

Nonprofit Media Coverage of the Arts in California: Challenges and Opportunities

2016



TABLE OF CONTENTS

01	FOREWORD
02	INTRODUCTION
06	KEY FINDINGS
14	RECOMMENDATIONS
17	APPENDICES
19	REFERENCES

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Author: Matthew Stromberg

Project Director: Caitlin Fitzwater

Editor: Josy Miller, Ph.D.

Graphic Designer: Wendy Moran

Special thanks to Juan Devis, Donn K. Harris, Nashormeh Lindo, Craig Watson, Shelly Gilbride, and Jaren Bonillo.

© 2016 California Arts Council

The mission of the California Arts Council, a state agency, is to advance California through the arts and creativity. The Council is committed to building public will and resources for the arts; fostering accessible arts initiatives that reflect contributions from all of California's diverse populations; serving as a thought leader and champion for the arts; and providing effective and relevant programs and services.

Members of the California Arts Council include: Chair Donn K. Harris, Vice Chair Nashormeh Lindo, Larry Baza, Phoebe Beasley, Christopher Coppola, Juan Devis, Kathleen Gallegos, Jaime Galli, Louise McGuinness, Steven Oliver, and Rosalind Wyman. Craig Watson is the Director of the California Arts Council.



Advancing California through the ARTS and CREATIVITY



www.arts.ca.gov

Foreword

Storytelling is essential to the human spirit. Stories move us, but beyond that they inspire action, deepen understanding, build bridges, and foster change. Storytelling, arts, and culture go hand in hand.

Public media is a key source through which storytelling is made available to all. With no cost for consumption, a radio can be all one needs to be transported and to stay informed. At its best, public media is embedded in communities, fostering the sharing of stories that are authentic to local cultures.

The California Arts Council, our state arts agency, recognizes these contributions as vital to California's cultural ecosystem. Perhaps that's why public media emerged as a grantmaking priority in 2013 when a one-time infusion of new state arts funding allowed our Council to "dream big" for the first time in a decade. Seeking to utilize one-time funding for programs that could show significant impact, the California Arts Council developed the Arts on the Air public media program.

This pilot grant program was a high priority for the Council. But key to a productive investment is ensuring that grants are effectively serving the field and meeting the actual needs of California's communities. After all, there's little point in investing in something if you're not getting it right. This is precisely why our Council prioritizes evaluation. Rigorous assessment takes many different forms, and in the case of our investment in public media, we wanted to discern, not assume, the true needs of the field. We wanted to deepen our knowledge of public media in California today as part of our assessment, and to foster new relationships along the way. That is why, after two years, the Council suspended the pilot program for a year to evaluate its effectiveness and impact.

In this case, our central evaluation activity was the convening of a California Arts and Public Media Summit in Oakland on June 23, 2016. The field participated in the summit robustly and enthusiastically. And the project yielded great results: networking opportunities, relationship building, this report – and perhaps most importantly, better informed programming decisions for the California Arts Council. The public process has always been central to our work, but it is increasingly critical as we develop new programs with growing state arts funding resources. Public input is in our DNA as government funders. It is a crucial vehicle for involving all Californians in the investment of public resources.

The following report contains a summary of activities and input from public media experts and thought leaders across our state and the nation. We express our deepest thanks to all who participated. While this report is indeed informing the work of our Council right now, it's not just for us. We hope the findings will be a helpful resource and conversation starter for all parties who are invested in the success of the public media field and its engagement with California's cultural communities. Perhaps it goes without saying, but times are changing – and staying in touch with those doing the work on the ground is paramount to any funder or stakeholder's success.

Our Council is embracing the evolution of our programs, welcoming change, and capitalizing on the realities of doing good work in a 21st-century California. We are all excited for what's to come, and are grateful to have continual opportunities to build our knowledge together with our state's vibrant and diverse communities.

Caitlin Fitzwater

Communications Director, California Arts Council
November 2016

Introduction

The California Arts Council (CAC) is a state agency that invests public funds by providing grants for nonprofit organizations, with the mission of advancing California through the arts and creativity. The CAC is guided by a set of principles, which includes the following:

- Weaving the arts into the fabric of daily life—promoting civic engagement, encouraging collective problem solving and building bridges across cultures.
- Fostering an arts ecosystem that reflects contributions from all of California’s diverse populations.
- Recognizing that arts and culture have a direct impact on the health, welfare, and economic well-being of all Californians and their communities.
- Increasing access to the arts for Californians who live or work in areas where the arts are scarce, nonexistent, or vulnerable.
- Being proactive and nimble in responding to changes in the arts and the larger business communities; including how technology has changed how Californians access, create, and distribute the arts.

