Chapter 23

Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials: Kindergarten Through Grade Eight

This document provides criteria for evaluating the alignment of instructional materials with the History–Social Science Content Standards for California Public Schools (2000) and the History–Social Science Framework for California Public Schools. The content standards were adopted by the California State Board of Education in October 1998. They describe what students should know and be able to do at each grade level. The framework incorporates the standards and includes instructional guidelines for teachers and administrators. The framework, together with the standards, defines the essential skills and knowledge in history–social science that will enable all California students to enjoy a world-class education.

The instructional materials must provide guidance for the teacher to facilitate student engagement with the content standards, framework, and curriculum at each grade level and to teach students all the analysis skills required for the grade spans. Students should be able to demonstrate reasoning, reflection, and research skills. These skills are to be learned through, and applied to, the content standards and are to be assessed only in conjunction with the content standards.
Special attention should also be paid to the appendixes in the framework, which address important overarching issues.

To be adopted, materials must first meet in full Category 1, History–Social Science Content/Alignment with Standards. Materials will be evaluated holistically in the other categories of Program Organization, Assessment, Universal Access, and Instructional Planning and Support. This means that while a program may not meet every criterion listed in those categories, they must on balance meet the goals of each category to be eligible for state adoption.

Programs that do not meet Category 1 in full and do not meet each one of the other four categories as judged holistically will not be adopted. These criteria may also be used by publishers and local educational agencies as a guide for developing and selecting instructional materials for grades nine through twelve.

To assist the State Board in the evaluation of instructional materials, publishers will use a standards map template and evaluation criteria maps supplied by the California Department of Education to demonstrate a program’s alignment with the standards.

The criteria are organized into five categories:

1. **History–Social Science Content/Alignment with Standards**: The content as specified in the *Education Code*, the *History–Social Science Content Standards*, and the *History–Social Science Framework*...
442. **Program Organization**: The sequence and organization of the history–social science program

463. **Assessment**: The strategies presented in the instructional materials for measuring what students know and are able to do

484. **Universal Access**: Instructional materials that are understandable to all students, including students eligible for special education, English learners, and students whose achievement is either below or above that typical of the class or grade level

525. **Instructional Planning and Support**: The instructional planning and support information and materials, typically including a separate edition specially designed for use by teachers in implementing the *History–Social Science Content Standards* and *History–Social Science Framework*

History–social science instructional materials must support teaching aligned with the standards and framework. Materials that are contrary to or inconsistent with the standards, framework, and criteria are not allowed. Extraneous materials should be minimal and clearly purposeful. Any gross inaccuracies or deliberate falsifications revealed during the review process will result in disqualification, and any found during the adoption cycle will be subject to removal of the program from the list of state-adopted textbooks. Gross inaccuracies and deliberate falsifications are defined as those requiring changes in content.

**Category 1: History–Social Science Content/Alignment with Standards**
Instructional materials, as defined in *Education Code* Section 60010(h),
support instruction designed to ensure that students master all the *History–Social Science Content Standards* for the intended grade level. Analysis skills of the pertinent grade span must be covered at each grade level. This instruction must be included in the student edition of the instructional materials; while there can be direction in materials for the teacher to support instruction in the standards, this cannot be in lieu of content in the student edition. The standards themselves must be included in their entirety in the student materials, either at point of instruction or collected together at another location.

Instructional materials reflect and incorporate the content of the *History–Social Science Framework*.

Instructional materials shall use proper grammar and spelling (*Education Code* Section 60045).

Instructional materials present accurate, detailed content and a variety of perspectives and encourage student inquiry.

History is presented as a story well told, with continuity and narrative coherence (a beginning, a middle, and an end), and based on the best recent scholarship. Without sacrificing historical accuracy, the narrative is rich with the forceful personalities, controversies, and issues of the time. Primary sources, such as letters, diaries, documents, and photographs, are incorporated into the narrative to present an accurate and vivid picture of the times in order to enrich student inquiry.
6. Materials include sufficient use of primary sources appropriate to the age level of students so that students understand from the words of the authors the way people saw themselves, their work, their ideas and values, their assumptions, their fears and dreams, and their interpretation of their own times. These sources are to be integral to the program and are carefully selected to exemplify the topic. They serve as a voice from the past, conveying an accurate and thorough sense of the period. When only an excerpt of a source is included in the materials, the students and teachers are referred to the entire primary source. The materials present different perspectives of participants, both ordinary and extraordinary people, in world and U.S. history, and further student inquiry.

