

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLORADO**

**Civil Action No. 16-cv-00834-RBJ**

Christopher Mechaca, individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of Irma  
Menchaca,

plaintiff,

v.

DaVita, Inc.

defendant

consolidated with,

**Civil Action No. 16-cv-00834-RBJ**

Sherri Saldana, individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of Gary Gene Saldana,

plaintiff,

v.

DaVita, Inc.,

defendant.

consolidated with,

**Civil Action No. 16-cv-02586-RBJ**

Frankquin Hardin, individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of Deborah Hardin,

plaintiff,

v.

DaVita, Inc.,

defendant.

**VERDICT**

We, the jury, unanimously answer the questions of the Court as follows:

1. Did one or more plaintiffs prove by a preponderance of the evidence the negligence claim according to the elements listed in Instruction No. 8 as to

- a. Plaintiff Menchaca:  yes \_\_\_\_\_ no
- b. Plaintiff Saldana:  yes \_\_\_\_\_ no
- c. Plaintiff Hardin:  yes \_\_\_\_\_ no

2. Did one or more plaintiffs prove by the applicable standard of proof the fraud by concealment claim according to the elements listed in Instruction No. 10 as to

- a. Plaintiff Menchaca:  yes \_\_\_\_\_ no
- b. Plaintiff Saldana:  yes \_\_\_\_\_ no
- c. Plaintiff Hardin:  yes \_\_\_\_\_ no

If you answered "no" to all these questions, then your verdict is for the defendant, and you should proceed to date and sign the Verdict without answering additional questions. But if you answered "yes" to any of these questions, please proceed as appropriate to questions 3 through 5.

3. What amount of compensatory damages, if any, as described in Instruction No. 12 do you award to

- a. Plaintiff Menchaca: \$ 2,000,000
- b. Plaintiff Saldana: \$ 1,500,000
- c. Plaintiff Hardin: \$ 5,000,000

4. What amount of punitive damages, if any, as described in Instruction No. 13, do you award to

- a. Plaintiff Menchaca: \$ 125,000,000
- b. Plaintiff Saldana: \$ 125,000,000
- c. Plaintiff Hardin: \$ 125,000,000

Dated June 27, 2018

JUROR NAMES REDACTED