In keeping with its mission and guiding values, the CAC’s programs are broad and diverse, including grants and initiatives devoted to arts education, arts in corrections, arts projects in underserved communities, community and economic development through the arts, and arts programming for veterans, among others.ⁱ

A Pilot Grant Program: Arts on the Air

Created in 2013 as the result of a one-time state arts funding increase, the Arts on the Air grant program was specifically designed to support nonprofit television and radio coverage of the arts in California. As per the program’s description, “The Arts on the Air program supports the creation, on-air broadcast, and promotion of original public media content designed to expose

Californians to impactful stories about the arts and their value.”ⁱⁱ The goals of the program were threefold:

- Demonstrate the impact and benefits of the arts through professional storytelling and reporting, utilizing multi-platform strategies.
- Reach and serve a large number of existing and new media outlet audiences; increase content distribution via partnerships; and engage with underserved communities, parents and teachers, and local businesses.
- Feature California artists and arts organizations, community arts activities, and arts education initiatives.

Over the program’s two-year run, seven grantees were chosen from a pool of twenty-nine applicants. Grantees received awards ranging from \$28,000 to \$75,000 with a total program investment of \$350,000 over two years.

ARTS ON THE AIR GRANTEES

2013 – 2014

KQED, San Francisco County
 PBS SoCal, Orange County
 Radio Bilingüe, Fresno County

2014 – 2015

KALW, San Francisco County
 KCET, Los Angeles County
 KQED, San Francisco County
 Radio Bilingüe, Fresno County

See Appendix B for detailed Arts on the Air grant project descriptions.

With a limited amount of funds, the Council prioritized providing larger grants to fewer organizations. Despite the successes in funding innovative programming with community arts engagement at the core, there were challenges to the program that resulted in it being suspended for the 2015-2016 grant cycle.

While there was a significant amount of money requested in this program, the structure of the program, its review criteria, and its overall reach came under question by both applicants and peer review panelists alike. The Council felt it was not effectively serving the field with the grant program as it was structured.

Another challenge centered on how to measure impact and audience. Assessing sheer numbers would reflect better on larger stations. However, smaller stations play an important role in their communities, even if their raw audience numbers are not as vast as those of their larger colleagues.

Additionally, the CAC learned from panelist and applicant feedback that a key program goal of statewide distribution of content was often not realistic given insufficient levels of funding and limitations of station partnerships. And shifts in the media landscape meant that “on air” and broadcast delivery may no longer be a sufficient measurement of reach.

The CAC suspended the program, acknowledging a need to be more nuanced and educated in understanding how best to serve the nonprofit media field. At a September 2015 public meeting, the Council voted to support the development of an advisory committee to evaluate the Arts on the Air program in order to develop recommendations for a more sustainable and robust inclusion of media arts in the CAC's activities.

*The California Arts Council
acknowledged a need
to be more nuanced and
educated in understanding
how best to serve the
nonprofit media field.*

Introduction *(continued)*

CALIFORNIA ARTS AND PUBLIC MEDIA SUMMIT PARTICIPANTS

SASHA ANAWALT

Director, Arts Journalism Program, USC Annenberg School of Journalism
(Los Angeles)

PEGGY BERRYHILL

President, Native Media Resource Center/KGUA
(Gualala)

ALEJANDRO COHEN

Director, dublab
(Los Angeles)

JUAN DEVIS

Sr. Vice President of Content Development and Production, KCET
(Los Angeles)

OSCAR GARZA

Senior Producer, KPCC
(Los Angeles)

MARIA HALL BROWN

Executive Producer for Arts and Culture Programming, PBS SoCal
(Costa Mesa)

MARINDA JOHNSON

Arts Producer, KVIE
(Sacramento)

JOSH KUN

Professor of Communications, USC Annenberg School of Journalism
(Los Angeles)

DEBRA LUCERO

Director, Shasta County Arts Council/SCACTV
(Redding)

DAVID MARKUS

Executive in Charge, Arts, KQED
(San Francisco)

MATT MARTIN

General Manager, KALW
(San Francisco)