7. Materials include the study of issues and historical and social science debates. Students are presented with different perspectives and come to understand the importance of reasoned debate and reliable evidence, recognizing that people in a democratic society have the right to disagree.

8. Throughout the instructional resources, the importance of the variables of time and place—history and geography—is stressed repeatedly. In examining the past and present, the instructional resources consistently help students recognize that events and changes occur in a specific time and place. Instructional resources also consistently help students judge the significance of the relative location of place.

9. The history–social science curriculum is enriched with various genres of fiction and nonfiction literature of and about the historical period. Forms of literature such as diaries, essays, biographies, autobiographies, myths, legends, historical
tales, oral literature, poetry, and religious literature richly describe the issues or the events studied as well as the life of the people, including both work and leisure activities. The literary selections are broadly representative of varied cultures, ethnic groups, men, women, and children and, where appropriate, provide meaningful connections to the content standards in English–language arts, mathematics, science, and visual and performing arts.

10. Materials on religious subject matter remain neutral; do not advocate one religion over another; do not include simulation or role playing of religious ceremonies or beliefs; do not include derogatory language about a religion or use examples from sacred texts or other religious literature that are derogatory, accusatory, or instill prejudice against other religions or those who believe in other religions. Religious matters, both belief and nonbelief, must be treated respectfully and be explained as protected by the U.S. Constitution. Instructional materials, where appropriate and called for in the standards, include examples of religious and secular thinkers in history. When the standards call for explanation of belief systems, they are presented in historical context. Events and figures detailed in religious texts are presented as beliefs held by members of that religion, are clearly identified as such, and should not be presented as fact unless there is independent historical evidence justifying that presentation. All materials must be in accordance with the guidance provided in the updated History–Social Science Framework, Appendix C, “Religion and the Teaching of History–Social Science,” and Education Code sections 51500, 51501, 51511, 51513.
11. Numerous examples are presented of women and men from different demographic groups who used their learning and intelligence to make important contributions to democratic practices and society and to science and technology. Materials emphasize the importance of education in a democratic society.

12. For grades six through eight, the breadth and depth of world history to be covered are described in the *History–Social Science Framework* course descriptions. In addition to the content called for at grade six, instructional materials shall include the grade seven content standards on the Roman Empire (standard 7.1 and its sequence) and Mayan civilization (standard 7.7 and the applicable Mayan aspects of the sequence). In addition to the content called for at grade eight, materials shall include the grade seven content standards on the Age of Exploration, the Enlightenment, and the Age of Reason (standard 7.11 and its sequence).

13. Student writing assignments are aligned with the grade-level expectations in the *California Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts* (adopted by the State Board of Education in 2013), including both the Writing Standards for K–5 and 6–12 (as applicable), and the Writing Standards for Literacy in History/Social Studies 6–12, the *California English Language Development Standards*, and the *English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework*.

14. Instructional materials use biography to portray the experiences of men, women, children, and youths. Materials shall include the roles and contributions of people from different demographic groups: Native Americans, African Americans, and others.
1. Instructional materials, where appropriate, examine humanity’s place in ecological systems and the necessity for the protection of the environment (Education Code Section 60041). Materials include instructional content based upon the Environmental Principles and Concepts developed by the California Environmental Protection Agency and adopted by the State Board of Education (Public Resources Code Section 71301) where appropriate and aligned to the history–social science content standards. (See Appendix F)

2. Instructional materials for grades five and eight shall include a discussion of the Great Irish Famine of 1845–1850 and the effect of the famine on American history (Education Code Section 51226.3[e]).

3. Emphasis is placed on civic values, democratic principles, and democratic institutions, including frequent opportunities for discussion of the fundamental principles embodied in the U.S. Constitution and the Bill of Rights. When appropriate to the comprehension of pupils, instructional materials shall include a copy of the U.S. Constitution and the Declaration of Independence (Education Code Section 60043).

4. Materials emphasize America’s multi-ethnic heritage and its contribution to this country’s development while explaining how American civic values provide
students with a foundation for understanding their rights and responsibilities in
this pluralistic society (Education Code sections 51226.5 and 60200.6).

19. Materials on American life and history give significant attention to the
principles of morality, truth, justice, and patriotism and to a comprehension of the
rights, duties, and dignity of American citizenship, inspiring an understanding of
and a commitment to American ideals. Examples of memorable addresses by
historical figures are presented in their historical context, including the effect of
those addresses on people then and now (Education Code sections 52720 and
60200.5).

