevance to the defamation action because Jackie herself has not been sued, Jackie's Supplemental Response

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See, e.g., Chuck Ross, *University of Virginia Student's Catfishing Scheme Revealed*, The Daily Caller (Dec. 16, 2014), available at <a href="http://dailycaller.com/2014/12/16/university-of-virginia-students-catfishing-scheme-revealed/">http://dailycaller.com/2014/12/16/university-of-virginia-students-catfishing-scheme-revealed/</a>.

ignores the relevance of the requested documents to the factual allegations, claims, and defenses asserted by both parties to the defamation action.<sup>4</sup> Dean Eramo must of course prove that *Rolling Stone* and Erdely's claims about Dean Eramo are false, and *Rolling Stone* will contend that they are true or substantially true. (*See generally* July 26, 2015 Answer, *Eramo v. Rolling Stone, LLC*, Case No. 3:15-cv-00023-GEC (United Stated District Court for the Western District.) [Dkt. 27]).) Thus, evidence tending to show that Dean Eramo did not act with indifference to Jackie's claims and did not seek to suppress Jackie's reported assault is highly relevant to the issue of falsity. More fundamentally, evidence demonstrating that the supposed gang rape at Phi Kappa Psi *did not happen* is also highly relevant, because it tends to demonstrate that *Rolling Stone* falsely accused Dean Eramo of trying to cover up and suppress an incident that did not even occur.

Moreover, evidence that Jackie fabricated the tale of sexual assault she told to *Rolling Stone*, as well as the details of her subsequent interactions with Dean Eramo, is highly relevant to the issue of Jackie's credibility as a source for the magazine. *Rolling Stone's* defense will be that it did not simply invent the gang rape story or the defamatory allegations about Dean Eramo, *but instead published what Jackie told the magazine*. When a publication relies on a source in publishing a false story, the key issues in determining whether the publication acted with negligence or actual malice are whether the publication failed to investigate the source's claims, whether the publication ignored contrary evidence, and whether the publication knew or should

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Jackie's counsel strangely accuses Dean Eramo of "shifting" her claims and allegations for purposes of the Motion to Compel. (Jackie Supp. Resp. at 3-5.) This is an odd accusation, considering that Dean Eramo's original Memorandum contained a lengthy factual background section that cited and tied every single relevant fact to an allegation in the Complaint. (*See* Nov. 13, 2015 Nicole Eramo's Mem. of Law in Supp. of her Mot. to Compel Nonparty Respondent Jackie's Compliance with Rule 45 Subpoena [Dkt. 2] at 4-6.)

have known that the source was not credible.<sup>5</sup> *See, e.g., Wells v. Liddy*, 37 Fed. App'x 53, 61 (4th Cir. 2002) ("A reasonable jury could conclude further that sole reliance on such an unreliable source violates Virginia's [defamation] negligence standard...."); *Pep v. Newsweek*, *Inc.*, 553 F. Supp. 1000, 1002-03 (S.D.N.Y. 1983) ("Facts such as failure to investigate, or reliance on a questionable source are relevant to the [actual malice] determination . . . ."). The subpoena demands that are the subject of this Motion are narrowly tailored to discover precisely this type of evidence from Jackie.

Jackie's Supplemental Response fails to dispute that Jackie's documents showing her communications with *Rolling Stone*, her interactions with Dean Eramo and UVA, her own contemporary statements about the veracity of the article and its portrayal of Dean Eramo, and the fact that she herself invented and posed as her alleged perpetrator, are highly relevant to the issues of truth, falsity, and Jackie's credibility as a source. Unless *Rolling Stone* is willing to stipulate that Jackie never told *Rolling Stone any* information supporting the defamatory statements the Defendants made about Dean Eramo, that the statements *Rolling Stone* made about Dean Eramo were in fact false, and that Jackie was a subjectively unreliable source on which to base the article, then discovery of this information must be had from Jackie.

### III. Dean Eramo's Motion to Compel Seeks Only Highly Relevant Documents.

As limited by her Supplemental Filing, Dean Eramo's Motion to Compel seeks to compel the production of *only* the following documents from Jackie:

• Jackie's communications with the *Rolling Stone* reporter, Sabrina Rubin Erdely (Demand Nos. 1, 18);

.

by way of example, Jackie's former friends that met with her the night of her alleged assault and exchanged texts with the fake "Haven Monahan" have repeatedly stated that, if *Rolling Stone* had bothered to contact them prior to publication, they would have shared these communications — and their suspicions that Jackie herself was "Haven Monahan" — with *Rolling Stone*. See Sheila Coronel, et al., *Rolling Stone and UVA: The Columbia University Graduate School of Journalism Report*, Rolling Stone (Apr. 5, 2015), available at <a href="http://www.rollingstone.com/culture/features/a-rape-on-campus-what-went-wrong-20150405">http://www.rollingstone.com/culture/features/a-rape-on-campus-what-went-wrong-20150405</a>.

- Jackie's communications with any other person from *Rolling Stone* magazine (Demand Nos. 2, 18);
- Jackie's relevant communications with Nicole Eramo (Demand No. 6);
- Jackie's relevant communications with any other University of Virginia personnel (Demand No. 12);
- Any communications Jackie authored while using the pseudonym "Haven Monahan" or in which Jackie references an individual named "Haven Monahan" (Demand No. 15);
- Jackie's communications with others regarding the *Rolling Stone* article that is the subject of the defamation suit (Demand No. 16); and
- Any public (or formerly public) internet postings Jackie made regarding her alleged sexual assault (Demand No. 17).

(See July 27, 2015 Subpoena to "Jackie" [Dkt. 2-1]); (Dec. 29, 2015 Nicole Eramo's Supp. Filing in Supp. of Mot. to Compel Nonparty Respondent "Jackie" to Comply with Rule 45 Subpoena [Dkt. 26].) Jackie's Supplemental Response essentially ignores this narrowing of the subpoena, and continues to argue about the supposed irrelevance and overbreadth of document categories that are not the subject of Dean Eramo's Motion to Compel. (See Jackie Supp. Resp. at 14-16, 22-23.) This is because each of the above requests is narrowly tailored, not unreasonably intrusive, and seeks only documents highly relevant to the defamation action. Jackie has no basis for refusing to produce them, and cannot meet her burden of justifying her refusal without demonstrating why the specific requests at issue are irrelevant, privileged or otherwise objectionable. See Castle v. Jallah, 142 F.R.D. 618, 620 (E.D. Va. 1992) (the burden is on the nonparty resisting discovery to show why discovery should not be allowed).

For example, Jackie's communications with Sabrina Rubin Erdely and *Rolling Stone* are plainly relevant to the issues of falsity, Jackie's credibility, negligence, and actual malice. Dean Eramo is entitled to receive a full set of these communications from Jackie, especially including those communications that may not also be in the possession of *Rolling Stone* — such as

voicemails, letters, text messages, and emails. Jackie's communications with Dean Eramo and the University of Virginia regarding her supposed assault and her subsequent interactions with Dean Eramo are highly relevant because they will demonstrate that, contrary to the assertions in the article, Dean Eramo did not discourage Jackie from reporting or seek to suppress her assault, but instead actively encouraged her to hold the supposed perpetrators accountable and to allow the police to investigate her claims.

Jackie's communications about the article itself are also highly relevant to both parties' claims and defenses because Jackie is known to have spoken to multiple media outlets and made multiple statements bearing on the truth or falsity of the article generally, and its portrayal of Dean Eramo specifically. By way of example, Jackie acknowledges in her Supplemental Response that she penned an open letter to the *Cavalier Daily* newspaper stating that the article's depiction of Dean Eramo was false and inaccurate. (*See* Nov. 24, 2015 Letter: Advocating for Dean Eramo, *The Cavalier Daily* [Dkt. 27-1]). Additionally, in a text message exchange with UVA student Ryan Duffin shortly after the article was published, Jackie stated that Sabrina Rubin Erdely "twisted" and "manipulated" the story, and that *Rolling Stone* "misrepresented" Dean Eramo's actions:

"Yes, she definitely did her own thing and at the end I had absolutely no control over what was published. It was the shittiest situation ever. I spoke with a reporter from the post explaining how Sabrina took a vast majority of what I said and twisted it and ultimately manipulated my assault to get something sensational. I told him you guys couldn't have had any idea what had happened because I was crying so hard I couldn't explain it other than ""something bad happened and they made me do things" and I told him that she misrepresented you and Dean Eramo. "

Ex. A.<sup>6</sup> It is beyond dispute that statements by the primary source of the article — indeed, the sole source for the article's claims concerning Dean Eramo's treatment of Jackie — bearing on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Copies of Jackie's text messages with Mr. Duffin, as well as Mr. Duffin's text messages with Jackie posing as "Haven Monahan," were obtained by subpoena to Mr. Duffin.

the truth or falsity of the article's portrayal of Dean Eramo are highly relevant to both falsity and actual malice.<sup>7</sup>

Jackie's Supplemental Response largely argues about document demands that are not the subject of the pending Motion to Compel, and rehashes untenable privilege arguments that are not supported by any authority. For example, Jackie claims that Dean Eramo cannot herself unilaterally disclose certain communications with Jackie because she "counseled" Jackie, but then fails to identify any statute, case law, or other authority prohibiting enforcement of a valid subpoena *to Jackie* for those communications in ongoing litigation. (*See* Jackie Supp. Resp. at 20-21.) She also completely ignores the dispositive argument that any potential privilege that even arguably would have applied to communications between Dean Eramo and Jackie was waived by Jackie herself when she voluntarily shared copies of some of these communications with *Rolling Stone* for purposes of the defamatory article. *See, e.g., U.S. v. Bolander*, 722 F.3d 199, 223 (4th Cir. 2013) (a patient waives the patient-psychotherapist privilege by voluntarily disclosing the substance of therapy sessions to third parties).

Jackie also maintains misplaced reliance on Federal Rule of Evidence 412 and her supposed status as a victim of sexual assault as a complete bar to all discovery, yet she acknowledges that Rule 412 by its plain terms only bars admission of evidence regarding evidence of "other" alleged sexual conduct — *not* the supposed sexual conduct directly at issue in the litigation. (*See* Jackie Supp. Resp. at 26.) She also acknowledges that the comments to Rule 412 explain that the Rule does not prohibit discovery or admission of evidence regarding

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The request for formerly public internet postings about the alleged assault is directed at pre-publication evidence that may have been available to *Rolling Stone* that would have called into question the credibility of Jackie's gang rape tale. For example, Jackie is known to have had a public Facebook account that she removed at some point, rendering those postings available to Jackie and *Rolling Stone* prior to publication, but no longer available to Plaintiff.

the sexual conduct that is "intrinsic" to the claims in the case, much less discovery aimed at defamatory statements about sexual conduct. Rule 412 Advisory Committee Notes (1994); see also Truong v. Smith, 183 F.R.D. 273, 274 (D. Colo. 1998) ("[R]ule 412 bars the admission of evidence 'offered to prove that any alleged victim engaged in other sexual behavior.' 'Sexual behavior' includes all activities, other than those 'intrinsic' to the alleged misconduct, that involve sexual intercourse or sexual contact . . . . ") (citing references omitted) (emphasis added); (Jackie Supp. Resp. at 26-27). And most importantly, she simply does not anywhere proffer, allege, or represent to the Court that she was in fact the victim of the September 28, 2012 sexual assault recounted in the Rolling Stone article; namely, the Phi Psi gang rape story that she related to Rolling Stone, and the different stories that she told her friends and Dean Eramo. What Jackie is refusing to produce is not evidence of a sexual assault, but evidence that she lied. There is no immunity from discovery on this basis.

### IV. There is no Factual Basis Whatsoever for the Claim that Jackie is an Alleged Victim of the Supposed Sexual Assault at Issue.

Jackie's attorneys repeatedly argue in briefing that she was a victim of an unspecified sexual assault at some unspecified time and at some unspecified place, and that this bald claim grants her complete immunity from discovery based on that status. However, nowhere in their 56 pages of briefing on this Motion to Compel do Jackie's attorneys even *once* claim that she was in fact the victim of a group sexual assault on September 28, 2012, whether at the Phi Kappa Psi fraternity or anywhere else. Nowhere do they claim or allege that the incident she reported to *Rolling Stone*, or the incident she related to UVA officials and other UVA students, actually occurred. Nowhere do they dispute the findings of the Charlottesville Police Department that most everything Jackie has said to anyone about the night of September 28, 2012, was found to be a lie — including the name of her supposed attacker, where she met her supposed attacker,

what fraternity her supposed attacker belonged to, the very existence of her supposed attacker, the photographs she provided to other students of her supposed attacker, the location of the supposed assault, the description of the supposed assault, the time of day it occurred, her supposed injuries, the location where she met friends following the supposed assault, the details of the supposed assault she related to those friends, the details of the supposed assault she related to *Rolling Stone*, and the details of the supposed assault she related to UVA. (*See generally* CPD Report.) The bottom line is that, after thoroughly investigating Jackie's claims, the Charlottesville Police Department flatly determined that there was "no substantive basis of fact to conclude" that the supposed sexual assault occurred at all. (*Id.* at 6.)

Significantly, there is also no factual basis whatsoever *in the record before the Court* that would allow the Court to conclude that Jackie is even an "alleged" victim of sexual assault, let alone an actual victim. Jackie's attorneys offer only conclusory and vague insinuations about her victim status without even the barest attempt to point to a single shred of factual evidence, or even to identify *what supposed sexual assault they are referring to*. There is no allegation. There is no alleged perpetrator. There is no alleged incident. There is no alleged date, time, or location of the supposed assault. There is no ongoing police investigation into any alleged assault. In fact, acting on advice from her attorney, Jackie declined to answer any questions or make any statement to the police department investigating her supposed assault before the police concluded that there was no basis in fact to believe it occurred — obviously out of concern that saying anything to the police about the fabricated assault could expose her to legal liability for making a false statement. (*Id.* at 3.) And despite multiple opportunities in filings before the Eastern District of Virginia and now the Western District, Jackie's attorneys have pointedly declined to present an affidavit, declaration, or proffer from Jackie factually attesting to her

status as an "alleged victim." There is *nothing* but Jackie's attorneys stating in argument that she is a "victim." The position taken here by Jackie and her attorneys would allow any individual to resist participation in any civil discovery simply by making a completely unsubstantiated attorney argument that the individual was at some unknown date and time a victim of some kind of sexual assault. That is of course not the law, and Jackie's Supplemental Response makes no effort to demonstrate that it is.

