

Fare Evasion Reduction Initiatives

PROOF OF PAYMENT

**OPERATIONS, SAFETY & WORKFORCE
COMMITTEE**

SEPTEMBER 14, 2017

Key Points from April 27, 2017 Board Presentation

- **Estimated Revenue Annual Loss: \$15M - \$25M**
 - At least \$6M loss supported by data
 - Another \$9M - \$19M likely
- **Fare Evasion Control Strategy**
 - Station Hardening
 - Enforcement
 - Fare Systems
 - Technology

FY18 Fare Evasion Prevention Resources

- **Station Hardening (capital budget)**
 - \$200K barriers
 - \$50K signage
 - \$200K elevator solution
 - 9 FTE's (Comm, Buildings, Engineering)
- **Enforcement (operating budget)**
 - 6 Community Service Officers (CSO)
 - \$50K hand-held fare inspection devices
- **Technology/Cameras - \$200K**
- **Total Investment - \$2.65M**

Completed or In-Progress

- Station Hardening
 - 60" barriers and swing gate controls
 - ✦ Fremont
 - ✦ Pittsburg
 - ✦ Berkeley (south)
 - Enveloping elevators into paid area
 - ✦ South Hayward
 - ✦ Berkeley

Completed or In-Progress

- Barriers, swing gates and elevators in paid area
 - ✦ Powell
 - ✦ 19th St.
 - ✦ El Cerrito del Norte
- Next candidates
 - ✦ Richmond
 - ✦ Balboa Park
 - ✦ Coliseum
 - ✦ MacArthur
- SF swing gate closure discussion w/SFFD on-going

Completed or In-Progress

- Technology
 - Video analytics software, Embarcadero pilot, counting swing gate abuse
 - ✦ Counting fare gate abuse
 - ✦ Platform crowding
 - ✦ Facility intrusion detection

Enforcement: What is Proof of Payment?

- **Proof of Payment** means that passengers must present valid fare media, anywhere in the paid area of the system, upon request by authorized transit personnel.

Enforcement: Why Proof of Payment?

- **BART opened in 1972 as a “barrier” system**
 - BART “barriers” are physically easy to circumvent
 - ✦ Low railings
 - ✦ Fare gates – over, under or through
 - ✦ Swing gates – provide a clear path
 - Enforcement can only occur at “barrier” location
 - ✦ BPD must directly observe OR
 - ✦ Employee or rider must:
 - Witness and be willing to place offender under Citizens Arrest; and
 - BPD must be nearby; and
 - Offender must be contacted
- **In short, without proof of payment, fare evaders are only concerned at the brief moments when they evade into or out of the system**

Enforcement: Who Else Uses Proof of Payment?

In California:

- SMART
- San Francisco MTA
- Santa Clara VTA
- Sacramento RTA
- Los Angeles MTA
- ACE
- Caltrain
- San Diego Trolley

Enforcement: Who Else Uses Proof of Payment?

Other States:

- Dallas Area Rapid Transit
- Baltimore Light Rail
- Buffalo Metro Rail
- Charlotte LYNX
- Cleveland Red Line Heavy Rail
- St. Louis Metro Link
- Seattle Sounder Commuter Rail and Central Link Light Rail
- Portland Tri-Met
- NJ Transit Hudson Bergen & River Lines
- Houston Metro Rail
- Denver RTD Rail

Proof of Payment Ordinance for BART

- Extensive public outreach before implementation on 1/1/18.
- Under the BART ordinance, Proof of Payment citations will be a non-criminal.
- Passengers inside the paid area, who are unable to provide proof of payment, will be issued a civil citation.
 - Warnings are an option available to CSO's/Officers.
- Proof of Payment citations will be processed through our existing civil process for parking citations; this includes an appeal process.
- Administrative penalty for Proof of Payment violation: \$120 for adults, \$60 for minors.
 - SB 614 (Hertzberg – effective January 1, 2018) requires that minors and persons who provide satisfactory evidence of an inability to pay must be given an option of community service in lieu of the Civil Fine.

Proof of Payment Inspections

- Inspection protocol will be fair, non-biased and a combination of data driven and rotational.
- Police Officers and/or Community Service Officers will perform inspections within the paid area of the stations and on board trains where entire cars can feasibly be checked.
- Officers will activate mobile video recorders and continuously record proof of payment inspection operations.
- Officers will progress from one person to the next closest person, not skipping any persons in between.

Enforcement Audits

- Quarterly report on citations
- To ensure that enforcement activities are fair and unbiased, body camera videos of BPD Officers and CSOs engaged in proof of payment activities will be randomly selected for analysis and reporting on a monthly basis.
- Above will be available for the Office of the Independent Police Auditor.