20. Materials for studying the life and contributions of Martin Luther King, Jr., and
the civil rights movement shall be included at each grade level, with suggestions
for supporting the respective holidays in honor of those men and the
accompanying activities (Education Code Section 60200.6). In those grade levels
when the life of King is not directly connected to the historical narrative (e.g.,
sixth grade), it is acceptable to include this content in a distinct product that is
included as part of the core program for that grade level. However, these
materials must be provided to all students using the program.

21. Where appropriate to the topics being covered, materials highlight the life and
contributions of Cesar Chavez, the history of the farm labor movement in the
United States, and the role of immigrants, including Filipino Americans, in that
movement (Education Code Section 51008).

Category 2: Program Organization
Sequential organization of the material provides structure concerning what students should learn each year and allows teachers to convey the history–social science content efficiently and effectively.

The instructional materials provide instructional content for 180 days of instruction for at least one daily class period.

The content is well organized and presented in a manner consistent with providing all students an opportunity to achieve the essential knowledge and skills described in the standards and framework. The academic language (i.e., vocabulary) specific to the content is presented in a manner that provides explicit instructional opportunities for teachers and appropriate practice for all students.

A detailed, expository narrative approach providing for in-depth study is the predominant writing mode and focuses on people and their ideas, thoughts, actions, conflicts, struggles, and achievements.

Explanations are provided so that students clearly understand the likely causes of the events, the reasons the people and events are important, why things turned out as they did, and the connections of those results to events that followed.

The narrative unifies and interrelates the many facts, explanations, visual aids, maps, and literary selections included in the topic or unit. Those components clearly contribute directly to students’ deeper understanding and retention of the events.
7. The relevant grade-level standards shall be explicitly stated in both the teacher and student editions. Topical or thematic headings reflect the framework and standards and clearly indicate the content that follows.

8. Each topic builds clearly on the preceding one(s) in a systematic manner.

9. Topics selected for in-depth study are enriched with a variety of materials and content-appropriate activities and reflect the framework's course descriptions.

10. Each unit presents strategies for universal access, including ways in which to improve the vocabulary and reading and language skills of English learners in the context of history–social science.

11. The materials support the development of academic vocabulary for all students and provide instruction and opportunities for student practice and application in key vocabulary.

12. Materials explain how history–social science instruction may be improved by the effective use of library media centers and information literacy skills.

13. The tables of contents, indexes, glossaries, content summaries, and assessment guides are designed to help teachers, parents/guardians, and students.

Category 3: Assessment

Assessments in the instructional materials should reflect the goals of Chapter 19 of the History–Social Science Framework. Assessment tools measure what
students know and are able to do, including their analysis skills, as defined by the standards.

Entry-level assessments are provided to help teachers gauge student readiness for embarking upon the instructional program. Information is provided to teachers to help them utilize the results of those assessments to guide instruction and to determine modifications for specific students or groups of students.

Formative assessment tools that publishers include as a part of their instructional materials should provide evidence of students' progress toward mastering the content called for in the standards and framework and should yield information teachers can use in planning and modifying instruction to help all students meet or exceed the standards.

Summative assessments enable teachers to determine when students have achieved mastery of the content and skills outlined in the standards. Summative assessments enable teachers to determine if students can apply knowledge and/or skills learned during a unit to new exercises.

Materials provide frequent assessments at strategic points of instruction by such means as pretests, unit tests, chapter tests, and summative tests.

Materials assess students' progress toward meeting the instructional goals of history–social science through expository writing. Student writing assessments are aligned with the grade-level expectations in the California Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts (adopted by the State Board of Education in 2013), including both the Writing Standards for K–5 and 6–12 (as
applicable), and the Writing Standards for Literacy in History/Social Studies 6–
12, the California English Language Development Standards, and the English
Language Arts/English Language Development Framework.

7. Materials include analytical rubrics that are content-specific and provide an
explanation of the use of the rubrics by teachers and students to evaluate and
improve skills in writing, analysis, and the use of evidence.

8. Assessment tools include multiple measures of student performance, such as
selected response, short answer, essay, oral presentation, debates and
speeches, service learning projects, research projects, certificates, and
performance-based tasks.

9. Assessment tools measure how students are able to use library media centers
and information literacy skills when studying history–social science topics.

Category 4: Universal Access

1. The instructional materials should reflect the goals of access and equity
outlined in Chapter 20 of the History–Social Science Framework.

2. Instructional materials present comprehensive guidance for teachers in
providing effective, efficient instruction for all students. Instructional materials
should provide access to the standards and framework-based curriculum for all
students, including those with special needs: English learners, advanced
learners, students below grade level in reading and writing skills, and special
education students in general education classrooms. Materials should include
suggestions for teachers on how to differentiate instruction to meet the needs of students in those groups.