Moreover, the nebulous attorney argument that Jackie is a past victim of an unspecified sexual assault is irrelevant to the present Motion because the remaining categories of document demands that are the subject of the Motion concern *only* Jackie's claims to *Rolling Stone* and UVA about the supposed sexual assault on September 28, 2012. *Nowhere* have Jackie's attorneys claimed or alleged this *this* sexual assault actually occurred. Even if Jackie was in fact sexually assaulted, by a real person, at some other place and time in her life, that is irrelevant to the present Motion and the documents at issue. Plaintiff has no interest in any other supposed sexual assaults other than the indisputably false claims that Jackie told UVA and *Rolling Stone* about September 28, 2012, and the Motion to Compel does not seek documents relating to any other supposed incidents of sexual assault — real or imagined.

Finally, it bears noting that in all 56 pages of Respondent's briefing on Movant's Motion to Compel, not once has Jackie ever addressed or referenced document demand Number 15, which requests all communications Jackie authored under the pseudonym "Haven Monahan," or communications in which Jackie referred to a "Haven Monahan." (Subpoena at 5.). This is not an oversight, but rather a tacit acknowledgment that the account of a sexual assault that Jackie told to *Rolling Stone* was a complete fabrication. "Haven Monahan" was the name Jackie originally gave to friends as her date for the evening of September 28, 2012, and, later, as the

supposed ringleader of her gang rape. (CPD Report at 4.) But as the Charlottesville Police Department found after a lengthy investigation, "Haven Monahan" does not exist. Rather, all available evidence demonstrates that "Haven Monahan" was a fake suitor created by Jackie in a strange bid to earn the affections of a student named Ryan Duffin that Jackie was romantically interested in. Jackie provided "Haven's" phone numbers to Mr. Duffin prior to the date of her supposed assault, and encouraged Duffin to exchange texts with "Haven" while pretending to be a girl interested in dating him. When Duffin did so, "Haven" quite notably only wanted to talk about Jackie, how wonderful she was, how interested in Mr. Duffin she was, and what a fool Duffin was for rejecting her romantic advances:

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:31:04 EDT 2012) yeah, im a first year. I really wish I could see you on Friday!!!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:32:28 EDT 2012)

Yea I would but there's this girl. You probably know her jackie redacted? She was in ourchem class. She lives in gooch.

\* \* \* \* \*

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The "phone numbers" for "Haven Monahan" that Jackie provided to Mr. Duffin were not actually associated with a cell phone, but rather are dummy numbers obtained from certain internet sites that allow a user to text with another phone from a computer or iPad device. This contrivance allowed Jackie, posing as "Haven Monahan," to text with Mr. Duffin in a way that would lead him to believe he was texting with a real person using a cell phone. *See* Peter Jacobs, *There's More Bizarre Evidence That UVA Student Jackie's Alleged Rapist Doesn't Exist*, Business Insider (Dec. 17, 2014), *available at* <a href="http://www.businessinsider.com/theres-more-bizarre-evidence-that-uva-student-jackies-alleged-rapist-doesnt-exist-2014-12">http://www.businessinsider.com/theres-more-bizarre-evidence-that-uva-student-jackies-alleged-rapist-doesnt-exist-2014-12</a>.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:37:21 EDT 2012) Since your a first year girl can you give me some advice?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:37:37 EDT 2012)

Advice? Sure!!!!!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:41:36 EDT 2012)

(1/4) Ok Jackie is this super smart hot first year and I tried to talk to her on the first day of class but she blew me off so I thought it was no biggie.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:41:41 EDT 2012)

(2/4) But then I caught her listenin to safetysuit and coheed and cambria which are 2 of my fav bands so I new I needed to meet her but she was tellin her

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:41:46 EDT 2012)

(3/4) friends that she was volunteerin at the spca for the rest of the day and she walked away. I keep tryna talk to her nd she keeps ignoring me like she

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:41:51 EDT 2012) (4/4) dosnt realize im a 3rd year or some bs

\* \* \* \* \*

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:57:44 EDT 2012)

(1/2) I will. HOw can she not Want me? wtf? She cant turn me down fro some nerd 1st yr.

She said this kid is smart and funny and worth it but I told her if

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:57:49 EDT 2012) (2/2) he said no to fuck it Nd move onto better things like me

(Ex. B.) When these fake texts did not have the desired effect of causing Duffin to be jealous and romantically interested in Jackie, "Haven" upped the ante, telling Duffin that Jackie was dying of a terminal illness in a further bid to arouse Mr. Duffin's sympathies and make him feel guilty for rejecting Jackie's advances:

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:36:12 EDT 2012) Take my advice on this. Move on. She's not interested.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:38:59 EDT 2012)

01/02:No fuck you. It takes a heartless fucken as shole to mess with someone whos sick. If she died tomorrow uoud be the fuker who broke her heart. Shes special

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:39:04 EDT 2012)

02/02: and thats why I'm going after her. No one understands life like her

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:40:41 EDT 2012) She just had a cold, bro. A cold that I caught.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:42:25 EDT 2012)

01/02:Do you even know? Shes got lupus shes really sick dude why do you think shes on so many fucken meds I met her in Chem but I volunteer at the clinic thats

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:42:34 EDT 2012) 02/02:how I got to know her I thot you were her friend

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:44:38 EDT 2012)

Jackie's sick but it makes her this kickass person shes phenomenal and your a fuck so leave her the fuck alone. Se doesn't need people like you in her life

(Ex. C.) Separately, Jackie — all the while encouraging Duffin to continue texting with

"Haven" — doubled down on the deception:

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Thu Sep 13 23:59:40 EDT 2012) Do you know Haven well?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:02:17 EDT 2012)

Uhm I guess? Idk not like I'd feel compelled to give him a kidney or anything

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted (Fri Sep 14 00:04:00 EDT 2012)

But you know him more than you let on.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:05:05 EDT 2012)

No not really. I didn't lie about him. I don't lie. What are you getting at?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:06:14 EDT 2012)

I just had the impression that you saw him once in chemistry and that was it. But you know him better than that, so it makes him a bit less creepy. I'm not getting at anything; I'm just curious.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:10:12 EDT 2012)

I saw him once in chemistry and once again at the student health center. It's not any less creepy because both times I barely said two words to him and he imagined some strange relationship between us that clearly doesn't exist. Listen Ryan, I wasn't mad at you tonight.

I was mad at him. He had a confidentiality clause that he signed as a student employee at the health center and it's not his place to tell other people my problems. It's wrong and if I wanted people to know wouldn't I tell them?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:12:10 EDT 2012)

If you don't want people to know, take my word that I won't tell anybody. Maybe I just don't understand the disease, but to me, it's not a big deal.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:12:41 EDT 2012)

How extensive is the clause? Because he just disclosed your will to me.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:13:01 EDT 2012)

Ryan, it means I'm dying.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:13:47 EDT 2012)

Holy shit. I... I had no idea. Do you want to talk?

 ${\it Jackie} \ {\it redacted} \ {\it to} \ {\it Ryan \ Duffin} \hbox{: (Fri Sep 14 00:15:15 EDT 2012)}$ 

It's a big deal because people treat you differently, like you're about to break at any given moment. And it's not cause they like you and it's not cause they care...it's because you're perishable and that scares them

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted (Fri Sep 14 00:17:37 EDT 2012)

I won't tell anybody. You have my word on that. Haven, on the other hand...

(Ex. D.) Next, "Haven" began telling Mr. Duffin about showering Jackie with gifts:

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:41:22 EDT 2012)

I sent her more flowers but she never texted me so idk if she got them

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:41:45 EDT 2012)

Well, that sounds nice anyway.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:43:15 EDT 2012)

Yea iv spent \$300 on flowers and chocolate but shes been with that Kyle guy now that shes over you and idk what he did with her. He took her somewhere

(Ex. C.) Jackie simultaneously went out of her way to encourage Mr. Duffin to believe that his competition, "Haven," was busy trying to woo her:

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 11 10:47:12 EDT 2012)

Soooo not to be awkward at all but it probably will be because you probably didn't but did you send me flowers? I'm guessing no but I'd rather it be you than who I think it is even though I'm about 99% positive it wasn't you but I'm making sure

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 11 10:47:41 EDT 2012)

"Haha never mind then. Haven's ""did you get the flowers?"" text confirmed everything. Great. Sorry to bother you!!"

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Sep 11 11:55:59 EDT 2012)

Oh. I just saw this text now, sorry for not responding earlier. Haven is a creepy one.

(Ex. D.) Finally, "Haven" began telling Mr. Duffin about his plan to take Jackie on a date to a fancy restaurant in Charlottesville on the night of September 28, the date of the supposed sexual assault:

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 21:53:06 EDT 2012)
Where should I take her out? She said 5 guys or subway but I was thinking about the old mill room at boars head inn, do you think she'll like it?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 21:55:39 EDT 2012)
Or foressts at keswick hall...which one do u think she'll like more?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 21:56:14 EDT 2012)

I don't know where those places are, actually. I'm sure she'd like anything.

(Ex. C.)

When none of "Haven's" efforts had the desired effect, Jackie finally called Mr. Duffin on the night of September 28, 2012, claiming that her date with "Haven" had ended in a sexual assault, and asking Mr. Duffin to spend the night with her to comfort her. Stranger still, even after he supposedly orchestrated a violent gang rape of Jackie, "Haven" continued to communicate with Mr. Duffin, purporting to forward to Mr. Duffin emails authored by Jackie in which she extolled Mr. Duffin's virtues. (Ex. E.) Only after Mr. Duffin questioned whether "Haven Monahan" was a real person and demanded to speak to him on the telephone did the communications finally stop. (Ex. C.) At that point Mr. Duffin confronted Jackie about evidence that "Haven" was not a real person. Jackie — pretending to cut and paste a text from "Haven" to Ryan — starts:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Margaret Hartmann, *Everything We Know About the UVA Rape Case [Updated]*, New York Magazine (July 30, 2015), *available at* <a href="http://nymag.com/daily/intelligencer/2014/12/everything-we-know-uva-rape-case.html">http://nymag.com/daily/intelligencer/2014/12/everything-we-know-uva-rape-case.html</a>.

```
Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 19:36:13 EDT 2012)

I couldn't really hear him but he thought u made me up and ur a psycho

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 19:37:19 EDT 2012)

Really Ryan? Wow.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 19:59:44 EDT 2012)

He thought I made you up?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:00:17 EDT 2012)

Oh. That's a Haven text. I see.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:01:19 EDT 2012)

Yep.
```

(Ex. D.) Mr. Duffin then explains that Jackie's fabrication of "Haven" is the only possible explanation that makes any sense:

```
Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:03:27 EDT 2012)
```

Nick and I had to consider that a possibility. It was a possibility that could make sense. We could find no evidence that Haven ever was at UVA. People Search turned up nothing. Even though he dropped out, he should still show up on it. We had more reasons. It was an answer that would actually have worked, but we wanted to be sure before we brought it up to you. I wasn't planning on Haven going and telling you, because I knew that you'd react like this.

```
Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:05:55 EDT 2012)

Our friendship is over Ryan

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted (Sun Oct 07 20:06:40 EDT 2012)

"Like I said on Thursday. I understand completely.

But I still don't really understand what happened here."
```

(Id.)

The reason that Jackie and her attorneys have very conspicuously avoided referencing or addressing the demand that Jackie produce any communications she authored under the pseudonym "Haven Monahan" is that to admit the existence of such documents would be to put the lie to any claim that Jackie was the victim of an alleged sexual assault on September 28, 2012, and would require Jackie to admit that her concern is not being outed as a victim of sexual assault, but rather being exposed as a serial liar who invented people, events, and text messages. All available evidence suggests that "Haven Monahan" was a figment of Jackie's imagination,

created to try to make Mr. Duffin jealous in a failed bid to win his attention. Jackie then revived the false story when it suited her after being called to task for failing grades. There was no date with "Haven" on September 28, 2012, and there was no sexual assault orchestrated by "Haven" on September 28, 2012. The story was a lie when she first told it in 2012, and it was no more true when *Rolling Stone* recklessly published the tale in 2014. Jackie simply has no legal basis to claim complete immunity from discovery regarding her gravely consequential fabrications.<sup>10</sup>

### **CONCLUSION**

Aside from the parties to the litigation, Jackie is by any estimation the most central witness in the case. Her fabricated tale of sexual assault, her interactions with Dean Eramo, her statements to *Rolling Stone*, and her credibility (or lack thereof) as a primary source for *Rolling Stone's* article and false claims about Dean Eramo are the key issues in the defamation case, and Jackie's documents and testimony are highly relevant not only to Dean Eramo's claims, but to *Rolling Stone's* defenses to those claims. In 56 pages of briefing, Jackie has yet to identify a single case, statute, or rule of procedure that immunizes her from all civil discovery generally, or that proscribes even a single one of the specific document demands in the subpoena.