HUGO MORALES

Founder and Executive Director, Radio Bilingüe
(Fresno)

ELLIN O'LEARY

Director, Youth Radio
(Oakland)

MATT SCHUSTER

Executive Director, TV Santa Barbara
(Santa Barbara)

JEFFREY TUCHMAN

Founder, Documania Films
(Los Angeles)

DONALD YOUNG

Program Director, Center for Asian American Media
(San Francisco)

The Summit

In response to these issues, a day-long summit was convened on June 23, 2016 at Youth Radio in Oakland, to discuss the current challenges and opportunities regarding nonprofit media coverage of the arts in California. Participants from a variety of organizations throughout the state were invited, in an attempt to gather a broad swath of opinions and experiences from stations large and small, urban and rural, and representative of all of California's distinct regions.

The summit participants discussed six key topics, each with specific guiding questions:

Types of Coverage and Audiences

- What are your priority platforms for arts coverage?
- Who are the audiences for arts coverage in your community?

Meeting a Need

- What role does nonprofit arts journalism play in your community?
- How does nonprofit arts coverage vary from commercial arts coverage in your community?

Beyond Metrics

- How do you measure success on new and traditional platforms?
- How do you measure value and impact?

California Landscape and Infrastructure

- What are the common challenges and opportunities of small vs. large markets?

Field Building and Partnerships

- Is there a desire and audience for sharing content across the state?
- What mentorship is available/needed in order for the field to grow and thrive?

Funding

- What are the funding needs of the field, locally and statewide?

Phone interviews were also conducted with John Decker, Director of Programming, KPBS, San Diego and Ed Subkis, General Manager, KHSU in Arcata. Funders' surveys were collected from California Humanities, The California Endowment, the National Endowment for the Arts, and The James Irvine Foundation. The proceedings of the summit and insights from these follow-up sources provide much of the content of this report.

The landscape of nonprofit media organizations with which this report is concerned covers primarily television and radio stations, and the associated nonprofit organizations that support and produce content for these outlets. These include 38 NPR member radio stations,ⁱⁱⁱ and 12 PBS member television stations in California,^{iv} as well as dozens of other non-affiliated public and community stations. There are also a number of California stations that are joint licensees with both radio and television components, as well as online-only media outlets and media service organizations.



KVIE, Sacramento

Key Findings

During the summit and associated interviews and surveys, a number of challenges and opportunities regarding nonprofit media coverage of the arts in California became apparent:

1. Nonprofit media fills a need not served by commercial media

Because they are not beholden to advertisers, nonprofit media stations are in a unique position to pursue stories that their audiences want to see or hear in greater depth than their commercial competitors.

“The measure of success is impact rather than profit, which to me is the greatest distinction between public and commercial media,” Jeffrey Tuchman of Documania Films stated.

“The bottom line in the difference between commercial and non-commercial arts coverage in the media is fairly stark. Our commercial competitors go for the big name stuff that the vast majority of their audience is going to recognize. In many cases, there are sponsorship tie-ins,” said John Decker of KPBS. “Nonprofit arts journalism is incredibly important because audiences want to learn. An artist who is making really interesting work that is not well known is just as important as the biggest rock star who comes into town. Our audience wants us to go there; they want us to be intellectually curious.”

“The measure of success is impact rather than profit, which to me is the greatest distinction between public and commercial media.”

KVIE’s Marinda Johnson echoed these sentiments: “We are finding stories that may have been lost otherwise.”

Nonprofit media also has a large role to play in non-English-speaking communities and communities of color. “In terms of Spanish-language or Latino media, there is essentially no news on commercial radio. Public radio plays a critical role,” said Hugo Morales of Radio Bilingüe.

“Spanish-language commercial media is corporate. There’s zero accountability. You see who’s paying for it: fast food, liquor companies. It’s extremely exploitative at a time when a large segment of our population is under stress. Public media, at least Radio Bilingüe, is also interactive. You can hear the voices of the community, what’s really going on.”

Peggy Berryhill of the Native Media Resource Center/ KGUA, had a similar opinion on the role of public media within Native American communities. “If you think about Native Americans, there’s only about five times a year that we’re in the paper. You don’t hear about native intelligentsia. Where are their voices, the people who have been in our communities for a long time? The role of nonprofits is to go beyond that and share authentic voices.”

“We are finding stories that may have been lost otherwise.”