3. Materials for kindergarten through grade three focus on the content called for in the *History–Social Science Content Standards*, including the Historical and Social Sciences Analysis Skills, and the *History–Social Science Framework* while complementing the goals of the *California Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts* and the *English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework for California Public Schools* (adopted in 2014).

4. Materials for grades four through eight provide suggestions to further instruction in history–social science while assisting students whose reading and writing skills are below grade level.

5. Instructional materials are designed to help meet the needs of students whose reading, writing, listening, and speaking skills fall up to two grade levels below the level prescribed in the English–language arts content standards and to assist in accelerating students’ skills to grade level.

6. Materials must address the needs of students who are at or above grade level. Although materials are adaptable to each student’s point of entry, such differentiated instruction is focused on the history–social science content standards.

7. All suggestions and procedures for meeting the instructional needs of all students are ready to use with minimum modifications.

8. Materials provide suggestions for enriching the program or assignments for advanced learners by:
• Studying a topic, person, place, or event in more depth
• Conducting a more complex analysis of a topic, person, place, or event
• Reading and researching related topics independently
• Emphasizing the rigor and depth of the analysis skills to provide a challenge for all students

Materials provide suggestions to help teach English learners the History–Social Science Content Standards while reinforcing instruction based on the California Common Core State Standards for English–Language Arts and the California English Language Development Standards—notably to read, write, comprehend, and speak at academically proficient levels. Materials provide support for Integrated ELD instruction as described in the English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework.

Materials incorporate the principles of Universal Design for Learning (UDL) as described in the framework chapter on Access and Equity.

Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support

Teacher-support materials are built into the instructional materials and contain suggestions and illustrative examples of how teachers can implement the instructional program.

The teacher and student materials present ways for all students to learn the content and analysis skills called for in the standards and the framework.
3393. Directions are explicit regarding how the analysis skills are to be taught and assessed in the context of the content standards.

3414. Instructional materials provide a road map for teachers to follow when they are planning instruction while leaving them the flexibility and freedom to organize units around student inquiry.

3445. Teacher and student materials are coordinated so that teachers can easily locate places where students are working (e.g., have correlating page numbers in print materials or corresponding references in electronic materials).

3476. Instructional materials include a teacher-planning guide describing the relationships between the components of the program and how to use all the components to meet all the standards.

3507. Publishers provide teachers with easily accessible and workable instructional examples and students with practice opportunities as they develop their understanding of the content and analysis skills.

3538. Blackline masters are accessible in print and in digitized formats and are easily reproduced. Black areas shall be minimal to require less toner when printing or photocopying.

3569. The teacher materials describe what to teach, how to teach, and when to teach.

35810. Terms from the standards and framework are used appropriately and accurately in the instructions.
All assessment tools, instructional tools, and informational technology resources include technical support and suggestions for appropriate use of technology.

Electronic learning resources, when included, support instruction and connect explicitly to the standards.

The teacher resource materials provide background information about important events, people, places, and ideas appearing in the standards and framework.

Instructional practices recommended in the materials are based on the content in the standards and framework and on current and confirmed research.

Materials discuss and address common misconceptions held by students.

Homework extends and reinforces classroom instruction and provides additional practice of skills that have been taught.

Materials include suggestions on how to explain students' progress toward attaining the standards.

Materials include suggestions for parents on how to support student achievement.

The format clearly distinguishes instructions for teachers from those for students.

Answer keys are provided for all workbooks and other related student activities.
21. Publishers provide charts of the time requirements and cost of staff development services available for preparing teachers to implement fully the program.

22. Materials provide teachers with instructions on how outside resources (e.g., guest speakers, museum visits, and electronic field trips) are to be incorporated into a standards-based lesson.

23. Materials provide guidance on the effective use of library media centers to improve instruction and on the materials in library media centers that would best complement the history–social science content standards and framework.

Selected References


History–Social Science Framework
Adopted by the State Board of Education on July 14, 2016

403History–Social Science Content Standards for California Public Schools,

404 Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve. Sacramento: California Department of


406History–Social Science Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten

407 Through Grade Twelve. Sacramento: California Department of Education,

408 2015.

409Mathematics Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through


411Next Generation Science Standards for California Public Schools, Kindergarten

412 Through Grade Twelve. Sacramento: California Department of Education,

413 2014.

414Science Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade


416Visual and Performing Arts Content Standards for California Public Schools,

417 Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve. Sacramento: California Department


California Department of Education
July 2016