For the foregoing reasons, Nicole Eramo, Plaintiff in the case of *Eramo v. Rolling Stone LLC*, et al., No. 3:15-cv-00023-GEC, currently pending in the United States District Court for

\_

Similarly, Jackie's counsels' claim that Jackie is somehow immune from a deposition in this case is equally untenable. (*See* Jackie Supp. Resp. at 9-10.) The issue is not before the Court because no deposition subpoena has yet been issued as Dean Eramo is still, many months later, awaiting the production of Jackie's documents. Counsel for Dean Eramo requested that counsel for Jackie provide her available deposition dates — as the close of discovery is fast approaching — but this was merely a scheduling courtesy extended to counsel and not a formal subpoena for a deposition. Jackie's counsel has turned this common courtesy on its head by claiming indignation at the notion that the chief source for the article would be subject to a deposition, and by attempting to use the scheduling request as a means to further delay a hearing on the Motion to Compel. Recognizing that Jackie's counsel was attempting to seize on this courtesy as a means for further delay, Dean Eramo's counsel made abundantly clear that no such further delay would be permitted, and that a deposition subpoena will be forthcoming after Jackie's documents have been produced. To be perfectly clear regarding Plaintiff's position, Jackie is a critical witness who absolutely must be deposed.

the Western District of Virginia, respectfully requests that the Court grant her Motion to Compel Nonparty Respondent Jackie to Comply with Rule 45 Subpoena.

Dated: January 6, 2016 Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Thomas A. Clare
Thomas A. Clare (VA Bar No. 39299)
Elizabeth M. Locke (VA Bar No. 71784)
Andrew C. Phillips (VA Bar No. 88880)
CLARE LOCKE LLP
902 Prince Street
Alexandria, Virginia 22314
Telephone: (202) 628-7400
tom@clarelocke.com
libby@clarelocke.com
andy@clarelocke.com

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF/MOVANT NICOLE ERAMO

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of Nicole Eramo's Response to Non-Party Respondent's Supplemental Response in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Compel Production was served on the below counsel on January 6, 2016 via ECF.

Pat A. Cipollone Rebecca R. Anzidei Philip J. O'Beirne Stein Mitchell Cipollone Beato & Missner LLP 1100 Connecticut Avenue N.W., Suite 1100 Washington, D.C. 20036 Telephone: (202) 737-7777

Telephone: (202) 737-77° Fax: (202) 296-8312

Email: pcipollone@steinmitchell.com

pobeirne@steinmitchell.com

Email: ranzidei@steinmitchell.com

Palma Pustilnik Staff Attorney Central Virginia Legal Aid Society 1000 Preston Avenue, Suite B Charlottesville, VA 22903 Telephone: (434) 327-1443

Fax: (434) 296-5731 Email: palma@cvlas.org

Steven D. Rosenfield 913 E. Jefferson Street Charlottesville, VA 22902 Telephone: (434) 984-0300

Fax: (434) 220-4852

Email: attyrosen@aol.com

Attorneys for Nonparty Respondent "Jackie"

Michael John Finney William David Paxton Gentry Locke Rakes & Moore P.O. Box 40013 Roanoke, VA 24022-0013

Telephone: (540) 983-9373 Telephone: (540) 983-9334

Fax: (540) 983-9400

Email: finney@gentrylocke.com Email: paxton@gentrylocke.com

Elizabeth A. McNamara Samuel M. Bayard Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 1251 Avenue of the Americas 21<sup>st</sup> Floor New York, New York 10020 Telephone: (212) 489-8230

Fax: (212) 489-8340

Email: lizmcnamara@dwt.com Email: samuelbayard@dwt.com

Alison B. Schary DAVIS WRIGHT TREMAINE LLP 1919 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Suite 800 Washington, DC 20006-3401

Telephone: (202) 973-4248 Fax: (202) 973-4448

E-mail: alisonschary@dwt.com

Attorneys for Defendants Rolling Stone LLC, Sabrina Rubin Erdely, and Wenner Media LLC

Dated: January 6, 2016

By: <u>/s/ Thomas A. Clare</u>
Thomas A. Clare

## Exhibit A

Name: Jackie redacted Phone: redacted

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 03 13:01:09 EST 2014)

"Hey, I wanted to let things die down a little bit before reaching out to you, but I wanted to say I'm really proud of you. I think some real great change is going to come around because of this, even in the face of the liberties Sabrina took.

I'm so sorry I never realized the magnitude of the situation at the time - if I could do it again, I'd have spent more time with you, making sure you were okay.

Do you want to get lunch sometime soon and catch up?"

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 03 13:38:01 EST 2014) Thank you and I feel really dumb but who is this?

 $Ryan\ Duffin\ to\ Jackie$  redacted: (Wed Dec 03 13:39:45 EST 2014) Ryan.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 03 13:46:34 EST 2014)

Oh hey I'm so sorry all of my contacts were deleted when I switched my phone! First off I want to say I'm SO SORRY for they way Sabrina wrote about you and Alex and Kathryn in the article. The story wasn't even supposed to be about my assault. It was supposed to be about survivor support and advocacy at uva and since I'm super active in the advocacy community I agreed to take an interview with her in June and she asked me to explain what happened to me so I did but I never thought she would publish it because it was literally the worst two hours of my life. I had no clue what she was writing about until October. I tried to pull out of it because I know her writing style and I know she would sensationalize things and take extreme artistic license (which she definitely did) but she said it would be published with or without me. I know she misrepresented you and Alex and Kathryn as well as dean Eramo and a lot of other people in the story....I'm sorry if this put you in an awkward position.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 03 13:49:47 EST 2014)

"See, after reading it, I sat back and thought, ""that could have been way better if it had been taken at face value and focused on survivor support." I figured that was probably the intent anyway. I heard you're talking to the Washington Post?"

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 03 13:52:58 EST 2014)

"Yes, she definitely did her own thing and at the end I had absolutely no control over what was published. It was the shittiest situation ever. I spoke with a reporter from the post explaining how Sabrina took a vast majority of what I said and twisted it and ultimately manipulated my assault to get something sensational. I told him you guys couldn't have had any idea what had happened because I was crying so hard I couldn't explain it other than ""something bad happened and they made me do things" and I told him that she misrepresented you and Dean Eramo. "

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 03 13:54:18 EST 2014)

He's focusing on what I want out of the article which is great because I'm stressing survivor support and prevention and I want to form a group for survivors of sexual assault like AA that anyone can go to and get resources and have people who understand how to deal with something like that. I hope that's the main focus of his article.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 03 13:55:05 EST 2014)

It certainly lends a lot of legitimacy to what should have been the main points in Sabrina's article. Any word on when it might be published?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 03 13:55:06 EST 2014) Sunday I think. That's what he said...

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 03 13:55:06 EST 2014)

I can give you his number if you want to talk to him. He's a really nice guy.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 03 13:57:44 EST 2014)

"I don't really know if I need to talk to him. Just curious about the article; looking forward to reading it.

So how are you doing with all of this? I imagine the last two weeks have been really emotional, too."

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 03 14:01:30 EST 2014)

"I'm hoping it clarifies a lot of what Sabrina sensationalized. I'm hanging in there....sort of. It's been insane and really overwhelming. And now the press is trying to figure out who I am at all costs. It's awful. Have you spoken to Alex and Kathryn? How are they? Please tell them

I'm sorry and everything that was in the article about them she basically made up."

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 03 14:09:48 EST 2014)

"I talked to Kathryn a little bit... she didn't seem too fazed by it. Alex and I have realized that people aren't mad at us, they're mad at fictional, sensationalized characters based on us.

I know it's a platitude, but if you need anything or need to talk, don't hesitate to reach out. I'm really sorry you need to go through all this press stuff."

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 03 14:22:36 EST 2014)

Thanks for being so understanding...it means a lot to me. I'll be back in Charlottesville next week if you want to get lunch or something. Let me know what your schedule is like

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 03 14:23:44 EST 2014)

My last final is on the 12th, and then I'll be around and totally free for a few days after that.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 03 14:24:52 EST 2014)

Okay that sounds great. My last final is on the 15th but I can honestly do whenever. I'll text you after your last final and we'll figure something out

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 03 14:25:05 EST 2014)

Okay, sounds good!

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Dec 05 14:38:43 EST 2014)

Still here for you. Just so you know.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Dec 05 15:09:46 EST 2014)

Thanks Ryan. I'm telling the police everything on Monday and they may ask you to corroborate stuff from that night.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Dec 05 15:13:55 EST 2014)

Well shit. In that case, you should know that I already spoke to them on Monday. Felt like I had the social responsibility to, and I figured you'd had some consent in the investigation being opened in the first place.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Dec 05 15:33:27 EST 2014)

Oh, I see. Why shouldn't Sabrina's career be on the line? Seems like she knowingly took a lot of liberties with the article.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Dec 05 15:55:10 EST 2014)

"She did and she never even fact checked things about that night with me. I think some people are going to issue a statement about the Washington post article too because he misquoted basically everyone and clearly did not do ""off the record" or ""on background."" This is just a disaster. "

 $Ryan\ Duffin\ to\ Jackie\ redacted:\ (Fri\ Dec\ 05\ 16:01:42\ EST\ 2014)$ 

Hey, it's gotten people talking. That's a huge plus.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Dec 05 17:04:37 EST 2014)

I know. I just hope people listen to all of the other women who have come forward since the article came out

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 10 16:54:18 EST 2014)

Hey! Have you by chance spoken with Taylor Shapiro the guy from the Washington post?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 10 17:25:09 EST 2014) Yeah, extensively.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 10 17:26:18 EST 2014)

He's claiming that you told him that don't think anything happened that night and that I was lying because I had a crush on you.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 10 17:28:38 EST 2014)

I didn't say that was what I thought, but did say it's a possibility to be considered.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 10 17:28:48 EST 2014)

I haven't read that article yet, by the way.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 10 17:30:48 EST 2014)

He didn't publish it yet he called my lawyer

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 10 17:33:22 EST 2014)

It went up about 15 minutes ago, I think.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 10 17:34:50 EST 2014)

If you really think I would lie about something like that then you never should have been friends with me to begin with and it wouldn't make any sense for me to go through 2 years of counseling and working with one less and getting involved with dean Eramo and the sexual misconduct board and helping with take back the night all because I had a crush on you two years ago

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 10 17:41:14 EST 2014)

I have been a mess for two years. I've been trying to get my life back together. And I didn't expect this. Sabrina came to me to ask about the advocacy work I do and asked me how I got involved and I told her never having any idea that she'd embellish it and publish it for the whole world to read. And now Taylor is trying to dig into my life...he fucking asked me what kind of trauma my gynological exam showed and if I can have children...he's awful

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 10 18:14:27 EST 2014)

"From the research that's been done, though, there are a lot of questions. At this point, they're questions I know I can't answer, but you can. The biggest one being ""what actually happened?"", because I know what you told me and I know I want to believe it. But in the eyes of news media, that's not enough. It comes down to evidence. "

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 10 18:23:54 EST 2014)

To be completely honest with you, I told you what I could at the time. I told you what I could handle telling you but if you remember, I was a disaster. My lawyer knows everything and so do my parents. And I will tell the police when the media stops their fishing expedition. But if I've learned anything from this its that the press prints what it wants without any input from me. I don't trust them at all after Sabrina did what she did and took things way out of hand without my consent. And I'm definitely not going to help Taylor with his shitstorm because he has lied about numerous things to me in an attempt to get a rise out of me and my family. And some of what happened I don't have an answer for. I don't know why or how or even what exactly went on. But I know the confusion afterwards and the bullshit and that's why I want to help other girls.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 10 18:43:32 EST 2014)

So if I can just ask a question, then... Why did you tell us before the date ever happened that his name was Haven? Haven Monahan? A name that belongs to no UVA student ever? Why has the name changed since then?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Dec 10 18:53:46 EST 2014)

His last name was Monahan and he called himself Haven. His first name was John or jake or something. And he was there that night but he was a bystander. He wasn't involved. Not really. And please do not repeat this to Taylor because Palma said I shouldn't even be talking to you but I think you deserve an explanation.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Dec 10 19:06:14 EST 2014)

Okay, thanks for letting me know. I was curious. As I can agree with Palma - bevause of your legal concerns and because I'm still being approached by reporters, it's probably better that we don't talk right now, too.

## Exhibit B

Name: Haven Monahan Phone: redacted Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:09:37 EDT 2012) Who is this? Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:10:05 EDT 2012) Who is this? I'm not sure I ever texted you. Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:10:58 EDT 2012) Is this Jackie? Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:11:16 EDT 2012) No... who's Jackie? Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:12:15 EDT 2012) Nvm. Someone from this number texted my phone so im textin them back on my friends phone Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:13:07 EDT 2012) that's weird... lol! Wait! Are you haven? Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:13:27 EDT 2012) Yea why? Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:13:48 EDT 2012) Who are you? Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:14:06 EDT 2012) omg I'm in your chem class! :) my name's Brianna! U busy Friday? Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:14:39 EDT 2012) Yea I've got a date with a girl in our class. Sorry Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:16:21 EDT 2012) Howd you get my number? Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:16:27 EDT 2012) well if that doesn't work out, you totally can text me anytime!;) Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:17:48 EDT 2012) Idt so. I really like her. But thanks anyway. actually she switched out so where do you sit? You should come sit by me Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:18:23 EDT 2012) Are you a 1st year? Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:29:09 EDT 2012) You there?