Public media can also play a role in educating communities about the arts, connecting them to various art forms as they exist in the world. “For a small community, the types of stories that aren’t covered by commercial media are the stories of artists themselves,” said Matt Martin of KALW. “If the opera is putting on a show, we can help break down the barrier that someone may have to going to the opera and help them understand it.”

“Public media is a place for artists that commercial media is not in a position to be,” Ellin O’Leary of Youth Radio added.

2. Challenges and opportunities are not “one size fits all”

Despite the common purpose of public media stations, there are significant differences based on market size. Smaller stations, especially rural ones, will often cover a large geographic area, meaning they must make tough decisions about which local stories to cover. They have the challenge of keeping up-to-date with current technolo-

gies, as well as using the right form of technology to reach their audience, for whom the latest technologies may not be as popular or accessible. They are tasked with making art relevant in their communities. They also must find organizations to partner with that are appropriate for their needs. Finally, the metrics for measuring success are often defined by reach, but impact would be a much more meaningful consideration for these smaller communities.

Metrics for measuring success are often defined by reach, but impact would be a much more meaningful consideration for these smaller communities.

Stations operating in larger markets have the challenge of addressing a diverse and fractured audience. They also must contend with a lack of openness to new technologies from audiences and in some cases a lack of diversity in management. With an increase in platforms comes the challenge of figuring out how to measure engagement across them. Since they may have many funding sources, large market organizations must reconcile corporate sponsorship with their programmatic values and goals.

3. Audience data is not easily quantified

As the platforms for engaging with public media expand, it is important to examine the audience. Two new studies published by the NEA in August 2016—[The Annual Arts Basic Survey](#) and [State-Level Estimates of Arts Participation Patterns](#)—provide some much-needed data.

Regarding consumption of arts media, 61.4% of adults use TV, the radio, or the Internet to consume content, including watching, listening, or downloading music, performances, visual art, or programs about the arts. California measures slightly above the national average with 64.6% of the state's adult population engaging with arts content via these platforms.^Y



Radio Bilingüe, Fresno

However, it can be difficult for individual public media stations to measure the precise audience demographics when so many different platforms are being used. A further complication is the challenge of isolating the arts audience from within the general audience for public media.

Summit participants also remarked that, in some cases, the demand of audience data deliverables from funders can be frustrating and dilute a program's impact. Assembling statistics that are often inaccessible or unquantifiable takes valuable time and resources away from project goals.

With an increase in platforms comes the challenge of figuring out how to measure engagement across them.

"We've got 30,000 listeners, but the data can be a little suspect because we use Nielsen audio," said Ed Subkis of KHSU, which covers a wide area of Humboldt and Del Norte counties. "The sample in this area is so small, maybe 100 diaries. That's a frustration in a small market, not being able to get reliable audience data. We consistently trend as the highest listened-to station in the area, so we may not be confident in the numbers, but the positioning of the station is reliable over time."



It can be difficult to measure the precise audience demographics when so many different platforms are being used. A further complication is the challenge of isolating the arts audience from within the general audience for public media.

Key Findings (*continued*)

4. New platforms are both friend and foe

In addition to broadcasting via traditional television and radio signals, it is now crucial for public media stations to embrace digital platforms. Stations often stream their content online on numerous social media sites—as well as their own websites—and create podcasts that can be downloaded. Many stations also have written content that accompanies their video and audio programming. For instance, in 2015 KCET Artbound invited their audience to vote on two written stories to decide which one would be turned into a video piece for broadcast distribution.

One topic raised at the summit was that a number of stations are now creating content specifically for Facebook, as opposed to using the social media site for simply promoting existing content. “We’re making original Facebook series now,” said Juan Devis of KCET. “It’s driving conversation, but I don’t think it is driving people back to KCET.org. We’re having to figure out how to count the metrics within that space.”

“They don’t come to our dot org site because they don’t want to leave Facebook,” echoed KQED’s David Markus.

Even with content that is created for their core platforms, stations often create shorter versions tailored to social media sites. “Every segment we create, if it’s more than 3 minutes, you have to make a YouTube, or a Facebook version that’s shorter,” said Marinda Johnson of KVIE.

USC professor Josh Kun raised the problematic nature of creating content specifically for a commercial platform. “Is that a good thing or a deeply troubling thing?” he asked. “Facebook is a private company that makes its money off ad sales and clicks. What was a disruptive economy is now a new version of an old school media monopoly. How do you negotiate relying on a platform that really doesn’t need you?”