Yea hes my roommate he dos that alot. Its chill tho. Your a first year?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:29:24 EDT 2012) yeah I am! Do you know Troy? He gave me your number, lol

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:30:36 EDT 2012)

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:31:04 EDT 2012) yeah, im a first year. I really wish I could see you on Friday!!!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:32:28 EDT 2012)

Yea I would but there's this girl. You probably know her jackie redacted? She was in ourchem class. She lives in gooch.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:34:12 EDT 2012) I don't know her. But you should go out with meee instead!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:34:21 EDT 2012)

I already asked her out for Friday and she said no but shes just fuckin with me she means yes but if things dont work out with her I'll hit you up

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:35:11 EDT 2012) well you have my number!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:35:17 EDT 2012)

No offense Brianna but your prob not my type. We can be friends but I really like this girl. Shes deep.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:36:43 EDT 2012)

I promise I'd be better!;)

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:37:21 EDT 2012) Since your a first year girl can you give me some advice?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:37:37 EDT 2012)

Advice? Sure!!!!!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:41:36 EDT 2012)

(1/4) Ok Jackie is this super smart hot first year and I tried to talk to her on the first day of class but she blew me off so I thought it was no biggie.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:41:41 EDT 2012)

(2/4) But then I caught her listenin to safetysuit and coheed and cambria which are 2 of my fav bands so I new I needed to meet her but she was tellin her

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:41:46 EDT 2012)

(3/4) friends that she was volunteerin at the spca for the rest of the day and she walked away. I keep tryna talk to her nd she keeps ignoring me like she

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:41:51 EDT 2012)

(4/4) dosnt realize im a 3rd year or some bs

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:43:23 EDT 2012)

I promise I wouldn't ignore youuuu!!!!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:44:05 EDT 2012)

(1/2) shes just always sayin this deep shit that blows my mind. An I asked her out and she said no so I sent her some pics of me and was like wtf I'm hot and

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:44:10 EDT 2012)

(2/2) she said she didn't care that looks dont mean anything to her

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:44:37 EDT 2012)

idk... but I love Safetysuit!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:45:11 EDT 2012)

Really? There so good wats your fav song?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:45:57 EDT 2012)

She was listening to stay and these times wich are my 2 fav songs

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:46:46 EDT 2012)

Ahh I got to see them play Stay when I saw them open for The Script last year! Sooo amazing!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:47:19 EDT 2012)

Really?? Dude no fucken way!

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:47:49 EDT 2012)

Yeah, soooo incredible. Were u there?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:49:02 EDT 2012)

(1/2) No. Maybe jackie was I should ask her. I need to know what to do. This has never happened. Girls always like me. Except for her. You see how many girls

 $\it Haven\ Monahan\ to\ Ryan\ Duffin:\ (Wed\ Sep\ 05\ 00:49:06\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

(2/2) like me

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:50:15 EDT 2012)

I don't want to give you advice on Jackie! I want you for meeee!!!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:51:46 EDT 2012)

"(1/2) How can looks not matter? And get this she said she likes some other 1st year guy who dosnt like her and turned her down but she wont date me Cause she"

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:51:50 EDT 2012)

(2/2) likes him. Wtf. Its so fucked up man

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:53:05 EDT 2012)

Ummmm can I get some pics?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:53:58 EDT 2012)

Tryna send you some from this blackberry but idk how to work it I'm askin my friend and she said its thro email

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:55:00 EDT 2012)

You get that one?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 00:55:57 EDT 2012)

Noo, I didn't! But Jackie sounds like a waste of your time. I sit right behind you in Chem! Just talk to me!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:57:44 EDT 2012)

(1/2) I will. HOw can she not Want me? wtf? She cant turn me down fro some nerd 1st yr.

She said this kid is smart and funny and worth it but I told her if

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:57:49 EDT 2012) (2/2) he said no to fuck it Nd move onto better things like me

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:58:35 EDT 2012)

Then get this she called me conceited and said even if she didn't like the kid she still wouldnt ever date me who the fuck is she kidding?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:59:26 EDT 2012) My friend said it cums from her email darlinmeg

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 01:00:50 EDT 2012) I didnt get it!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:01:24 EDT 2012) Wtf. K I'll try from my blackberry phones dead

## **Exhibit C**

Name: Haven Monahan Phone: redacted

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:08:03 EDT 2012)

Hey its haven on my bberry u get it?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 01:09:44 EDT 2012)

Got it! Pleeease just talk to me in chem? I sit right behind you, I'm sure!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:10:57 EDT 2012)

Ok. Can u help me come up with a plan to get Jackie to go out with me and forget the faggot first year she likes? I need girl advice

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 01:11:13 EDT 2012)
No!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:11:13 EDT 2012)

Troy fucken sucks at this shit

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:13:16 EDT 2012)

01/02:Why? Your a girl. Maybe you can find out who this kid is. Maybe hes a football player. All she would say is that hes 'brilliant and funny and amazing' or

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:13:21 EDT 2012)

02/02:some dumb bs her number is redacted you should hit her up and see wat she thinks of me

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:15:54 EDT 2012)

And find out if she fucks on the first date bitches tell each other tht shit

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 01:17:32 EDT 2012) She said he doesn't play football. That's all she'd tell me.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:20:46 EDT 2012) 02/02:talkin to them but like normal shit like music and sports

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:20:51 EDT 2012)

01/02: Well find out other stuff like if she's a virgin and what she likes to do. I know she likes animals and old ppl cuz she was over at the old ppls home

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:22:08 EDT 2012)

And find out who the first year is and what hes like. Theres no way hes better then me.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:25:38 EDT 2012)

do u smoke? Jackie dosnt smoke or drink cuz shes like that but do you? You should come partying with me and Troy tomorrow nite

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 01:26:38 EDT 2012) I don't know about tomorrow but you have my number!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:27:36 EDT 2012)

K I'll hit u up! Gotta hit the hay! Lemme know about if jackie fucks tomorrow in chem. peace

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 09:53:12 EDT 2012)

To tired to go to chem. take notes for me?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 18:06:47 EDT 2012)

Did you take notes for me?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 18:10:02 EDT 2012)

omggg I ment 2 tell u. I didn't see that you asked until after the class! were u really not there??? I looked for you so much!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:08:04 EDT 2012)

Ok whatever did you talk to Jackie?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:13:51 EDT 2012)

She won't tell me anything!!!! I don't think she wants to go out with u, Lola

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:14:06 EDT 2012) sry, lolz

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:15:10 EDT 2012)

But I love her. Tell her that

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:15:56 EDT 2012)

I told her. She doesn't love you.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:16:20 EDT 2012)

Who's the guy she likes? Did you fund out? Does she love him?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:16:59 EDT 2012)

She won't tell me anyyything!!! idk,

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:17:39 EDT 2012)

She prob does who the fuck is he?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:18:21 EDT 2012)

Who's who?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:19:26 EDT 2012)

The fucken kid shes in love with

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:20:40 EDT 2012)

You mean Tom Sawyer?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:21:02 EDT 2012)

Wtf is his name who is he

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:21:17 EDT 2012)

Not fucken Tom sawyer the first year

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:22:01 EDT 2012)

His name seriously is Tom Sawyer. Jackie just told me.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:22:04 EDT 2012)

Wtf Brianna what does he have that I dont?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:22:55 EDT 2012)

Well, he's named after a famous fictional character, for one thing.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:23:41 EDT 2012)

No he's not her friend told me his name it's like Tyler or something he plays music

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:23:58 EDT 2012)

Tyler and Tom both start with T....

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:24:17 EDT 2012)

I'm lookin through my messages for his name

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:25:08 EDT 2012)

Ryan is his name what's his last name

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:25:19 EDT 2012)

Sawyer.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:25:59 EDT 2012)

Stop being a fucken cunt

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:27:11 EDT 2012)

I'm going out with her this other kid turned her down cuz he's a dumb fuck so Friday shell say yes

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 19:27:52 EDT 2012)

Have fun with that.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 19:30:00 EDT 2012)

She will. Se needs to get the fuck over this kid who dosnt like her and move on

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 20:18:38 EDT 2012)

She said shes waitin for Ryan

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 20:19:32 EDT 2012)

Why won't you just go out me?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 20:20:30 EDT 2012)

Ok when?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 20:22:22 EDT 2012)

What are you doing Friday?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 20:23:20 EDT 2012)

Hookin up with some girl

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Wed Sep 05 20:25:06 EDT 2012)

Well I dont want to go out with you anyway then.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 22:52:59 EDT 2012)

Well ima try and get with jackie still but if not I can do friday nite

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 00:11:55 EDT 2012)

How's Friday at 7 at basils, baby?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 00:29:31 EDT 2012) Sounds good of Jackie says no

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 00:31:13 EDT 2012) How bout sat?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 00:31:37 EDT 2012) I can only do Friday babe:)

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 00:32:19 EDT 2012)

Well I really wanna go with Jackie but she doesn't wanna so it okay Friday good

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 00:33:21 EDT 2012) c u Friday:P

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 00:34:02 EDT 2012) K Bianca!

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 00:34:30 EDT 2012) Brianna.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 00:35:29 EDT 2012) Yea girly;)

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 14:17:56 EDT 2012) We still on for tomorrow babe;)?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 14:19:08 EDT 2012) Yea Jackie's parking for canada way time?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 14:19:35 EDT 2012)  $\bf 7~bbz$ 

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 14:20:14 EDT 2012) Were? Wanna cum smoke tonite

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 14:20:59 EDT 2012) Yeah, were?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 14:21:41 EDT 2012) Frat house elmo

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 14:21:57 EDT 2012) Sry, im allergic.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 14:22:37 EDT 2012) To weed? Wtf

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 14:22:50 EDT 2012) **Yeah, 2 weed** 

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 14:24:45 EDT 2012) How?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 14:24:57 EDT 2012) **Dr said so.** 

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 14:26:43 EDT 2012)
That blows

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 06 14:27:11 EDT 2012) So c u 2moro?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 06 14:54:39 EDT 2012) Can we reschedule for sat? Got plans tomorrow;)

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 21:58:18 EDT 2012) **Hey watsup?** 

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:01:18 EDT 2012) Not much babe:) how r u??

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:08:42 EDT 2012) Bored wanna chill. U in?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:10:36 EDT 2012) Omg I'd love to! But theres something you need 2 know first...

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:11:10 EDT 2012) Yea?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:11:41 EDT 2012) Wait have u herd from Jackie?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:11:46 EDT 2012) I'm a guy.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:13:03 EDT 2012) Wat?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:13:50 EDT 2012)
"If asked what gender I am, I say, ""male""."

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:18:10 EDT 2012) Wtf don't even joke like that bianca

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:18:42 EDT 2012)

My name is Brianna, not Bianca. Except, it's not Brianna, either. Because I'm a guy.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:20:33 EDT 2012) And your a fucken dude? I that you were Jackie's friend

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:21:02 EDT 2012) I am. And Jackie doesn't really like you.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:24:29 EDT 2012) Yea she does. Fuck you. You dont fucken know anything Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:25:21 EDT 2012)

Actually, I do know. Ryan's not a football player. I should know, seeing as I'm him.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:27:18 EDT 2012)

Your Ryan. Jesus fucken christ.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:27:57 EDT 2012)

So for Jackie's sake, please just lay off. I understand that you really like her, but I don't think it's reciprocated.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:27:59 EDT 2012)

Wat the fuck who the fuck are you? Wat the fck does she see in you. You fucken preten to be a fucken girl

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:29:42 EDT 2012)

You don't fucken know anything wtf you must be gay you fucken passed her up you don't know what the fuck your missin why do you think I'm tryin so fucken hard?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:30:13 EDT 2012)

You fucked this up for me. Just fucken stay out of her life so she can get the fuck over you and move onto me

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:30:58 EDT 2012)

And it's coming off as creepy. It won't work. And we're still friends, and she's moving on. But it won't be to you if you keep acting the way you do towards her. You act like you're entitled to her.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:31:44 EDT 2012)

No you cant be friends with her fuck off leave her the fuck alone

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:32:51 EDT 2012)

You got your shot you fucked up now leave her thefuck alone so she can have a real man

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:33:38 EDT 2012)

I am friends with her, though. And I plan on staying friends with her. A real man wouldn't challenge other men and try to get them to cut all ties to somebody because he perceives them as a threat. Jackie isn't interested.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:35:19 EDT 2012)

Yes she is fuck off. She fell for your faggot ass and realized Wat a mistake it was now she sees guys like you are fuckers and she shouldnt have ever liked you

 $Haven\ Monahan\ to\ Ryan\ Duffin:\ (Thu\ Sep\ 13\ 22:35:50\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

She told me about you dude and none of it was flattering

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:36:12 EDT 2012)

Take my advice on this. Move on. She's not interested.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:38:59 EDT 2012)

01/02:No fuck you. It takes a heartless fucken as shole to mess with someone whos sick. If she died tomorrow uoud be the fuker who broke her heart. Shes special

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:39:04 EDT 2012)

02/02:and thats why I'm going after her. No one understands life like her

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:40:41 EDT 2012)

She just had a cold, bro. A cold that I caught.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:42:25 EDT 2012)

01/02:Do you even know? Shes got lupus shes really sick dude why do you think shes on so many fucken meds I met her in Chem but I volunteer at the clinic thats

 $Haven\ Monahan\ to\ Ryan\ Duffin:\ (Thu\ Sep\ 13\ 22:42:34\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

02/02:how I got to know her I thot you were her friend

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:44:38 EDT 2012)

Jackie's sick but it makes her this kickass person shes phenomenal and your a fuck so leave her the fuck alone. Se doesn't need people like you in her life

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:47:59 EDT 2012) Yea thats Wat I thought.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 22:48:30 EDT 2012)

Oh, I just don't have time to convince you to give it up.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 22:50:06 EDT 2012)

Fuck you. You arent really her friend. If you were youd understand that shes not the type of girl you give up on.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 13 23:58:42 EDT 2012)

Way to get me in trouble fuckhead.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 13 23:59:07 EDT 2012)

Shouldn't have said anything about it, I suppose.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:03:38 EDT 2012)

You fucken bet your ass you shouldtve I figured if you were her friend she would tell you shit but now you just got her fucken pissed as shit at me

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 14 00:09:26 EDT 2012)

Okay, I should explain. I didn't realize that you knew her as well as it seems like you do. She made it seem like you saw her once and became infatuated. I am so sorry for everything I did to try to get you away from her.

 $Ryan\ Duffin\ to\ Haven\ Monahan:$  (Fri Sep 14 $00{:}10{:}58\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

Uh... Scratch that. I still don't think she's interested.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:10:59 EDT 2012)

I did but thats not the point. I got to know her from other people and Wat they say and we talked once or twice and I knew she was it

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:12:05 EDT 2012)

I read her will and she left all her stuff to kids in honduras. Thats a special person

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 14 00:14:25 EDT 2012)

If I were you, I'd really stop disclosing personal details.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:16:06 EDT 2012)

Why? Cuz you dont care? Her file tells alot about her. Shit you obviously dont know

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 14 00:16:41 EDT 2012)

"And ""shit"" that, from the sound of it, you're legally obligated not to share. "

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:16:42 EDT 2012) nd I haven't listened to te tapes yet so idk everything

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:22:35 EDT 2012)

Nah I didnt sign that shit sposed to but never got around to it

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:22:56 EDT 2012)

Guess my boss never noticed

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:26:41 EDT 2012)

Wats a labotomy?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 14 00:27:21 EDT 2012)

Look it up.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:29:45 EDT 2012)

Is it blood? I fucken hate blood that shit is nasty

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:31:12 EDT 2012)

The hot girls is the only reason I workd at the health center then I met jackie and new she was the one

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 14 00:31:52 EDT 2012)

In which case, I wish you the best of luck.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:33:00 EDT 2012)

"Well get the fuck outta her life then tool and let her realize what we Got"

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 14 00:33:26 EDT 2012)

It's nothing to do with me anymore. Really.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:35:49 EDT 2012)

Yes it does. She still likes you. I can tell by the way she talks about you. She always says good stuff even wen your being a fucker.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:36:30 EDT 2012)

When you break her heart and she still cares about you anddosnt hate you thats when you know what kinda person she is

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:46:55 EDT 2012)

Fuck you man I fucken know my planets

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:37:47 EDT 2012)

I'm not textin you cuz i like you im txtin you to see if youv seen Jackie

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:38:02 EDT 2012)

She hasnt been in all weekend

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:38:27 EDT 2012) I don't know.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:38:59 EDT 2012)

You dont know if youv seen her? Wtf?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:39:23 EDT 2012)

I mean I'm not sure where she is. I think she went out of town.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:40:36 EDT 2012)

Where? all week? Is it out of service area?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:40:51 EDT 2012)

No idea.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:41:22 EDT 2012)

I sent her more flowers but she never texted me so idk if she got them

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:41:45 EDT 2012)

Well, that sounds nice anyway.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:43:15 EDT 2012)

Yea iv spent \$300 on flowers and chocolate but shes been with that Kyle guy now that shes over you and idk what he did with her. He took her somewhere

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:43:35 EDT 2012)

Should I call it in?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:43:49 EDT 2012)

I haven't heard anything about it, I was gone this weekend. Call it in? What's that mean?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:45:13 EDT 2012)

Cuz he took her so she's missing i already looke at her file and Alexander took her and she was missing so the police know shes at risk

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:46:36 EDT 2012)

She asked me if I could go to the library tonight, and I said no, but I assume she's in.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:47:26 EDT 2012)

So shes here? Kyle didnt take her out of town? I thot you said she was away

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:48:03 EDT 2012)

She left for the weekend, but she's back.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:48:53 EDT 2012)

Im calling it in cuz I went by her dorm earlier and she wasnt there and her friend said she was with that Kyle kid she was with on friday

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:49:11 EDT 2012)

I really don't think you need to.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:49:49 EDT 2012)

Im going by again to see if she's there and if not im callin the police

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:49:54 EDT 2012) That Kyle kid isn't gonna take her away from me

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:50:40 EDT 2012) You already did that but now that your done its my shot

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:50:55 EDT 2012) By all means.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:51:42 EDT 2012)

Thanks wait who are you? Your names ryan, rite? Are you a football player?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:51:54 EDT 2012) I don't play football, no.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:52:23 EDT 2012) Then what do you play? Your a athlete rite?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:52:38 EDT 2012) No, I'm not. I like to run, but I don't do sports.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:53:19 EDT 2012) Then why did she like you? You don't swim?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:53:30 EDT 2012) Oh your the music dude

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:53:40 EDT 2012) Yeah, I'm probably the music dude.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:54:10 EDT 2012) She said your talented. Props dude music was never my thing

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:54:26 EDT 2012) **Hey, thanks.** 

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:54:56 EDT 2012) Her friend Sara said she's in Canada with Kyle

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 16 23:55:43 EDT 2012)

Yea she does that music shit but I like to listen not play. If it means a lot to her gues it's good. Thot you said she was in town? Sara said she was in canada

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Sep 16 23:56:52 EDT 2012)

Maybe she is. I really don't think you need to file a report, if anything.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Mon Sep 17 00:00:55 EDT 2012)

She called shes in Canada to see her friend from Toronto but she said you were getting all her work

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Mon Sep 17 00:01:28 EDT 2012)

I just got a text asking me to do that for her, so that makes sense.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Mon Sep 17 00:02:32 EDT 2012)

O ok so I won't call it in. Next time you see her ask her if she liked the flowers

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Mon Sep 17 00:02:57 EDT 2012)

I'll make sure to ask. Anyway, I need to get some sleep, so I'm going to bed now.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Mon Sep 17 00:03:54 EDT 2012)

K thanks man nite

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 18 19:49:18 EDT 2012)

Have you seen jacqueline? I went by her doorm and she's not there

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Tue Sep 18 20:41:43 EDT 2012)

I thought she was in Canada.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 18 20:43:35 EDT 2012)

01/02:I went by the afc today to see if she was still in Canada and she was back she said she took a early flight home but I could tell she was lying shes a bad

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 18 20:43:43 EDT 2012)

02/02: liar i think something's up and thats why she cut her trip short

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 18 20:43:49 EDT 2012)

And now she's not in her dorm

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Tue Sep 18 20:44:27 EDT 2012)

No clue. I'm at a rehearsal right now, so I can't really talk about it.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 18 20:45:47 EDT 2012)

Rehearsal for wat? Man ill text you later of shes still not back

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 18 22:25:01 EDT 2012)

Did jacqueline say if she liked the flowers?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Tue Sep 18 22:26:01 EDT 2012)

I haven't heard.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 18 22:39:26 EDT 2012)

I found her she was at old cabell recording. I just got us tickets to theory of a deadman at the national. Do you think shell like it?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 01:13:22 EDT 2012)

Have you seen Jacqueline tonight?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 01:17:28 EDT 2012)

No. I have not.

 $Haven\ Monahan\ to\ Ryan\ Duffin:\ (Thu\ Sep\ 20\ 01:29:03\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

Im worried she hasn't texted me back

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 19:31:57 EDT 2012)

Damn Jacqueline is beautiful. I'm tellin u man I could watch this girl eat pizza forever

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 21:36:54 EDT 2012)

She talked to me a lot today I think she likes me now

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 21:38:13 EDT 2012)

Well hey, good for you!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 21:47:08 EDT 2012)

Thanks did she say anything to you?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 21:50:43 EDT 2012)

About me?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 21:51:06 EDT 2012)

No, she hasn't. I didn't really see her much today, though.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 21:52:55 EDT 2012)

Can u ask her? Cuz I'm gonna ask her to be my girlfriend. Im giving her my class ring

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 21:53:37 EDT 2012)

Ask her if she's interested?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 21:54:07 EDT 2012)

Ask her if she loves me

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 21:54:17 EDT 2012)

I'll ask.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 21:58:15 EDT 2012)

She said no.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 21:58:23 EDT 2012)

Thanks man

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 21:58:33 EDT 2012)

Was it a maybe no?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 21:58:49 EDT 2012)

I think it was a no no. Sorry, man.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 21:59:29 EDT 2012)

Are you sure you asked right? Maybe she was sayin no to goin out with you

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 21:59:55 EDT 2012)

O well I'll keep tryin. Guess she's not ready for forever yet and thats ok I'll give her time

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 22:00:13 EDT 2012)

I hope it all works out for you.

 $Haven\ Monahan\ to\ Ryan\ Duffin:\ (Thu\ Sep\ 20\ 22:00:51\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

It will. I know we're meant to be together she just has to figure that out

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 23:28:25 EDT 2012)

We decided she needs time. She was pissefd cuz I ate dinner with her wtf

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 23:28:46 EDT 2012)

Well, good luck anyway.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 23:30:48 EDT 2012)

She's very temperamental. My ex gf love wen I got her flowers an shit. Jackie doesn't like any of it.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 23:32:00 EDT 2012)

Maybe im not thinkin big enough. Do u know a girl named Sarah? Shes friends w Jackie and she won't text me back

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 23:32:30 EDT 2012)

I don't know anybody named Sarah, sorry.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 23:34:23 EDT 2012)

Wel idk what I did wrong. I asked her if it was cuz of you and she said omg no and looked grossed out so she dosbt still like u. Is it that Fred guy in Canada?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 23:36:40 EDT 2012)

I honestly don't know.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 23:38:24 EDT 2012)

01/02:She prob still likes u. Cause she kept sayin that your nice and smart. May be she jus doesn't wanna admit it cuz she knows u don't like her. Im gona have

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 23:38:29 EDT 2012) 02/02:sara ask her

 ${\it Haven~Monahan~to~Ryan~Duffin:}~{\rm (Thu~Sep~20~23:41:13~EDT~2012)}$ 

02/02: friends. Way to fuck up my relationship man

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 23:41:18 EDT 2012)

01/02:Sarah said she does. Sarah said that Jackie never likes people and when she does she really likes them but she wont tell anyone cuz she wants to be just

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 20 23:41:52 EDT 2012)

I wasn't trying to do anything. I'm sorry.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 23:43:00 EDT 2012)

Well wtf do you have that I dont? Im smart. Im a fucken stats major. And I know music. Fuck this.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 23:43:56 EDT 2012)

And Troy looked you up on fb and im better looking to.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 00:25:35 EDT 2012)

Where the fuck is jackie.?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 00:25:54 EDT 2012)

No clue.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 00:26:36 EDT 2012)

Well tell her im fucken lookin for her.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 00:26:52 EDT 2012)

She never fucken responds to me.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 16:47:11 EDT 2012)

Do you know where Jacqueline is?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 16:47:36 EDT 2012)

Nope.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 16:48:12 EDT 2012)

Can u call her?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 16:48:36 EDT 2012)

Not in a position to, sorry.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 16:49:29 EDT 2012)

Wtf are u fucking or something? If your not in class call her.

 $Ryan\ Duffin\ to\ Haven\ Monahan:\ (Fri\ Sep\ 21\ 16:50:10\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

I can't right now, I'm busy.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 16:52:44 EDT 2012)

I'm gonna go look for her. She didnt check in today. Im worried. She mite be upset about last night. Tell me i you see her.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 16:56:49 EDT 2012)

Se said she downtown she needs her medication is he with Kyle?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 16:56:55 EDT 2012)

She with kyle

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 16:57:03 EDT 2012)

I don't know.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 17:07:10 EDT 2012)

Are she and kyle dating exclusively?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 17:09:27 EDT 2012)

I really don't know anything about it.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 17:11:16 EDT 2012)

I thotnyou were her best friend. Shouldnt you know this shit

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 17:11:31 EDT 2012)

It doesn't mean I know everything.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 18:17:29 EDT 2012)

Well ask her

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 18:25:42 EDT 2012)

Did u ask?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 19:32:43 EDT 2012)

I just ran into Jackie and she said you convinced her to give me a shot! Thanks man your awesome! Idk what you said but it worked:)

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 19:35:12 EDT 2012) Yeah, no problem, man.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 19:44:05 EDT 2012)

02/03:she thinks I deserve a shot cuz im a good person or sumthin! Thanks! If you ever wanna chill or come to a party at DKE lemme know. Same if your rushin ill

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 19:44:35 EDT 2012)

01/03:I owe you alot. She really must respect you cuz she said she got back from dinner with you and you made her realize what kinda person she wants to be and

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 19:44:40 EDT 2012) 03/03: put in a wo

 $Haven\ Monahan\ to\ Ryan\ Duffin:$  (Fri Sep 21 19:45:11 EDT 2012) rd for ya

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 19:47:02 EDT 2012) Glad to hear it.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 19:47:34 EDT 2012) Yea lemme know during rush if your interested

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 19:58:43 EDT 2012) I'll let you know!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 21:03:56 EDT 2012) Is Duffin your last name?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 21:05:36 EDT 2012) Yeah, it is.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 21:53:06 EDT 2012)

Where should I take her out? She said 5 guys or subway but I was thinking about the old mill room at boars head inn, do you think she'll like it?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 21:55:39 EDT 2012)

Or foressts at keswick hall...which one do u think she'll like more?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 21:56:14 EDT 2012)

I don't know where those places are, actually. I'm sure she'd like anything.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 21:57:32 EDT 2012)

http://www.keswick.com/fossetts.aspx

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 21:58:33 EDT 2012) http://www.boarsheadinn.com/Dining/The-Old-Mill-Room.asp

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 21:58:51 EDT 2012) **Both of those look nice.** 

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 21:59:41 EDT 2012)

But u know her better then me. Does she like fancy stuff like most girls?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 22:00:05 EDT 2012) She certainly wouldn't have a problem with it.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 22:06:29 EDT 2012)

Ok cool. Cuz she doesnt like flowers. Or chocolate. Or the shit most girls like. Shes weird but challengin thats why I like her

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Fri Sep 21 22:06:46 EDT 2012) I hope it goes well for you.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 21 22:11:37 EDT 2012)

Thanks an who knows maybe ill get lucky. If I get some action I owe it to you man!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sat Sep 22 20:29:23 EDT 2012) Is Jackie with you?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 10:54:40 EDT 2012)

Happy birthday man I just saw Jacqueline and she said yesterday was your bday how old are u?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 27 11:59:01 EDT 2012) Thanks, man! Just turned 18.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 14:44:48 EDT 2012)

So your a youngin! Hows it feel to be an adult? Whatd you get for your birthday?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:02:05 EDT 2012)

01/02:Where's jackie when you need her? I can't do my own laundry. I have nightmares about this shit! Darks, easy. Whites, easy. But what about my white shirt

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:02:14 EDT 2012) 02/02:with black stripes? Wat then!?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 27 15:03:20 EDT 2012)

I don't really know what to do about that...