Summit participants also conveyed a serious concern about how to create content for social media platforms

when algorithms for serving content in viewers’ news feeds—thus determining who is actually seeing their content—are constantly changed by social media companies like Facebook, without warning. They likened it to a “guessing game,” with no foolproof formula for predicting when and how content might be viewed.

Although the way that people consume nonprofit media is changing, there are still some communities that do not have as much access to digital platforms. “Access to broadband is low for Spanish-speaking Latino audiences, less than 50%. That number is 80% for English-speaking Latinos,” said Hugo Morales. “This is a problem in both rural and urban markets. Radio is still a key platform.”

Ellin O’Leary stressed the importance of creating partnerships centered around technology, so that nonprofits can reclaim the platforms on which their content is consumed. “The public media movement was about the community owning the platforms. The only equality we can achieve, not that we can match a Google or Facebook, is about investment in technology. That’s where partnerships with technology are key. Otherwise we’re back on someone else’s game.”

5. Engagement is deepened via public events

In addition to their broadcast programs, public events can play a large role in the life of nonprofit media organizations. “We’ve done so many events that they in some way have eclipsed our radio programming,” remarked Alejandro Cohen of dublab, who puts on highly-curated musical and DJ events. “Events are the perfect way to bring your online presence to audiences. Being out there in the real world, physically creating events tied to your programming, is the one thing that will get people to visit your website. For us, it’s been a crucial part of promoting what we do.”

Some events are broadcast live, linking performance and programming. Events can provide an important source of funding, as well.

Key Findings (*continued*)

Juan Devis spoke about public projects that span months or even years, specifically a KCET program focused on the development of the Los Angeles River. “There was no real media component to it, but it was a way to engage with the community for two years. The culminating event was a series of workshops where we invited people to submit design ideas of what this riverfront could be like. It’s interesting to consider events as content.”

Another example was provided by KALW, which is presenting a multimedia project highlighting the perspectives of Bay Area artists, with an emphasis on underserved communities. Building on KALW’s arts reporting, the project—titled *Sights and Sounds*—introduces artists to new audiences, expanding on a weekly radio feature, through live events and grass-roots engagement in East Oakland and Richmond. Interestingly, this project is currently funded via the CAC through its creative placemaking arts grant program, Creative California Communities.

Public media can play a unique role in creating discourse around community challenges and the arts. In fostering community conversations that may or may not lead to future content, media organizations can play a larger role as community conveners.

6. Partnerships and collaborations are essential, but complicated

Another important element of nonprofit media programming is partnerships, both with other stations and with other kinds of nonprofit arts organizations. In a 2016 study titled [Investing in Cultural Partnership and Financial Sustainability](#), the James Irvine Foundation found that “Building relationships with community organizations was also an important strategy for improving cultural participation. When our Arts Regional Initiative grantees specifically worked with other nonprofit organizations that were able to increase their access to target communities, the results were impressive...Grantees with more community partnerships had the greatest change in cultural participation, particularly in diversifying audiences.”^{vi}

David Markus outlined what he feels makes for a worthwhile collaboration: “We look for partnerships where each side brings something unique, complements one another, as opposed to organizations that do the same thing that we do. It can be hard to get on the same page, but when it does work, it’s lovely.” He specifically referenced a partnership KQED has had with the San Francisco Museum of Modern Art to produce a series on artists in San Francisco.

Public media can play a unique role in creating discourse around community challenges and the arts.

Juan Devis summed up the advantages to be gained from successful partnerships. “It’s a win-win situation because they get the benefit of our audience and our broadcast, and we get the benefit of having access to content and to a project that otherwise we would have not been involved in.”

Whenever a news organization partners with someone else to produce content, however, the issue of journalistic ethics—and the barrier between advertisement and editorial—comes up. “One of the reasons we’ve stayed away from partnerships with cultural organizations is that I think there ought to be a line with these relationships,” said Oscar Garza of KPCC. “The question is ‘What is the relationship between your arts programming and the newsroom?’”

It is important that both sides of any partnership understand that the end goal is the production of richer content, not simply promotion. “The first thing I say, and I remind them every year, is that we are quite likely going to pan one of your productions this year,” said Markus referring to one of KQED’s cultural partnerships. “You need to just make that as clear as you possibly can. I think they learn that actually shines best on the partnership.”