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:07:05 EDT 2012)

Find Jackie! Women know this. Tomorrow night is our big night. Tomorrow night I plan on wooing her and, by gum, woo her I will!!

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:12:28 EDT 2012)

My favorite color is yellow and im such a happy fellow it makes me jiggle like jello hello! I'm writing a song for jackie

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Thu Sep 27 15:13:00 EDT 2012)

Hey, that's cool. I hope you have a good time!

 $Haven\ Monahan\ to\ Ryan\ Duffin:$  (Thu Sep 27 15:21:11 EDT 2012)

02/03:Cherokee, but that's not really what's important. Gandhi is a master at solving all conflicts peacefully. Now the first thing we need to do is start a

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:21:16 EDT 2012) 03/03:dialogue between

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:22:12 EDT 2012)

01/03:Thanks. I think i know how to solve your problems with Jackie. I've been reading a lot about this guy named gandhi. Now gandhis an Indian. I think hes a

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:22:17 EDT 2012)

The 2 of you

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 16:02:39 EDT 2012)

01/02:Now that your 18 you gotta know stuff. sex is like a bike without training wheels. Try it before you're ready, your gonna fall off and break your head.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 16:02:49 EDT 2012) 02/02:Same goes for weed.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:00:07 EDT 2012)

That number is me. Please just call it.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:01:33 EDT 2012)

Why

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:01:47 EDT 2012)

I'll explain when you do. I just had a few questions.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:02:08 EDT 2012)

Wtf is this a habit of yourS? You pretend to be a girl you pretend to be a uva rep who the fuck are you?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:02:54 EDT 2012)

Please. I just need to talk, but I can't do it over text. I thought it might make you call. A dumb idea on my part, I know.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:03:56 EDT 2012)

Fine ill fucken call you at 8 wen I get off. But if its about jackie I dont wanna talk.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:04:22 EDT 2012)

It's not about Jackie. Hell, call me on this number at 8 if you want.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:05:59 EDT 2012)

01/02:I will but wat is it about? I won't sen u emails I left school she got tested and shes fine she promised she wouldnt report anythin if I didnt talk about

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:06:09 EDT 2012) 02/02:her or to her

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:07:30 EDT 2012)

I was more curious about water polo, and you're the only one I thought to talk to. I just don't like texting and wanted to call.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:08:59 EDT 2012)

Ask the afc they know. Ill talk but not about jackie or last friday.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:09:39 EDT 2012)

That's fine. Can I call you a little after 8? I'm not in Charlottesville right now, so I can't go to the AFC.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:10:56 EDT 2012)

Yea wat time? Im not gonna talk for long. And I need to make sure talkin to you doesn't break the deal I made with Jackie

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:11:40 EDT 2012)

It won't break the deal. I didn't even know there was one. Are you done right at 8? Because I can just call you right then if you want.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:14:06 EDT 2012) You can call me at 8:10.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:14:19 EDT 2012) Cool. Thanks.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:15:16 EDT 2012)

Fine but im not talkin for long and if you are a fucken uva rep im hanging up.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:15:57 EDT 2012) I'm not. It's just me.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 15:18:06 EDT 2012)

Ok I still gotta clear it with jackie so she dosnt go back on our deal

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:18:54 EDT 2012)

Maybe I can just text you about it. I won't tell. Like I said, I don't know about the deal.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 15:19:40 EDT 2012)

I was just curious how to get on the team. I was looking for info but I couldn't find any. What was your captain's name? I'd like to email him. Also, how do you get a job at the clinic?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 18:07:58 EDT 2012)

I tAlked to Jackie and she told me to tell u whatever you want to know cuz you dont believe her about anything anymore so wat do you want to know?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 18:20:34 EDT 2012)

Honestly, I just wanted to call you. To hear you talk and to ask a few things. I can wait until you're done with work, though.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 18:21:32 EDT 2012) Ok but why?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 18:23:57 EDT 2012) It's weird to explain over text. I can tell you later.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 18:27:37 EDT 2012) Is it about jackie?

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 18:28:01 EDT 2012) Yeah, it is, sort of.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 18:28:38 EDT 2012) She said you guys were fighting Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 18:29:06 EDT 2012)

I didn't know we were fighting. I've just been curious about some things, and you'd be able to help me out.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 18:35:58 EDT 2012)

01/02:Listen man i guess ill answer your questions wen iget off work but I think your weird and fucken creepy and id appreciate it if youd delete my number

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 18:36:09 EDT 2012) 02/02:after this.

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 18:37:20 EDT 2012) That's no problem. I'll delete it.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 18:38:12 EDT 2012) Thanks. Im off at 8.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 19:07:38 EDT 2012) I actually get off in 15 mins

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 19:11:11 EDT 2012)

Okay. Could you call me then? I won't risk disturbing you while you're at work.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 19:12:39 EDT 2012) Ok

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 19:25:12 EDT 2012) U know I play inner tube water polo rite?

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 19:25:38 EDT 2012) I couldnt hear u that well

Ryan Duffin to Haven Monahan: (Sun Oct 07 19:26:30 EDT 2012) Oh. I didn't know that. Thanks for letting me know.

Haven Monahan to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 19:27:06 EDT 2012) Idk of that makes a difference

# **Exhibit D**

Name: Jackie redacted

Phone: redacted

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 04 20:37:40 EDT 2012)

So creepy kid did not just send me 1 but 11 pictures of himself. What the poop.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 04 20:45:53 EDT 2012)

\*not 1 but 11

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Sep 04 21:40:58 EDT 2012)

He never even texted me back!

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 04 21:43:18 EDT 2012)

What a bummer! He has been freakishly persistent with me for the past 2 hours! Count yourself lucky.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:19:30 EDT 2012)

Apparently a girl in havens chem class named Brianna is texting him and he asked if I knew her:P just so happened to be your number lol

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:22:12 EDT 2012)

Yeah, he just started texting me and wants to know how I got his number.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:22:19 EDT 2012)

Just roll with it.

 $Jackie \operatorname{\mathsf{redacted}}\ to\ Ryan\ Duffin:\ (\operatorname{Wed\ Sep}\ 05\ 00:22:52\ \operatorname{EDT}\ 2012)$ 

Oh boy.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:23:49 EDT 2012)

Mkay I haven't said anything back for like 2 hours so I'm not going to respond he's so creepy

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:24:45 EDT 2012)

Are you still talking to him?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:25:08 EDT 2012)

No, I don't know how to respond to the whole phone number thing.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:26:08 EDT 2012)

Lol say from his friend Troy he keeps saying how his friend Troy gives all these random girls his numbers and he doesn't like any of them

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:30:03 EDT 2012)

Okay, let's see if this works.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:30:56 EDT 2012)

He's an idiot. It will haha

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:31:18 EDT 2012)

Yeah, it is. This is hilarious.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:32:07 EDT 2012)

"Oh, I'm just getting back from Glee Club now, too. Figured I should let you know, seeing as you asked. My name is ""Pocket."""

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:33:14 EDT 2012)

Bahahahahaha pocket? Awhh that's cute(: so why pocket? Is there some significance there??

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:33:38 EDT 2012)

It's mostly random. It beats most of the other names they gave out tonight.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:34:43 EDT 2012)

"He's asking if I know you. I said I wanted to see him on Friday, and he said, ""no, there's this girl named Jackie.""

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:35:58 EDT 2012)

Oh dear lord. I want to warp myself into another galaxy

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:36:23 EDT 2012)

"He thinks you're just messing with him by saying no. He said, ""No offense Brianna, but you're probably not my type. I really like Jackie. She's deep.""

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:36:25 EDT 2012)

Maybe I should get extensive facial surgery and change my name to Lucy or something

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:42:46 EDT 2012)

Haven just wrote me a novel. He wants advice on you.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:43:59 EDT 2012)

He's in love with you because you were listening to Safetysuit and Coheed & Cambria.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:44:45 EDT 2012)

Gahh. Tell him to get a life! And a new personality while he's at it!

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:45:43 EDT 2012)

Shit. I don't know Safetysuit that well. What's a good song of theirs?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:46:23 EDT 2012)

Uhm anywhere but here or stay or something I said are ones I like

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:47:10 EDT 2012)

I knew Stay. I'm going with that.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:47:40 EDT 2012)

Lol good choice

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted. (Wed Sep 05 00:48:24 EDT 2012)

I think he may be starting to like me. At what point do I become an asshole for doing this?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:49:31 EDT 2012)

Never mind, he still likes you.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:49:37 EDT 2012)

Probably none considering he's a total narcissistic douchebag.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:49:58 EDT 2012)

Trust me. He'll probably start sending you pictures of himself

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:51:01 EDT 2012)

He's still asking for advice about you, to which I'm just telling him that he should go out with

me.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:54:39 EDT 2012)

Lol good please get him to leave me alone! Tell him I sound stupid and like a waste of his time

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 00:55:11 EDT 2012)

He's complaining about... actually, I think he's complaining about me.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 00:55:46 EDT 2012)

Wait what? You as in Brianna? Or you?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie  $^{\mathsf{redacted}}$ : (Wed Sep 05 00:56:28 EDT 2012)

Me as in Ryan. Or Pocket, whichever you prefer.

Jackie redacted<sub>to</sub> Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:01:14 EDT 2012)

Haha I prefer pocket:) why is he complaining about you?

 $Ryan\ Duffin\ to\ Jackie\ redacted:\ (Wed\ Sep\ 05\ 01:01:32\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

Did you tell him anything about me?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:05:04 EDT 2012)

Kind of....Ahh this is embarrassing. I didn't use your name!

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 01:05:57 EDT 2012)

Haha. It works as an excuse. He still thinks he's going to get a date with you, though.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:06:26 EDT 2012) **He's an idiot.** 

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 01:07:21 EDT 2012)

Yup. I'm not sure I'm getting any more texts from him tonight, at any rate. I think I'm going to have to go to bed so I'm not late for class tomorrow.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 01:09:08 EDT 2012)

Wait... I just got a bunch of photos.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:14:32 EDT 2012)

Ew gross. He's so full of himself. I called Verizon and got his number blocked but then he started texting me from some other number. So.unbelievably.creepy.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 01:15:34 EDT 2012)

"He's telling me to text you to find out what you think of him. He also wants Brianna's help in getting rid of the ""faggot first year"" who he assumes is a football player. "

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:18:02 EDT 2012)

Thank god you are not a football player. He is in serious need of a clue. I don't like him because he's cocky and rude and superficial and everything I try to avoid in a person. But in his mind his alleged good looks make up for all of that. And in Kathryn's kind too.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:19:09 EDT 2012)

Kathryn's trying to convince me to date him ever since she saw his picture. I think he's ugly and a douche but apparently that doesn't matter if he has biceps. It's so dumb.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 01:21:34 EDT 2012)

My douche meter is off the charts right now. I refuse to believe that somebody like this could actually exist.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:23:51 EDT 2012)

Haha oh believe it. He's a frat boy. There are about 3000 more like him. It's guy like haven monahan who give other guys a bad reputation.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 01:24:57 EDT 2012)

I think I'm done with talking to Haven for the night. I'm going to bed, but I guess I'll see you tomorrow?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Sep 05 01:26:30 EDT 2012)

Mkayy(: thanks for being the good kind of guy, Ryan . Trust me, you're one in a million. Goodnight pocket:P haha that's never gonna get old

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Sep 05 22:53:25 EDT 2012)

"Also, Haven says ""he can do Friday night."""

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 11 10:47:12 EDT 2012)

Soooo not to be awkward at all but it probably will be because you probably didn't but did you send me flowers? I'm guessing no but I'd rather it be you than who I think it is even though I'm about 99% positive it wasn't you but I'm making sure

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Sep 11 10:47:41 EDT 2012)

"Haha never mind then. Haven's ""did you get the flowers?"" text confirmed everything. Great. Sorry to bother you!!"

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Sep 11 11:55:59 EDT 2012)

Oh. I just saw this text now, sorry for not responding earlier. Haven is a creepy one. Jackie redacted  $to\ Ryan\ Duffin$ : (Tue Sep 11 15:37:27 EDT 2012)

Haven has some serious problems. I have no idea how he even got my mailing address. It's concerning.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Thu Sep 13 23:59:40 EDT 2012)

Do you know Haven well?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:02:17 EDT 2012)

Uhm I guess? Idk not like I'd feel compelled to give him a kidney or anything

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted. (Fri Sep 14 00:04:00 EDT 2012)

But you know him more than you let on.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:05:05 EDT 2012)

No not really. I didn't lie about him. I don't lie. What are you getting at?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:06:14 EDT 2012)

I just had the impression that you saw him once in chemistry and that was it. But you know him better than that, so it makes him a bit less creepy. I'm not getting at anything; I'm just curious.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:10:12 EDT 2012)

I saw him once in chemistry and once again at the student health center. It's not any less creepy because both times I barely said two words to him and he imagined some strange relationship between us that clearly doesn't exist. Listen Ryan, I wasn't mad at you tonight.

I was mad at him. He had a confidentiality clause that he signed as a student employee at the health center and it's not his place to tell other people my problems. It's wrong and if I wanted people to know wouldn't I tell them?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:12:10 EDT 2012)

If you don't want people to know, take my word that I won't tell anybody. Maybe I just don't understand the disease, but to me, it's not a big deal.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:12:41 EDT 2012)

How extensive is the clause? Because he just disclosed your will to me.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:13:01 EDT 2012)

Ryan, it means I'm dying.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:13:47 EDT 2012)

Holy shit. I... I had no idea. Do you want to talk?

 $_{Jackie}$   $^{\mathsf{redacted}}{}_{to}$   $_{Ryan}$  Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:15:15 EDT 2012)

It's a big deal because people treat you differently, like you're about to break at any given moment. And it's not cause they like you and it's not cause they care...it's because you're perishable and that scares them

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:17:37 EDT 2012)

I won't tell anybody. You have my word on that. Haven, on the other hand...

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:21:13 EDT 2012)

Haha I don't have to talk about it, really. When I was 6 they found antibodies in my blood and discovered I had hashimotos disease and it's basically your body attacks your thyroid. So when you have one autoimmune disease you're more prone to others. So I got raynauds and when I was 15 got diagnosed with lupus and now my body slowly and surely disintegrates

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:21:44 EDT 2012)

It sucks but hey, yolo:P haha

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:23:57 EDT 2012)

And yes I'm considering investing in a muzzle for haven

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:24:02 EDT 2012)

Wow. Gives you a whole new perspective, I guess. Also, he says he never signed the non disclosure statement.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:26:15 EDT 2012)

Oh awesome. At this rate the entire population of china will know the breakdown of t4 levels in my pee. Lol maybe a lobotomy would be better suited for him:P

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:27:01 EDT 2012)

I'm going to pretend I know what t4 is. And no, you don't need to tell me what it actually is.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:27:15 EDT 2012)

He also just asked me what a lobotomy is.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:27:42 EDT 2012)

Haha I won't I promise haven will fill you in I'm guessing

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:28:18 EDT 2012)

Bahahahahaha oh geez I told him that's the medical treatment his doctor recommended

 $Ryan\ Duffin\ to\ Jackie\ {\it redacted}:\ ({\it Fri\ Sep\ 14\ 00:28:31\ EDT\ 2012})$ 

I just told him to look it up.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:30:31 EDT 2012)

Idk if he knows how to use a dictionary....I feel it'd be entertaining to see him try though

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:32:02 EDT 2012)

I think I'm just going to stop texting him.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:34:27 EDT 2012)

It's the only way to salvage your sanity. I told him I'm not the girl for him. He needs someone who's perky and happy all the time. Maybe someone who's had part of her brain removed and thinks she's a bunny and then they can go off and be bunnies together.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:34:57 EDT 2012)

They could even wear little bunny costumes.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:38:27 EDT 2012)

"I can see it now, it'd be a beautiful thing. He just can't seem to grasp the concept that I don't like him. As if it's humanly impossible. He like ""wait you dont want to be with me?"" and I feel like saying ""no that's not it. I want to get as far away from you as virtually possible. I would actually like to put you on a rocket ship and launch you to planet flaglooga"""

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:39:53 EDT 2012)

He'll realize it eventually... maybe.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:40:56 EDT 2012)

"His response:

"

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:41:22 EDT 2012)

Flaglooga? Wat ones that? They said pluto isnt one anymore how come?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:41:55 EDT 2012)

How... How did he get into UVA?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:42:38 EDT 2012)

Omg I have no idea. How is he a chemistry major??

 $\textit{Ryan Duffin to Jackie} \ \text{redacted}; \ (Fri\ Sep\ 14\ 00:43:05\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

Well, he's obviously not an astronomy major.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:43:50 EDT 2012)

It's okay though a boy in my criminology class thought panda bears were extinct since polar bears descended from them:P he's going places

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:44:18 EDT 2012)

My faith in my school's population is plummeting.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:45:53 EDT 2012)

His friend proceeded to tell him that koala bears are actually extinct and panda bears are just fat raccoons. They were on the lacrosse team though so maybe they have some kind of concussion or cerebral hemorrhage excuse

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:46:08 EDT 2012) Still not sure how we were bumped up to #24

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 14 00:46:54 EDT 2012)

Well, I need to get some sleep; I have a midterm tomorrow. Have a safe trip!

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 14 00:48:06 EDT 2012) Mkay thanks you too(: goodnight!

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Thu Sep 20 22:26:00 EDT 2012) You coming soon?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 22:27:29 EDT 2012) Yes I'm on my way I'm sorry haven stopped by.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Thu Sep 20 22:28:10 EDT 2012) That's dedication right there.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 20 22:28:51 EDT 2012) Oh my gosh stop. I made him cry

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Thu Sep 20 22:29:00 EDT 2012) Oh crap.

Jackie redacted  $to\ Ryan\ Duffin:$  (Thu Sep 20 22:29:06 EDT 2012) I feel like a horrible person

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Thu Sep 20 22:29:21 EDT 2012) **Don't. We tried telling him.** 

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:25:40 EDT 2012) Are you mad at me?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:41:23 EDT 2012) I'm really sorry for whatever I did!

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Thu Sep 27 15:43:12 EDT 2012) Why would I be mad?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:45:44 EDT 2012)

I don't know! Haven sent me this long text about conflict resolution and how you need to explain to me why you're angry or something strange

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:46:01 EDT 2012)

It was really bizarre but once you boiled down his peaceful dialogue mumbo jumbo it sounded like you were mad at me

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Thu Sep 27 15:46:26 EDT 2012)

He sent me the same thing. I just didn't say anything about it. No idea what he's talking about.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:50:07 EDT 2012)

He's so weird. Did he tell you that Gandhi was part of the Iroquois Indian tribe too?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Thu Sep 27 15:50:24 EDT 2012)

He told me it was Cherokee.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 15:50:52 EDT 2012)

"And he said Martin Luther king ""traveled all the way from Africa to make this country peaceful"" I think he needs to brush up on his history "

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Thu Sep 27 22:50:31 EDT 2012)

Well it's closer than iroquois. He's a head case. So you never told me what's up with you and nick being all buddy buddy??

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 28 15:44:13 EDT 2012)

Hey what are you doing tonight?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 28 15:57:25 EDT 2012)

Probably just catching up on work before I leave tomorrow. Why?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 28 20:23:39 EDT 2012)

Just wondering. What are you doing now?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 28 20:23:52 EDT 2012)

Just doing some work. Why?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 28 23:35:04 EDT 2012)

Hey they're walking me home so you're fine just have fun with glee club! Sorry I bothered you

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 28 23:36:42 EDT 2012)

I want to know what's going on.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Fri Sep 28 23:37:20 EDT 2012)

I just got back.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Fri Sep 28 23:39:30 EDT 2012)

Nothing is going on I promise I feel really stupid cause I ran to you and I always run to you

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sat Sep 29 10:11:38 EDT 2012)

Ryan you know you are my favorite person of all time and I trust you more than anything in the world. I just need time to clear my head and I will go and report it. I need to do it when I'm ready though. And right now I'm not. Right now I just need someone to hug me and give me chocolate or something and in a few hours or a few days I'll be ready

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sat Sep 29 10:12:35 EDT 2012)

I don't care if anything happens to Haven or the other guys anymore. I just need to see that you're okay.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sat Sep 29 10:14:38 EDT 2012)

I will be, I promise. I just want you to have fun this weekend and be gleeful(: I'll be fine, I always am(:

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sat Sep 29 15:48:38 EDT 2012)

### I went to the woman's center

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sat Sep 29 15:50:04 EDT 2012) **How did it go?** 

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sat Sep 29 15:53:40 EDT 2012)

I don't even know. They asked me all of my past sexual history and if I sleep around here and if I was drinking or on drugs and they kept asking me why I hadn't used the golden rule of never going to a party alone and I should've been with a group and why was I there and did I know anyone....they asked like a billion questions at once and I told them I didn't want to press charges and they said the frat is out of Charlottesville police jurisdiction anyway and they referred me to their counseling department, SARA and CAPs

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sat Sep 29 15:54:58 EDT 2012)

The woman I talked to was kindof a big time bitch...idk what she's doing working there. She has no bedside manner whatsoever

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sat Sep 29 15:55:29 EDT 2012)

I hope you're at least a little better b

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sat Sep 29 15:55:35 EDT 2012)

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sat Sep 29 16:01:33 EDT 2012)

Yeah I'll be fine I think the best thing for me to do is to not think about it or overanalyze it or obsess over it...just to move on

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sat Sep 29 16:02:08 EDT 2012) **Probably, yeah.** 

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 30 12:43:32 EDT 2012)

"Oh and Kathryn knows because she got upset that we were excluding her when she is ""supposed to be our friend"" so Alex and I were honest with her and she proceeded to tell everyone in her hall. "

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Sep 30 12:43:54 EDT 2012)

Case in point as to why you didn't tell her.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 30 22:08:52 EDT 2012)

Haven came by and apologized

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Sep 30 22:09:30 EDT 2012)

Did it do any good? I wouldn't expect it to.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 30 22:12:17 EDT 2012)

Well he asked for a second chance and I said pffft no way but I told him I forgave him for what happened friday night and then he thanked me for not reporting him which made me feel weird but the bottom line is I'm bad at being angry at other people so all I can do is forgive them

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Sep 30 22:12:44 EDT 2012) That's not a bad trait to have.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 30 22:18:36 EDT 2012)

Haha my grandmother always used to get mad at me for it and said I let people walk all over me but I'm just not good at being mad or upset. And in spite of everything, I still think people are really good at heart and just make bad choices but that doesn't make them bad people, right?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Sep 30 22:21:30 EDT 2012) Just misguided people.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Sep 30 22:35:15 EDT 2012)

Yeah but I think you're right...they're misguided. And I think that means they need kindness the most. And you were right earlier. It's all going to be fine.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Sep 30 22:37:45 EDT 2012) So good to hear you say that.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Mon Oct 01 21:25:01 EDT 2012) Heyy what are you doing??

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 08:28:59 EDT 2012) I was asleep, sorry.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 10:37:35 EDT 2012)

You're fine. I just wanted to tell you that Haven left school. like he dropped out

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 10:38:12 EDT 2012)

Wow. He also emailed me your will. I didn't read it. I'll delete it if you'd like.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 12:08:44 EDT 2012)

What the poop? Lol no you're fine I don't care if you read it...he's just so weird. Did he give you a reason as to why he emailed you that stuff??

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 12:08:49 EDT 2012)

And how on gods green earth did he get your email??

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 12:10:21 EDT 2012)

He said that you would rather me have it than him. You can look up emails at UVA by name.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 13:48:59 EDT 2012)

Oh well that's not comforting. Honestly id rather you have it than him too. I feel sort of bad though like I'm the reason he left...what exactly did he send you??

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 13:49:46 EDT 2012)

"Oh and my mom got me mutemath tickets to make me feel better about my ""situation"" haha "

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 13:50:48 EDT 2012)

Some essay or something (again, didn't read it, but maybe you know what it is) and a PDF of the will. Mutemath is an incredible show.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 13:58:53 EDT 2012)

Have you seen them live before?? Is it just you and ashley going? What essay? What does it say just out of curiosity? And how does he get all of this stuff? Like is it something I wrote? Sorry for all the questions:P

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 14:00:10 EDT 2012)

I have seen then before. I think it may have just been me and Ashley, possibly somebody else from my hall. Not sure. I didn't read what the essay says, but skimming over it, there's a Palanahuik quote.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 14:04:01 EDT 2012)

Yepp thats something I wrote. Haven never read fight club. Do you mind if I come with you guys?? I dont want to crash or anything....

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 14:04:28 EDT 2012)

That should be fine. I don't see why not.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 14:35:20 EDT 2012)

Thanks I appreciate it. Are you busy tonight for like an hour after glee club?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 14:36:28 EDT 2012)

I might be at Glee Club really late tonight, actually. I have a rehearsal for the a Capella group, too. Why?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 14:39:25 EDT 2012)

Oh you're fine then. Just Alex and Kathryn needed help and I have work until 11 so don't worry about it! When do I get to come hear your gleeful singing??(:

 $Ryan\ Duffin\ to\ Jackie\ redacted:\ (Tue\ Oct\ 02\ 14:39:44\ EDT\ 2012)$ 

Uh... family weekend, I think?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 14:42:10 EDT 2012)

"Oh what a bummer! I'm working that weekend cause apparently I'm the only kid at Uva whose parents aren't coming.

I'll make Alex record it:P are you going to go caroling around Christmas??"

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 14:44:04 EDT 2012)

I have no idea. It would be cool, though.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 14:51:34 EDT 2012)

Well even if glee club doesn't carol together, I demand that you show up on my doorstep dressed as an elf singing gleefully, Mkayy??

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 15:02:45 EDT 2012) Okay. I will.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 15:08:48 EDT 2012)

I'm going to hold you to that:) it can be my Christmas present and I'm sure it will be the most enjoyable thing I've seen all year!

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 16:31:34 EDT 2012)

Ryan can you meet me outside of gooch? Sorry

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Tue Oct 02 16:31:51 EDT 2012) Yeah.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 16:44:42 EDT 2012)

If I'm not there I'm on my way and I'll be there in a second!

 $Ryan\ Duffin\ to\ Jackie$  redacted: (Tue Oct 02 16:52:21 EDT 2012) I'm almost there.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Tue Oct 02 19:00:39 EDT 2012)

Thank you so much for helping me out earlier! Al has taken over as caretaker for the evening(: you're the best Ryan, honestly, I really appreciate it!

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Oct 03 12:27:26 EDT 2012) Do you know a lot about cats?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Oct 03 12:27:40 EDT 2012) What do you need to know?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Oct 03 12:54:09 EDT 2012) How to make her stop crying every time I leave the room

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Oct 03 12:54:48 EDT 2012)

She just needs to get used to the fact that you'll be leaving. That's all you really can do.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Oct 03 12:56:37 EDT 2012) She's so loud though! Did your cats used to do this?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Oct 03 12:56:47 EDT 2012) Yeah. All kittens do.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Oct 03 13:04:58 EDT 2012)

Well later tonight if you're not busy can you come over and help me, al and Kathryn out with this whole cat thing? How'd your psychs midterm go??

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Wed Oct 03 13:06:03 EDT 2012)

Physics? It was awful. I may be able to come over, but I have psych studies scheduled for tonight. Sorry, but I really don't have time to text right now... I have to leave for class in a half hour and I haven't done the homework.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Wed Oct 03 14:54:53 EDT 2012)

Oh sorry! Well let me know what time your psych studies are and good luck finishing your homework!