Partnership between stations is another important form of collaboration. For example, PBS station affiliates are connected in sharing content via the Major Market Group Arts Initiative, a collection of arts-related content. “The advantages we have had with our Major Market Group Arts Initiative where we’re sharing content are twofold,” said Maria Hall Brown of PBS SoCal. “My stories get shared with 35 stations across the country, but I’m also able to see what everyone else is doing. It’s helping me grow as a producer.” However, this resource is exclusively available to participating PBS stations.

It is important that both sides of any partnership understand that the end goal is the production of richer content, not simply promotion.

Programs produced by larger stations are more likely to be shared across the state, whereas stories from smaller stations with a local interest are not as easily shared. “The greatest obstacle to airing something from LA or SF is that there’s so much going on here in San Diego, I’d rather focus on what’s going on locally,” said John Decker.

Another obstacle cited was simply a lack of time, and a limited ability to stay active in communicating with colleagues across the state about stories that might be suited for cross-market broadcast.



Key Findings *(continued)*

7. Funding is a challenge for the field – and for funders, too

All nonprofit media organizations, whether large or small, have the challenge of stretching resources and funding to cover their needs. They rely on a network of sources to cover their operating expenses and budgets for specific programs and projects. These include government grants, foundation giving, corporate sponsorship, and member donations. The Irvine, Knight, Hewlett, Getty, and Bloomberg foundations, the National Endowment for the Arts, the California Arts Council, and California Humanities are just a few of the major institutions contributing to public media coverage of the arts. Local organizations also support arts coverage; examples include the City of Oakland Cultural Funding Program and the Shasta County Arts Council.

Some of the funders who provided feedback cited the need for greater institutional giving to support the plethora of nonprofit media sources providing arts coverage. “Each grant round, we receive dozens of quality projects about artists and important cultural figures that we can’t support due to limited funds and in some cases a lack of critical and analytical perspective,” noted John Lightfoot, Senior Program Officer for Cal Humanities. “I would argue however that there is need for a funding source that can better accommodate these sort of projects—portraits of significant arts practitioners, literary figures, diverse cultural practices, etc.—since we are unable to meet the current demand.”

Additionally, funding sources for nonprofit media can sometimes be volatile as funder priorities shift. For example, a major statewide funder, The James Irvine Foundation, has a vital focus to expand economic and political opportunities for families and young adults who are working but struggling with poverty in California. Their Arts Engagement Initiative focuses on “promoting arts engagement that embraces and advances the diverse ways that we experience the arts, and that strengthens our ability to thrive together.”^{vii} In the past, funding for media projects typically fell under the Arts Engagement Initiative.

Over the past five years, The James Irvine Foundation supported a total of 15 to 20 arts-specific nonprofit media projects in California with grants spanning from \$30,000 to \$250,000 and an average award of approximately \$145,000. Due to the evolving focus of the foundation, the Arts Engagement Initiative is sun-setting in 2018 with its last set of grants awarded in the summer of 2016. However, an emerging Irvine initiative, called Informed Californians, is expected to use media as a platform for Californians of all walks of life to tell their stories.

There is a perception among some media organizations that funders can at times focus on supporting and developing work focused on traditional media forms or telling conservative stories, rather than fostering programs, partnerships and new models that meet the future. This was a cited concern with the CAC’s Arts on the Air Program.

“Funding arts-specific nonprofit media projects is more critical than ever.”

Jax Deluca, Director of Media Arts at the National Endowment for the Arts, believes that “funding arts-specific nonprofit media projects—and related public media—is more critical than ever.” She shared that “media arts is a growing field that often intersects across disciplines...Technology continues to evolve, which is expensive to obtain, contributing to digital divide.” Deluca also noted that it is equally important to recognize that not all artists and organizations desire to work in the newest technology. She acknowledged that simultaneously, as new media technology presents arts and cultural organizations with new opportunities to build and engage new audiences, organizations are challenged with adopting these methods due to lack of available and sufficient resources and support.



Recommendations

Nonprofit media coverage of the arts plays an important role in California's cultural life, serving a need that is not met by commercial media. With advances in technology and the proliferation of new platforms for media consumption, the field is confronting new challenges and opportunities. In light of this, funders, including the California Arts Council, must take innovative approaches to supporting the nonprofit organizations creating and broadcasting this essential content.