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 16:17:04 EDT 2012)
You're seriously taking like the longest poop ever

Tou te seriously taking like the longest poop ever

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 16:26:34 EDT 2012)

You know what Ryan, I've always trusted you and put you first and believed you over everyone. I have no clue what the hell happened with nick that made you suddenly distrust me and dig through my life but it's fine. I'm not mad and I'm sure you have a reason. But if you can't trust me and you feel the need to question everything because you think I somehow lied to you then we can't be friends. When you are friends with someone, you trust them. And I've always, always trusted you. And if you're manipulating people and lying to try and get some information to prove some point, go for it. I have no idea what you'll prove but go ahead. I hope you find what it is that you're looking for.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 18:29:18 EDT 2012)

Hey I tried calling but I guess you were getting your hair cut

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 18:32:47 EDT 2012) I'll have to call you later. I can't really talk now.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 18:49:28 EDT 2012) Okay that's fine

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 19:36:13 EDT 2012)

I couldn't really hear him but he though u made me up and ur a psycho

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 19:37:19 EDT 2012) Really Ryan? Wow.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 19:59:44 EDT 2012) He thought I made you up?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:00:17 EDT 2012) Oh. That's a Haven text. I see.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:01:19 EDT 2012) **Yep.** 

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:03:27 EDT 2012)

Nick and I had to consider that a possibility. It was a possibility that could make sense. We could find no evidence that Haven ever was at UVA. People Search turned up nothing. Even though he dropped out, he should still show up on it. We had more reasons. It was an answer that would actually have worked, but we wanted to be sure before we brought it up to you. I wasn't planning on Haven going and telling you, because I knew that you'd react like this.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:05:55 EDT 2012) Our friendship is over Ryan

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:06:40 EDT 2012) "Like I said on Thursday. I understand completely.

But I still don't really understand what happened here. "

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:08:44 EDT 2012) Me neither

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:09:58 EDT 2012)

I mean, take a few minutes to think about how this looked from my perspective. You told me one thing. Nick showed me the evidence to completely disprove it. But I still completely trust you. So where does that leave me, and what does it leave me to think?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:15:08 EDT 2012)

I have no idea what nick showed you though. Because I don't understand how he can disprove something that happened damnit Ryan I should have just showed you the fucking conversation and I don't know why I didn't. Want a print out? I'll have my mom call Verizon and get a bloody print out that way nothing can be edited or deleted or skewed any which way. That way you won't accuse me of something I didn't do or say or whatever

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:16:56 EDT 2012)

I'm not accusing anybody of anything. I was just trying to use my time away from everything to figure out what happened. I still don't know, and apparently I never will. Nick showed me

the whole conversation, save for a few of the early messages which his phone automatically deleted.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:17:28 EDT 2012)

And why would I want to ruin your relationship with nick when this entire time I've just been saying that I think he's a nice person? Like how does that make any sense?? Why would I lie about something like that? Oh yes, I forgot you also thought I created an entire freaking human being

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:18:02 EDT 2012) Can you delete parts of conversations? Is that possible?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:18:59 EDT 2012)

His phone can only store so many text messages before it starts deleting the old ones. As far as that first message goes, I don't know. That's why I was, and still am, so confused.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:19:59 EDT 2012)

I mean can he pick and choose what he keeps and doesn't keep? What messages you could and could not see?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:20:41 EDT 2012)

He hadn't, though. He could have, but it would have made a discontinuity within the conversation. There was none.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:26:30 EDT 2012)

It doesn't make any sense then Ryan. If you're that adamant about who's lying here and who isn't I'll have Verizon print out the conversation and you can sit down and compare them and analyze them. While I'm at it I'll go and grab haven from New Castle and drag him back to Charlottesville to prove his existence to you and then I'll give you a lengthy list of my medical records to prove whatever else on gods green earth you think I've lied about. Jesus Christ I'm the worlds worst liar! I tried to lie to my mom when I found a pretty scrunchi on the ground in the 2nd grade and I couldn't sleep and eventually told her the truth and grounded myself for 2 weeks because I felt so frigging guilty!

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:27:40 EDT 2012)

I never said you were lying. I don't need counterevidence to think you weren't. I already believe that.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:30:17 EDT 2012)

Well then what is going on? Why are we fighting? I've been accused of a lot of things in my life but lying has never been one of them, Ryan. I'm unyieldingly honest. It's a problem. I really should start lying or Robert is right, I'll never get ahead in life

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:32:25 EDT 2012)

Who's Robert? Also, I didn't know this counted as fighting. It never seemed like it to me, and I have never treated it as such. There's just such a rift between what you and Nick said. I believe both of you. I just need to figure out how I can.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:35:13 EDT 2012)

Roberts a guy I work with I've been telling him this whole story all weekend and he keeps telling me i need to wash my hands of this weirdness and get new friends and if I ever want to get ahead in life I need to learn how to lie.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:35:43 EDT 2012)

Ryan I'm swearing at you. I never swear at you. It's fighting.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:36:56 EDT 2012)

I'm not in the mindset I take when I fight. Really, I'm not. I'm just trying to reason this out. The problem is that I continually get nowhere.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:38:15 EDT 2012)

Well I'm not mad at you. I'm hurt. There's a big difference.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:40:00 EDT 2012)

But why? All I want to do is reconcile this. All I want is for it to be over.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:43:53 EDT 2012)

Okay. It's over.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:44:24 EDT 2012)

Albeit with no closure whatsoever.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:49:16 EDT 2012)

What do you want me to do, Ryan? What closure do you want?

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:49:33 EDT 2012)

I just wish I could figure out what happened.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:51:04 EDT 2012)

Well I told you my side. And I told you I'll print out the darn conversation. I don't know what else I can do.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:51:16 EDT 2012)

I don't know, either.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 20:55:12 EDT 2012)

I think it's pretty simple. We love to complicate things but it isn't supposed to be this hard. Find who it is and what it is that makes you happy and you're set. And if I can make you happy by walking away then I will. You know all I've ever wanted is for you to be happy

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 20:56:57 EDT 2012)

But where did you even get the idea that you out of the picture makes me happy? It seems like you've been operating under that assumption and it isn't true.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:03:22 EDT 2012)

Ryan, I told you where I got the idea and that's what got us into this mess. All I want is for you to be happy. I appreciate you and adore you more than you'll probably ever know and I'd do pretty much anything on the off-chance it'd make your life a little bit better. So right now I'll do whatever it is that you need me to do to make you and this okay....

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:04:09 EDT 2012)

I mean, Nick is still adamant that he said no such thing.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:04:19 EDT 2012)

And I'm inclined to trust him.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:06:45 EDT 2012)

Okay well I'm sure nick didn't intend anything and I'm glad you guys are friends and I guess

### I imagined everything.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:09:18 EDT 2012)

I never implied you imagined it.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:12:16 EDT 2012)

Oh my lanta Ryan just let me take the blame for everything so you guys can move on, okay? It's easier that way. This is all my fault, I misconstrued what nick said, and I'm crazy. The end.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:13:14 EDT 2012)

Look, if that's the way you want it, that's the way you can have it. It's not what I'd choose, but if it's what you want it to be, then so be it.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:17:09 EDT 2012)

There's no choice here.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:17:37 EDT 2012)

So... What, then?

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:19:12 EDT 2012)

So I want you to be happy.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:23:34 EDT 2012)

In which case, given the events of the past week, you might just be right. Maybe we should just call it.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:24:56 EDT 2012)

Okay if that's what you want.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:25:32 EDT 2012)

It's not what I'd prefer. Truly, it isn't. But it'll probably end up being better for both of us.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:28:16 EDT 2012)

Okay, i understand. I hope you have fun at the silversun pickups...happy birthday part 3, Ryan...

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:28:33 EDT 2012)

I can't go to that alone. You know that.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:29:52 EDT 2012)

You should bring nick or Tomy. Please you know I want you to go

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:30:09 EDT 2012)

I can't. Your name is on the bus ticket.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:31:30 EDT 2012)

You have to go, Ryan. Please.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:33:49 EDT 2012)

I can't, though. I was going to give them to you, because you paid for them, you ordered them, and you could call Greyhound to change the ticket name on mine to anybody. Whoever you want.

Jackie redacted to Ryan Duffin: (Sun Oct 07 21:43:51 EDT 2012)

No that's not fair. And that's not what I want. I got those for you because I wanted you to have an incredible 18th birthday and it means a lot to me that you do. You know how much I care about you and the way I feel about you and you know how hard I tried to get those tickets for you. I got them for you. Not me. You. Because it meant something to me. You meant something to me. And no matter what happens with us and our friendship you'll always mean something to me.

Ryan Duffin to Jackie redacted: (Sun Oct 07 21:44:39 EDT 2012) Well then that's going to be a bit of a problem.

# Exhibit E



### about u

12 messages

Haven Monahan <a href="mailto:haven.monahan@yahoo.com">haven.monahan@yahoo.com</a> Reply-To: Haven Monahan <a href="mailto:haven.monahan@yahoo.com">haven.monahan@yahoo.com</a> To: redacted Wed, Oct 3, 2012 at 8:33 PM

you should read this. iv never read anything nicer in my life.

Well yeah...Ryan is fine. Ryan's great, actually. I mean he's smart. He's attractive. He's funny. He's a scaredy cat. If you creep up behind him, he'll jump right out of his skin. It's pretty amusing. He's honest. He always calls them just like he sees them. You can constantly count on getting the truth from Ryan, even if the truth hurts. He has the most incredible taste in music. He's like this walking, talking music library. And he understands how truly important music is. He's stubborn. He has this regimented way about him that can be so frustrating sometimes. And sometimes the things he says hurt. But he's a really, really good friend. And loyal to a fault. He's realistic about everything. And I'm a dreamer so I mean, it's good to have somebody like that in my life. He's one of my best friends here, you know? He's more than that ...he's everything

So, then there's Ryan. And Ryan... Ryan's incredible. I didn't fall for Ryan Duffin the first day I met him. Nor did I fall for him on the second day or the third day for that matter. But once I did fall for Ryan, you see, my world flipped upside down. Kathryn doesn't understand what I see in Ryan. I guess I don't understand what she doesn't see in him. He's gorgeous, but gorgeous is an understatement. More like you're startled every time you see him because you notice something new in a Where's Waldo sort of way. More like you can't stop writing third grade run on sentences because you can't even remotely begin to describe something, someone, so inherently amazing. More like you're afraid that if you stare at him too long, you'll prove your grandparents right that, yes, your face will get stuck that way...but you don't mind. You, like everyone else, may think I'm exaggerating, but then again, you probably don't know Ryan Duffin. Ryan has no idea what he does to me...he can make me feel more emotions in one second then I would normally feel in one year. He makes my head spin. And the truth is, I'm crazy about him. I mean, if I had the choice of hanging out with anyone in the entire world or just sitting in my dorm with him talking about music and watching a crappy TV show...I'd choose him everytime... without a single false step. I know he doesn't like me. If someone really wanted you, they'd actually put some time and effort into trying to get your attention. Ryan doesn't even like to be around me sometimes. And that really sucks. When you like someone more than he likes you, you'll do anything to switch the scales. The thing is, you can't. You want to tell him how you feel but you know it will end with "It's just not going to work out." How can I explain to him that I fell for him because of a million tiny things he never knew he was doing? I know I should just stop trying because he and I are never going to happen. He doesn't like me, I'm not his type, I'm not the type of person he could ever be with so I should just get over it. The problem is I can't shake these feelings I have for him, I try so damn hard, but they won't go away. I can't move on because the only thing I can find wrong with him, is that he can find so much wrong with me. Gabrielle said I shouldn't give up. She said she read this quote once that said," There's nothing more beautiful than the way the ocean refuses to stop kissing the shoreline, no matter how many times it's sent away." She claimed that's how Ryan and I are. I think she's wrong. I think he was right from the get-go. He'll never see me as anything more than some girl and it'll never amount to anything. He told Alex I'm not his type and I'm a waste of his time. The things he says hurt more

than you know but still... there's something about him that makes me come back for more. All I know is, the girl who gets to be with Ryan Duffin is the luckiest girl in the world. And if she doesn't know that, then she doesn't deserve him.

Ryan Duffin redacted

To: t.shapiro@washpost.com

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Ryan Duffin
University of Virginia '16
Computer Science, Cognitive Science

redacted redacted

Ryan Duffin redacted

To: "mstroud@ap.org" <mstroud@ap.org>

Fri, Dec 12, 2014 at 12:21 PM

Tue, Dec 9, 2014 at 6:59 PM

Begin forwarded message:

From: Haven Monahan <a href="mailto:haven.monahan@yahoo.com">haven.monahan@yahoo.com</a>

Date: October 3, 2012 at 8:33:34 PM EDT

To: redacted Subject: about u

Reply-To: Haven Monahan <a href="mailto:haven.monahan@yahoo.com">haven.monahan@yahoo.com</a>

you should read this. iv never read anything nicer in my life.

Well yeah... Ryan is fine. Ryan's great, actually. I mean he's smart. He's attractive. He's funny. He's a scaredy cat. If you creep up behind him, he'll jump right out of his skin. It's pretty amusing. He's honest. He always calls them just like he sees them. You can constantly count on getting the truth from Ryan, even if the truth hurts. He has the most incredible taste in music. He's like this walking, talking music library. And he understands how truly important music is. He's stubborn. He has this regimented way about him that can be so frustrating sometimes. And sometimes the things he says hurt. But he's a really, really good friend. And loyal to a fault. He's realistic about everything. And I'm a dreamer so I mean, it's good to have somebody like that in my life. He's one of my best friends here, you know? He's more than that ...he's everything

So, then there's Ryan. And Ryan... Ryan's incredible. I didn't fall for Ryan Duffin the first day I met him. Nor did I fall for him on the second day or the third day for that matter. But once I did fall for Ryan, you see, my world flipped upside down. Kathryn doesn't understand what I see in Ryan. I guess I don't understand what she doesn't see in him. He's gorgeous, but gorgeous is an understatement. More like you're startled every time you see him because you notice something new in a Where's Waldo sort of way. More like you can't stop writing third grade run on sentences because you can't even