1. Develop new methods for measuring success

Audience size is no longer a viable metric to determine a station's success. Stations in smaller markets will have smaller raw audience numbers than larger stations; however, the content they produce may have a significant impact in their communities. Impact and depth of engagement must be considered when determining grant eligibility, and grant applicants should be given the opportunity to define impact as it relates to the needs of their local communities.

Additionally, the multiplicity of platforms creates challenges for measuring engagement, especially when content may not be consumed via traditional broadcast networks, or even on stations' websites, but on Facebook or YouTube. A much broader network of platforms should be considered. This also extends beyond broadcasts to view events as content, acknowledging the role that community events and performances can play in deepening audience engagement, outreach and promotion. As such, a rigid definition of reach should be avoided.

2. Vary the sizes of grants

One of the frustrations with the first two years of the CAC's Arts on the Air Program was the fact that only a small percentage of applicants could be supported. Providing a larger number of smaller grants would allow smaller organizations to participate and benefit from

a grant program, while continuing to support larger organizations as part of a network of funders investing in large-scale projects.

3. Foster partnerships and networking

Separate from grants, there are other ways that funders can contribute to nonprofit media coverage of the arts. Connecting different organizations for mutually beneficial partnerships is a way to support the field, without simply giving grants to individual stations. Supporting the development of initiatives that support content exchange, resource sharing, and consistent networking is a prime opportunity for funders.

4. Utilize the existing breadth of expertise and diversity in the field

Another avenue for support could be the facilitation of mentorships and other opportunities for direct organizational interchange. Such interchange might include pairing more mature organizations with those who could learn from their successes. It could also include pairing organizations with different constituent demographics,



PBS SoCal, Orange County

disparate geographies, and/or varying tactics for impact to exchange knowledge and resources. These exchanges could be significant for organizations both large and small, emerging and established, by utilizing the rich diversity present in California.

5. Embrace the role of innovation and new technology

Digital technology and social media are at the forefront of the programmatic and promotional priorities of non-profit media organizations. But these priorities, and the realities of doing business in a technology-driven society, do not exist for the media sector alone. Funders could benefit from being flexible and encouraging programmatic innovation as it relates to new technology. It is imperative for funders to continue to educate themselves on emerging technologies and innovation as their grant investments affect both the content and delivery of arts and culture programming in California.

6. Encourage participation of nonprofit media organizations in broader grant programs

The final recommendation is for funders to encourage awareness of and participation in other grant programs for which nonprofit media organizations are eligible and from which they could benefit. The Arts on the Air grant program was specifically created to fund nonprofit media coverage of the arts; however, there are numerous other resources and grant programs that are open to these types of organizations, opportunities of which they may not be aware. Promoting grant opportunities that fall under separate arts and media categories would allow nonprofit broadcast stations to take full advantage of the funding resources available to them.

INITIAL IMPLICATIONS FOR THE CALIFORNIA ARTS COUNCIL

Council members reviewed the preliminary results of this research at a public meeting on September 22, 2016 in San Luis Obispo. Based on recommendations from the Council's programs committee, the Council voted in support of reinstating an arts and public media program in the current fiscal year (2016-17). The Council has committed to investing \$200,000 in a revamped arts and public media program.

Guidelines for the program will be developed utilizing these findings and additional input from key advisors from the field. The Council's programs committee recommended several key changes be included in the development of the new program guidelines. They include deemphasizing "reach" as a key review criterion to allow small and mid-size stations to be more competitive; broadening applicant eligibility to include non-traditional media organizations (online platform organizations, public access stations, etc); and greater fostering of station partnerships and content exchange through the program structure. Guidelines will be reviewed and approved by Council at their December 2016 meeting, and the program will open in 2017.



Appendix A

Summit Participants and Report Contributors

SASHA ANAWALT

Director, Arts Journalism Program
USC Annenberg School of Journalism
(Los Angeles)

PEGGY BERRYHILL

President
Native Media Resource Center/KGUA
(Gualala)

JASON BLACKWELL

Program Associate
The James Irvine Foundation
(Los Angeles)

ALEJANDRO COHEN

Director
Dub Lab
(Los Angeles)

JOHN DECKER

Director of Programming
KPBS
(San Diego)

JAX DELUCA

Director of Media Arts
National Endowment for the Arts
(Washington, D.C.)

JUAN DEVIS

Sr. Vice President of Content
Development and Production
KCET
(Los Angeles)

OSCAR GARZA

Senior Producer
KPCC
(Los Angeles)

MARIA HALL BROWN

Executive Producer for Arts and
Culture Programming
PBS SoCal
(Costa Mesa)

MARINDA JOHNSON

Arts Producer
KVIE
(Sacramento)

JOSH KUN

Professor of Communications
USC Annenberg School of Journalism
(Los Angeles)

JOHN LIGHTFOOT

Professor of Communications
California Humanities
(Oakland)

DEBRA LUCERO

Director
Shasta County Arts Council/SCACTV
(Redding)

DAVID MARKUS

Executive in Charge, Arts
KQED
(San Francisco)

MATT MARTIN

General Manager
KALW
(San Francisco)

MAEVEN McGOVERN

Director of Arts Pathway and
Integrated Learning
Youth Radio
(Oakland)

HUGO MORALES

Founder and Executive Director
Radio Bilingüe
(Fresno)

ELLIN O'LEARY

Director
Youth Radio
(Oakland)

MATT SCHUSTER

Executive Director
TV Santa Barbara
(Santa Barbara)

BEATRIZ SOLIS

Program Director
The California Endowment
(Los Angeles)

ED SUBKIS

General Manager
KHSU
(Arcata)

JEFFREY TUCHMAN

Founder
Documania Films
(Los Angeles)

DONALD YOUNG

Program Director
Center for Asian American Media
(San Francisco)

Appendix B

California Arts Council Grantees: Arts on the Air Program

2013–2014

KQED, San Francisco County, \$75,000.

- KQED piloted a new multimedia thematic collection exploring the intersection of art and social issues in California through the eyes of artists from diverse backgrounds. Distribution of “SPARK: Arts and Social Issues” reached 28 California counties via television, radio, and interactive and educational platforms.

PBS SoCal, Orange County, \$75,000.

- PBS SoCal produced video stories about California artists and arts organizations, and their efforts to advance the state’s creative industries that are driving innovation, growth, and success in California’s economy. These videos were broadcast, posted online, shared in social media, circulated to teachers, distributed to arts partners, shared with California PBS stations through a new online arts exchange portal, and used in a PSA campaign.

Radio Bilingüe, Fresno County, \$50,000.

- Radio Bilingüe produced and broadcast eight short-form features and eight call-in interview/talk shows called “Raices – Los Maestros,” highlighting innovative Latino artists who are ensuring that younger generations know and experience art and what it can offer their lives and communities. All productions were broadcast in 23 California counties, streamed live, and archived for public use.

2014–2015

KALW, San Francisco County, \$40,000.

- KALW launched *Sights and Sounds* – a multi-platform project highlighting the perspectives and creations of Bay Area artists, with an emphasis on creative people rooted in underserved communities. *Sights and Sounds* built on KALW’s strengths in arts reporting, sound-rich audio and community event production. Through a weekly radio and web feature, and a live event in East Oakland, *Sights and Sounds* connected artists with new audiences and increased grassroots engagement with the arts.

KCET, Los Angeles County, \$42,500.

- KCET Artbound designed a multi-platform program to identify, explore and highlight arts organizations that are working to build engagement and/or develop new programmatic and organizational models that effectively increase engagement and participation, particularly in underserved communities. Artbound further encouraged arts engagement using its multi-platform methodologies to expand the visibility of projects, thereby increasing and broadening audiences, participants, and supporters.

KQED, San Francisco County, \$40,000.

- KQED launched *Art in the Open*, a new multimedia collection about public art and creativity in California. Comprised of broadcast and digital assets distributed widely across radio, television, interactive and education platforms in the Bay Area and to 28 counties statewide, *Art in the Open* explored street art, public art, environmental art and protest art—art that while public and accessible to nearly all, may or may not be commissioned, curated, sponsored, or otherwise officially sanctioned.

Radio Bilingüe, Fresno County, \$28,000.

- Radio Bilingüe produced and broadcast “Indigenous Mexicans of California—Fostering Cultural Traditions in the Community and On Air,” a radio series centered around the folk festivals of distinct indigenous migrant groups throughout the state. Six short-form features in Spanish and 8 live one-hour programs (6 Spanish and Spanish-Mixteco) engaged RB’s 250,000 weekly listeners in California, including the featured artists’ communities and RB’s broader diverse Latino audience.

